Mothers Reporting:
The Mother-Child Education Program in Five Countries

Sevda Bekman & Aylin Atmaca Koçak
Mothers Reporting:
The Mother-Child Education Program
in Five Countries
Sevda Bekman & Aylin Atmaca Koçak

Designed by
Stil Tasarım ve Reklam Hizmetleri

First Edition: June, 2010
ISBN: 978-975-8085-20-0

Printed by: Pınarbaşı Matbaacılık
Phone: (0212) 544 58 77

MOTHER - CHILD EDUCATION FOUNDATION
PUBLICATIONS
Büyükdere Cad. Stad Han No:85 Kat:2
Mecidiyeköy 34387 İstanbul - TURKEY
Phone: (0212) 213 42 20  Fax: (0212) 213 36 60
E-mail: acev@acev.org  www.acev.org
7  PREFACE

11  HOW DID THE IDEA FOR THIS STUDY ORIGINATE AND DEVELOP?

19  INTRODUCTION

Theoretical and Empirical Rationale for the Mother-Child Education Program

The Mother-Child Education Program

- Setting for the Mother-Child Education Program in Turkey
- Historical Background of the Mother-Child Education Program
  - Before the Establishment of the Mother-Child Education Foundation
  - After the Establishment of the Mother-Child Education Foundation
- The Content of the Mother-Child Education Program
  - The Cognitive Education Program
  - The Mother Support Program
  - The Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program
- Implementation of the Mother-Child Education Program
- Evaluation Studies of the Mother-Child Education Program
- Dissemination Structure of the Mother-Child Education Program in Turkey
- International Implementations of the Mother-Child Education Program
The Aim of the Research

Design
- Sample
- Description of the Sample
- Instrument
- Procedure
- Analysis

Results
- Who Participates in the Mother-Child Education Program?
  - Reasons for Participation
  - Reactions Received Before Starting the Program
    - Negative Reactions Received from the People around Her
    - Negative Reactions Received from the Husband
    - Mother’s Ideas about the Negative Reactions She Received
    - Positive Reactions Received from the People around Her
    - Positive Reactions Received from the Husband
    - Mother’s Ideas about the Positive Reactions She Received
- Effects
  - Direct Effects
    - Changes in the Child
      - Change in the Cognitive Development
      - Change in the Socio-Emotional Development
      - Change in the Physical Development
      - The Mother’s Contribution to the Change in the Child
    - Changes in the Mother
      - Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward the Child
      - Change in the Mother-Child Relationship
      - How Did the Change in the Mother Lead to a Change in the Mother-Child Relationship?
      - Change in the Mother’s Self-Perception and Perspective on Different Aspects of Life
      - Change in the Mother’s own Behavior
      - How Did the Mother’s Experiences during Implementation Contribute to the Change
  - Indirect Effects
    - Changes in the Mother
      - Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward Her Husband
      - Change in the Mother’s Relationship with Her Husband
      - Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward Other Children in the Family
      - Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward the People around Her
- Changes in the Father
  - Change in the Father's Behavior toward the Target Child
  - Change in the Father's Relationship with the Target Child
  - Change in the Father's Behavior toward Other Children
  - Change in the Father's Behavior toward His Wife (Mother)
  - Mother's Role in the Indirect Effects Observed in Fathers

- Why and How Does the Program Create Change?
  - How Does the Group Process Contribute to Change?
  - How Does the Teacher Contribute to Change?
  - How Does the Implementation of the Cognitive Education Program Contribute to Change?
  - How Do the Content and the Implementations Contribute to Change?
  - How Does the Comparison of Practices in Child Upbringing Contribute to Change?
  - How Do the Feedback and Support Received during the Program Contribute to Change?
    - Positive Feedback Received from the Spouse
    - Positive Feedback Received from People around Her
    - Positive Feedback Received from the Child
    - Mother's Opinions about the Positive Feedback Received
    - Negative Feedback Received from the Spouse
    - Negative Feedback Received from the People around Her
    - Negative Feedback Received from the Child
    - Mother's Opinions about the Negative Feedback Received
    - The Support the Mother Received
      - The Support from the People around Her
      - The Support from the Spouse

- International Implementations of the Program

Discussion

158 REFERENCES

168 APPENDIX

Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MOCEF</td>
<td>Mother-Child Education Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEP</td>
<td>Cognitive Education Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECE</td>
<td>Early Childhood Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sw</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bah</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOCEP</td>
<td>Mother-Child Education Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSP</td>
<td>Mother Support Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tur</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bel</td>
<td>Belgium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sar</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The foundations of the Mother-Child Education Program were laid in 1982 within the framework of a scientific research project at Boğaziçi University, Istanbul, Turkey. The aim was to develop a home based early childhood education program targeting the family and to evaluate the existing center-based preschool education system. This project, which started with scientific purposes, has gone beyond its original aims. We would like to summarize the process through which the Mother-Child Education Program has passed to make it easier to understand the impetus for this study. It is possible to talk about the time from 1982 up to the present in two phases, first, that of the scientific research and second, that of the efforts regarding community development.

The effectiveness of the Mother-Child Education Program was evaluated through various studies following its first implementation. The first short-term evaluation results were obtained in 1986. The same sample was reached seven years later in 1993 and the first long-term evaluation study was realized. The second long-term study was carried out in 2005 with the same sample. This evaluation of the Mother-Child Education Program became one of the rare long-term evaluation studies of intervention programs. At that time there were no more than three in the world and none in Turkey. In addition, this was the first long-term study among the evaluations of the “intervention” programs aimed at parent education only. The details, the results and the related persons of this scientific journey are discussed in this book. The Mother-Child Education Program has an important position in the Turkish and world literature.

The efforts regarding community development started right after the first implementation of the Program, with the understanding that states, “Science is not for science only; it should contribute to the benefit of the community and then it will become more valuable.” The first implementations were small-scale projects carried out with the collaborative efforts of the Ministry of National Education (MONE) and UNICEF. The first major study for community development started with the Mother-Child Education Foundation. The Program was then applied throughout Turkey in collaboration
with the MONE General Directorate of Apprenticeship and Non-Formal Education. This extensive implementation was evaluated with a study. The Program rights were given to the MONE General Directorate of Apprenticeship and Non-Formal Education in 1996 and it has been implemented as a program of the General Directorate since then. This constituted the first example of the collaboration between a university-state organization and an NGO in Turkey at that time. The Mother-Child Education Program, pioneering in the scientific field, took a major first step in community development. Later in time various examples of similar collaborations have been seen in Turkey.

The collaboration with the MONE General Directorate of Apprenticeship and Non-Formal Education continued until 2009 and resulted in the inclusion of family education as a state policy. The National Family Education Program was developed by MONE, with the important contribution of the Mother-Child Education Program. Therefore, the Mother-Child Education Program, which was started for “scientific” reasons, constituted an example and paved the way for new education policies in Turkey.

The Mother-Child Education Program was put into practice abroad while the implementation in Turkey continued. It was first carried out in Holland, Belgium, Germany, and France; followed by Switzerland. Then it was started in Bahrain, Jordan and Saudi Arabia in the Middle East and Arab countries. Lebanon will be the next country soon.

Although the Mother-Child Education Program has earned its place in the world literature through quantitative research, there has never been a comprehensive qualitative research of the Program and the implementation outside Turkey has never been evaluated. Quantitative research provides us with solid data via “numerical” values. However, people’s experiences and statements, which are an important dimension in community development, are not included in quantitative research. Therefore, this qualitative research was carried out with the purpose of evaluating the implementations both in Turkey and abroad, bringing to light the experiences of the participants regarding the Program and its implementation from their own perspectives.

The identities of the mothers were kept confidential in the book. Their statements were presented by specifying the country name, and numbers replaced the names of the mothers.

Many people supported and contributed to the realization of this study. The financial support during data collection and analysis was provided by the Mother-Child Education Foundation. We would not have been able to realize this study if the mothers had not participated by giving us at least two hours of their time. They are the cornerstones of this study. My dear students Suna
Hanöz, Sümeyra Büşra Sözbilir and Öznur İlк, who worked in data collection and deciphered the recordings, contributed a great deal to this research. We owe special thanks to Canan Erman, who helped with data collection in Saudi Arabia and enabled the establishment of relationships abroad. Yasmin Yahya, who translated and deciphered the data collected in Bahrain, added great value to this research through her knowledge of Arabic. We thank Wafa Isa as well for collecting data in Bahrain.

Many people supported us in different countries: The Belgium Turkish Women’s Association; the teachers Dehan Kadıoğlu and Mürvet Çeçen in Belgium; MOCEP teachers in Switzerland, İtr Gündoğar, Sultan Örten and Nazmiye İşcan; and Julie Hadeed in Bahrain. Without the wife of the Turkish Ambassador to Saudi Arabia, Canan Koru, and the National Education Attaché, Metin Güçlü, at the time of the study, the research could not have been realized in Saudi Arabia. The support provided by Raziye Eren, who was always by our side during the data collection in Saudi Arabia, was invaluable.

We are thankful to Ceren Lordoğlu Tüz, who helped us with the coordination, the budget and the follow up of the research at the beginning; and Nur Sucuka-Çorapçı, who followed. Elif Alişoğlu and Şermin Erşan supported us in the preparation and publication stages. Filiz Öztürk was the key person for the publication. This book would not exist without their support. Aylin Atmaca Koçak, my former student and the second author of this book, has been with me throughout this project and her support has been invaluable. I possibly might not have started this research if I had not been sure of having her support.

We would like to express our gratitude to Ayşen Özyeğin, who paves the way for every kind of project at MOCEF with her pioneering style, for making the publication of this book possible without any hesitation. The book you are holding in your hands and this research were realized as a result of the equal focus she places on the importance of scientific approach as well as on community development.

We hope that this project will lead to other intervention programs.

Sevda Bekman

Aylin Atmaca Koçak

June, 2010
Before starting the scientific account of this research, we would like to talk about what the researchers went through during the preparation and especially the data collection phases. This is far from scientific information, but reflects our hands-on personal experience.

Although I did not regard qualitative study very highly, when a guest academic from India, Dr. T. S. Saraswathi, suggested I do a narrative about the mothers’ experiences at MOCEP, I thought “Why not?” Obviously, this narrative had to be presented within a scientific framework and this could only be possible through research. Thus, the foundations for the qualitative study, “Mothers Reporting: The Mother-Child Education Program in Five Countries” were laid. The research aimed to discover the experiences of participating mothers in five countries as well as their ideas about the effects, content and application of the Program.

I had been studying two books when Prof. Dr. Saraswathi put this idea forward. A long time passed after this proposal. After the completion of those projects, we formed the research team. My former student and present colleague Aylin Atmaca Koçak was the first person to join the team, especially to give support in the analysis. She is one of the rare people for whom I have been able to say, “Thankfully, I had such a student.” I have known her for such a long time and I am thankful for having met her. Then, my dear students Sümeyra Büşra Sözbilir, Suna Hanöz and Öznur İlk, joined the team. Yasmin Yahya, a junior student in the Marmara University Early Childhood Education Program, was the last member to join us.

Öznur and Suna were responsible for data collection in Belgium and Switzerland, while Yasmin was responsible for Bahrain and Saudi Arabia. Büşra collected data in Istanbul. Intensive interviewer training and pilot interviews were carried out in May 2008. Data collection in Europe and Istanbul was planned to start in the second week of June 2008 and it was actualized at that time.
Data collection

Brussels

I realized what data collection in this research would be like during and after the meeting we organized for the mothers in Brussels on June 9, 2008. We had undertaken quite a difficult task. I would like to share our experiences of this difficult path with you. It was a fine summer day in Brussels when I arrived with my senior students, Suna Hanöz and Öznur İlkk, who were the ones to do the interviews in Belgium and Switzerland, on Sunday, June 8, 2008. When we showed the address of our hotel to the taxi driver at the airport, he said “I have been a taxi driver for 10 years, but haven’t heard of this hotel before.” At that moment, I sensed that we might encounter some difficulties on this peaceful Sunday, but we started to drive toward our hotel and I thought maybe our driver was a bit awkward. Some time later, we were in a street where the traffic almost stopped and where African, Turkish, Moroccan and some other foreign nationals were crowding the road. Most of the shops had Turkish names. Stuck in that traffic, unable to move, I tried to start a conversation with the taxi driver and asked a futile question, as I mostly do, and got a similar answer back. When I asked him why there were so many people on the street, he said, “Why? Isn’t it the same in Turkey?” We did not bother to answer. Then, I asked the driver whether our hotel was far away and he said that we were almost there. I did not know whether to be happy or sad. As we got closer to the hotel, we saw young people out for a Sunday ride in their shiny cars, listening to blaring Turkish music. At last, we stopped in front of the Wellness Hotel. The driver was in a hurry and wanted to get rid of us as fast as he could. When we entered the hotel, I was convinced that we had to leave as soon as possible. I could not leave my two students there for a week. In fact, the two people at the reception desk, one of whom was Turkish as we learned later, were staring at us as if we were “aliens”. There was a gym inside the hotel and it must have been an important place for that neighborhood. There were muscular people walking around. We started our search for another hotel in this turmoil, aware of the amazed expression of the other customers. We finally found the Plaza Hotel, thanks to Suna’s laptop and the Turkish guy. The best part that reflected our culture was the Turkish receptionist who looked for a hotel for the three puzzled Turkish women who did not like his hotel. During our search, he eliminated some hotels, declaring them inappropriate. Finally, we managed to get into a taxi, which was able to reach our hotel by driving through those cars and people and left the Wellness Hotel, waving goodbye to our Turkish receptionist. Our new hotel, the Plaza Hotel, was far too luxurious to stay in during such a research, but our last minute search and the location of Brussels in Europe, doubled the prices. We had no other choice. We finalized our difficult day in Brussels with the country’s famous mussels and chips. The next day was the first day of our attempts at data collection. That day,
when we came up against the major difficulty, we realized that our experiences with the hotel on Sunday would be a pleasant memory.

The MOCEP was carried out in collaboration with the Belgium Turkish Women’s Association in Brussels. Therefore, we had a meeting with the participant mothers in the meeting room of the Association, together with the teachers Dehan Kadioğlu and Mürvet Çeçen. There were many fewer mothers than the 20 expected and there were not even 10 mothers who were willing to do the interview. After talking about the aim of the research, appointments were made to carry out the interviews in their homes. Getting the addresses correctly and finding the houses were as important as arranging the date and time of the visits. Some mothers preferred to conduct the interviews at the Association especially as they thought they would have difficulty in explaining about it to their spouses. After the meeting, the absent mothers were reached by phone calls. Suna and Öznur did not just conduct interviews. Every evening, they were busy confirming the interviews for the next day and finding replacements for those mothers who had cancelled their appointments at the last minute. Calls like “Hello, I am calling for the MOCEP Program. I got your phone number …….” were regular parts of our evening routine. The twentieth mother was finally reached one day before our departure to Switzerland, on Saturday, June 14, 2008. I will not report about the difficulties experienced and the increased tension during that time.

Switzerland (Wintertur, Schauffesen, Bern)

On Sunday, June 15, I went to Zurich from Istanbul by plane as Öznur and Suna travelled from Brussels by train. Our hotel was in Wintertur, 15 minutes from Zurich by train. We chose that area as the majority of the mothers lived around Zurich. Wintertur, Schauffesen and Bern were the three places where we wanted to collect the data. Our aim was to reach 20 mothers in Wintertur so that we would not have to go to other places, but this was not possible. There was a longer period of time for data collection in Zurich, which allowed Suna and Öznur to see around. That Sunday, I arrived at Wintertur at a reasonable time. Following our experiences with the hotel in Belgium, we checked into the hotel by continuously being in touch with Ceren Lordoğlu Tüz, who was in charge of the organization of this project at that time at MOCEF. Everything seemed to be in order and actually it was. The train system and the punctuality in Switzerland made our lives much easier when compared to Brussels. Living by the rules and care with regard to timing were evident characteristics in the mothers. Last minute cancellations, like the ones in Belgium, were rare. The convenience of transportation helped keep the tension low. Suna and Öznur were also more experienced after Brussels, and this was reflected positively in their data collection in Switzerland. We started our first meeting with a breakfast in the cafeteria of Migros in Wintertur. This meeting was
carried out with Itir Gündogar’s group. At first, we thought that this place had been chosen for the meeting out of kindness, but we were surprised to hear that all MOCEP meetings were held there. When all the mothers arrived, we started the meeting with the Turkish delight we had brought from Istanbul, Divan Patisserie, and with a welcome speech, the same as the one in Brussels. Then, we talked about the aim of the research and our expectations of the mothers. Possibly the most demanding sentence was “We expect you to spare us at least two hours of your time.” There were various reactions to this sentence. On the other hand, we wanted other things as well. We did not want the children, the family members or the neighbors at home during the interview. It was difficult to find a convenient time with all these criteria. The majority of the mothers were eager and Öznur and Suna rapidly collected the relevant information. Two interviews were scheduled right after the meeting so as to use the time effectively.

The second meeting was held with Sultan Örten’s group in Schauffesen on Tuesday June 17. It took 20 minutes to travel from Wintertur to Schauffesen. All that greenery, well-fed animals, detached houses and silence…. That was all we saw during our trip by train. The second meeting was held at the Turkish Association. Listening to Best FM radio station, we all felt at home. That was a meeting with breakfast as well and the same procedure was repeated here. Then, Suna and Öznur contacted Nazmiye İşcan, the teacher of the group in Bern, in order to reach 20 mothers. They conducted interviews with the mothers in Bern. I had to leave Zurich early to attend the elections for the rectorate at Boğaziçi University. I took the 13:13 airport train from Schauffesen and arrived at the Turkish Airlines check-in desk without any difficulty. Every time I wondered about something, the answer to that question appeared in front of me as if someone had heard my thoughts. I could not resist it finally when I called my dear friend Ayhan Aksu Koç and reminded her of a joke we used to make during our days at Middle East Technical University. I told her that these Swiss people did not have the right to die as everything was so planned and thought through. Especially for someone used to the chaos of Istanbul, it was an incredible relief. Then, I remembered an interview I had read years earlier in one of the periodicals of Turkish Airlines, with Mr Poffet, the Chairman of Sandoz pharmaceutical company at that time. He was asked why he had chosen to live in Istanbul, being Swiss, and his reply was: “You are fortunate to die in Switzerland, but lucky to live in Turkey. I have chosen this.” He was right despite all. Öznur and Suna came back to Turkey on June 25, 2008, with experiences and memories they will never forget.

**Bahrain**

In Bahrain, the interviews had to be conducted in Arabic. We thought that Iraqi-born Yasmin, an undergraduate student in the Marmara University Early Childhood Education Program would be the right person, so we included her in the interviewer
team. According to the research program, the plan was to fly to Bahrain with Yasmin Yahya on Sunday, June 22, 2008. However, an unexpected obstacle came up: Bahrain did not issue a visa for Yasmin. It was a bit difficult to accept this situation after 1.5 months of training. As a solution, Wafa Isa, the coordinator of the institution which implemented the MOCEP in Bahrain undertook the task of interviewing. I went to Bahrain as planned on June 22. I trained Wafa in English and then all her pilot interviews were sent to Yasmin. With Yasmin’s feedback in Arabic, Wafa started “actual” data collection only after reaching the level we anticipated. This training process was very inconvenient as packages had to be sent between Istanbul and Bahrain. Later we learned that single women who are citizens of Arabic countries are not issued a visa to protect their privacy. I started having serious anxiety upon hearing this statement about how we, three single women, would be able to travel to Saudi Arabia for data collection. My observations about the life in Bahrain taught me a great deal.

**Saudi Arabia**

We left Istanbul on Friday evening, October 17, 2008 to fly to Riyadh, Saudi Arabia. It was not easy to get visas for three single women. Our visit to Saudi Arabia was possible through the efforts of Canan Koru, the Turkish Ambassador at that time, and Metin Güzlü, the Education Attaché of the Embassy of Riyadh. Without their help, we could not have collected the data. We went to Saudi Arabia with Canan Erman, one of the first trainers of MOCEP and who is an educator at the Early Childhood Education Section at MOCEF at the moment, and my student Sümeyra Büflra Sözbilir, who was responsible for data collection in Turkey. Our journey started very nicely. We boarded the plane talking about our first days at MOCEP with Canan. Actually, I have to confess that I was feeling uneasy about travelling to Saudi Arabia. However, being with Canan, who had already been to that country, eased my fears. During the flight shortly before landing, Canan fell ill and scared all of us, including the flight attendants. The later diagnosis was poor oxygen flow to the brain due to a stomach sickness. We were very tense and excited to have experienced this event in the air with unqualified personnel. Thanks to the great hospitality shown to us by the authorities of the Embassy and Education Attaché upon our arrival, we were able to calm down. Canan had a thorough medical examination there and then this incident was only a memory. We stayed at Ramada Hotel in Riyadh. It was one of the rare hotels at which single women could stay. We put on the abayas given to us on our arrival. Our heads were not covered, though. On our first day there, we organized a meeting with the mothers at the Turkish school. We made appointments for the interviews. However, we could not reach 20 mothers in Riyadh so we had to make interviews in Medina as well, though few in number. We were dependent on someone in Riyadh as there was neither mass transportation nor taxis and, most important of all, as a woman is allowed to go out only if she is accompanied by a man, her spouse or a driver. This
person was one of the drivers of the Embassy or the Office of the Attaché, or the driver of Raziye Eren, who coordinated the implementation of MOCEP there. A special effort was made to coordinate the drivers as well as plan the interviews. Despite the dependence on other people, data collection in this country was the easiest thanks to all of the friends of MOCEP, the Embassy and Office of the Education Attaché. I had been anxious before going there about the possible difficulties in transportation as the interviews would be in each mother’s home, but things did not turn out as I had feared.

I came back to Turkey three days later as my classes started at the university. Canan and Büşra returned on October 26, after having completed the interviews in Riyadh and Medina and after having performed half Umrah in Medina.

Life in Riyadh was different, but what attracted my attention most was the fact that a woman was dependent on a man (spouse, driver and servant) in her daily life, especially for transportation. I also witnessed how the shopping malls could become “the most important” thing in people’s lives, and of course how people, living in a world with prohibitions, can overcome them with creativity.

**Turkey**

The data in Turkey was collected by my student Sümayra Büşra Sözbilir in two districts of Istanbul. She preferred to stay in Turkey at the time as she was taking classes from the summer school, but she went to Saudi Arabia. I quote her experiences during data collection with her own words.

“I started with the interviews on the Asian side of Istanbul, as a personal preference. I started making appointments with the mothers in Maltepe by calling them on June 9, 2008. When I called all the mothers on my list, I realized that a group of mothers lived at Maltepe, while another group was in the Başbüyük neighborhood of Maltepe. The schools were closed at that time and families had started going to their home towns, so I had difficulty in reaching the required number of mothers. I first started the interviews with the mothers living in Maltepe on June 10, 2008. As we had done the pilot interviews in Istanbul, it was not strange for me to go to a house that I did not know for an interview. However, every neighborhood, every house and every mother was new and different. I was also unknown and foreign to the mothers. They wondered about who would come to visit them. Sometimes, they would call me back or they would call the teachers of MOCEF and try to get information about me. Of course, it is not easy to trust someone in Istanbul, but while leaving their houses, the mothers generally made comments like 'I was expecting someone older, but this was much better. We were able to talk comfortably and freely' and we would hug tightly as if we had known each other for years.
I could do only 3-4 interviews a week as I was taking summer school classes at the time and because of the traffic and long distances in Istanbul. It was hotter every day and most of the time I had to walk long distances to the houses from the stops, as I was using the public transport system. I had to walk for minutes before I could find the houses, but I would forget about my fatigue after drinking a glass of tea the mothers would make and after chatting with and interviewing them. It is impossible for me to forget the friendly attitude and kindness of the mothers, who made me feel accepted by chatting after the interviews, escorting me to the bus stop or trying to give me water and food, saying that it was hot and I had a long way to go.

There were some misunderstandings as sometimes I had to make consecutive appointments in a day with the mothers. I will never forget the astonishment I had one day. I was trying to find the address of a mother, Mrs. Mehtap, and finally I was able to find the building, but could not find the apartment. So I rang the bell of an apartment in front of which there were children’s shoes. An elderly woman and a five-year-old boy opened the door. I thought that lady was the mother of my interviewee so I said ‘Hello, I am looking for Mrs. Melek.’ (I had made an appointment with a mother named Melek the previous day and so I was confused, I guess.) The lady looked suddenly perplexed and with a sad tone, she said ‘My dear, Mrs. Melek has died.’ I had a shock. Then when she said that they had moved to that apartment two months earlier, following her death, I suddenly started laughing, out of happiness and relief I guess. So this time it was the lady looking at me in amazement. I did not know how to get myself together as I was also ashamed and all I could say was ‘I am sorry, actually I was looking for Mrs. Mehtap.’

These misunderstandings worried my mother at times as well. For example, one day I had left early for an interview on the other side of Istanbul and a mother, who had understood that I would visit her that day, called our house in the afternoon and told my mother that I had not yet arrived. You can guess the panic of my mother at that moment…

I completed the interviews in Başıbüyük on June 20, 2008, with all good memories and mishaps and started those in Bahçelievler on June 23, 2008. I was planning to finalize my interviews with the mothers in Küçükbaakkalköy, but I could only realize two interviews from that group as most of the mothers had gone to their home towns. I reached the required number by making appointments with the mothers in Bahçelievler and completed them all on July 28, 2008.”
THEORETICAL AND EMPIRICAL RATIONALE FOR THE MOTHER-CHILD EDUCATION PROGRAM

The basic building blocks for the child’s physical, cognitive, social and emotional development are set in the early years of life in the context of the family and the community at large (Bronfenbrenner, 1979; Sameroff, 1975).

The development of children from disadvantaged environments is impaired since they are exposed to cumulative environmental risk factors (Evans, 2004). There is ample evidence regarding the negative effects of environmental conditions on the development and educational outcomes of children (Black, Hess, & Berenson-Howard, 2000; Murnane, 2007; Zigler, Gilliam, & Jones, 2006). Those children who are subject to inequitable conditions tend to lag far behind their peers (Brooks-Gunn & Duncan, 1997; Lamb, Land, Meadows, & Trayler, 2005; Lee & Burkman, 2002) and the developmental gap expands in later years (Berrueta-Clement, Schweinhart, Barnett, Epstein, & Weikart, 1986; Hess, 1970; Klerman, 1991; Lamb et al., 2005; Lazar & Darlington, 1982; Pehrson & Robinson, 1990).

Intervention programs aim to support the cognitive and socio-emotional development of children whose development might be impaired due to negative environmental conditions at early ages. It is much more constructive and economic to prevent the adverse effects of environmental conditions through early support programs than attempting to find solutions to their unfavorable effects through subsequent interventions (Carneiro & Heckman, 2004; Shonkoff, 2000).

The role of early intervention could be based on the principles of development put forward by Shonkoff (2000). Among the ten principles cited, especially the fact that “development is shaped by the interplay of sources of resilience and vulnerability,” sets the stage for intervention programs. Therefore, the basic purpose of the intervention programs is to reduce the risk factors and to increase the promoting factors. When this becomes possible, a transition from vulnerability to resilience can occur (Shonkoff, 2000; Werner & Johnson, 1999). Starting at earlier ages enhances the efficiency of these programs significantly (Reynolds, 1998; Weaver et al., 2004).
Carneiro and Heckman (2004) have pointed out that intervention at an early age is more advantageous and lasts longer, indicating a higher economic output for the investment made. As a matter of fact, the debate about the economic dimensions of investment in early childhood education is not on whether to stop the investment at later ages, but rather points out that making investment at different developmental stages has an interactional and a complementary role in development (Cunha, Heckman, Lochner, & Masterov, 2006).

The context in which the child lives is significant in supporting his/her development. The family, being a substantial element of this context, occupies an important place in intervention programs. As a result of the awareness of the impact the environment has on development, early childhood intervention programs went through a transition from a child focused approach to an ecological approach. Thus, the emphasis is now on the interrelationships between the child, the family and social support systems (Reynolds, 1999). It is the transactional interpretation of development (Sameroff, 1975) and Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) view of the family as a system embedded in a larger ecological framework of systems that constitute the underlying philosophy of programs which aim at the family context, where the goal is to give equal attention both to the child and to his or her environment.

The framework that Guralnick (1997) introduced for intervention programs defines the importance of the family through three basic “patterns” that are influential on the child’s development. These are: the quality in parent-child transactions, family orchestrated child experiences, and health and safety provided by the family. In fulfilling these patterns families, at times, experience hardships and stress, which result from lack of knowledge and resources, confidence threats and interpersonal and family distress. Early intervention programs help eliminate the stress factors by optimizing the family patterns and thus, affect development positively. Guralnick emphasized that intervention programs could actualize this by providing resource, information, service and social support.

Family is considered to be an important mechanism to link poverty with children’s education and development (Engle & Black, 2008). This is reflected in behaviors such as failure to provide a stimulating environment for their children (Coleman, 1990), lack of involvement in educationally enhancing activities such as reading and exposing to written materials (Bradley, Whiteside, & Mundform, 1994; Pfannenstiel, Seitz, & Zigler, 2002) and use of language that is simple in structure and directive in content (Hart & Risley, 1995). Thus children with limited opportunities for literacy-related activities are particularly at a disadvantage since their homes do not facilitate children’s attainment in their literacy potential (Aksu-Koç, 2005; Baydar, Brooks-Gunn, & Furstenberg, 1993; Campbell & Ramey, 1994; Hart & Risley, 1995; Hoff-Ginsberg, 1991; Pan, Rowe, Singer, & Snow, 2005; Payne, Whitehurst, & Angell, 1994; Raz & Bryant, 1990; Snow, 1993; Snow, Burns, & Griffin, 1998; Snow & Tabor, 1996; Sofu, 1995).
Families under stress due to environmental and socio-economic conditions may be unable to meet the developmental needs of children since their mental health and emotional well-being are under threat (Dodge, Pettit, & Bates, 1994; Gutman & McLoyd, 2005). The quality of their interactions with their children will then be a joint function of their personality characteristics, the stress experienced, and the characteristic behaviors and skills of their child (Hyde, Else-Quest, Goldsmith, & Biesanz, 2004).

The cognitive and social development of children from disadvantaged environments could be enhanced through increased intellectual stimulation and strengthening the developmentally appropriate characteristics of the environment (Campbell & Ramey, 1994). Children coming from empowered environments start school more prepared and with a higher chance of success. Early school success brings later academic success and success in life (Schweinhart, Barnes, & Weikart, 1993). The shared goal of intervention programs is to promote healthy overall development which will enable the successful transition to school, and in the long run to contribute to school adjustment and success. Effective programs that give children a fair start in the early years not only help them catch up easily and lead to an increased enrollment in later schooling, but also decrease the need for remedial programs for unsuccessful and repeating students (Myers, 1992).

It also has been argued that those children who can meet the demands of school after having attended an intervention program are accepted as successful by their teachers and will, in turn, be reinforced, and in fact be more successful in their academic progress and performance. All these will affect readiness for success in adult life (Berrueta-Clement et al., 1986; Myers, 1992; Woodhead, 1986).

Although this framework suggests certain cause-effect relations, it does not provide evidence for specific connections, but simply points to the causal conditions which make the effect more likely to occur. These causes are easily considered to be contributing factors (Schweinhart & Weikart, 1980).

The first intervention programs were based on a model that provided services to the child directly in the institutions. The origins of these services date back to the era of the fight against poverty that started in the United States in the 1960s. Unfortunately, the massive Head Start Program was evaluated to be unsuccessful. Especially, the Westinghouse report (Cicirelli, Evans, & Schiller, 1969) and Smilansky’s writings (1979) were influential in this judgment.

However, the results of subsequent studies were more affirmative. Early intervention for at-risk children was considered to be an effective method for raising the likelihood of school success, especially for raising the class level recently completed at school (Barnett & Boocock, 1998; Bekman, 2003, 2004, 2007; Campbell & Ramey, 1994; Guralnick, 1997; Hadeed, 2004; Kağıtçıbaşı, Sunar, & Bekman, 2001; Kağıtçıbaşı, Sunar, Bekman, Baydar, & Cemalcılar, 2009; Lazar & Darlington, 1982; Ramey &
A general consensus has been reached in recent years about the long-term benefits of early intervention and especially about the fact that at-risk children are more successful at school and adapt better to the society as a result of the intervention programs. Program evaluations that have been carried out recently such as High Scope (Schweinhart et al., 2005), Chicago Longitudinal Research (Reynolds & Ou, 2004), the Infant Health and Development Program (McCormick et al., 2006) and the Abecedarian Project (Campbell, Ramey, Pungello, Sparling, & Miller-Johnson, 2002), underline once more the effectiveness of early intervention on school success and skills regarding adaptation to school (Blok, Fukkink, Gebhardt, & Leseman, 2005).

The role of parents in attaining positive child outcomes in the intervention process needs attention. The role of parents can be approached from three different aspects: parenting, the home–school relationship and responsibility for learning outcomes (Harvard Family Research Project, 2006). There are a number of studies that indicate the contribution of parental involvement to the academic development and the achievement of children from socially and educationally disadvantaged groups (Bohon, Macpherson, & Atiles, 2005; Domina, 2005; St Clair & Jackson, 2006; Sy & Schulenberg, 2005; Yan & Lin, 2005). Children whose parents were involved in their education were found to perform better in reading and writing (Reutzal, Fawson, & Smith, 2006; Senechal, 2006) and to be supported in learning and achievement (Gonzales-DeHass, Willems, & Doan Holbein, 2005). Chang, Park Singh, and Sung (2009) studied the effects of three different types of parental involvement: parenting classes, group socialization and parental support group on child’s cognitive outcomes. Parents in these three different parental activities were found to increase language and cognitive stimulation at home as well as parental supportiveness while parental intrusiveness decreased.

Although the effects of intervention programs on children’s outcomes have been reported in a vast number of studies, very little is mentioned about the outcomes on parents. These programs were found to affect maternal employment, education and mother-child interaction (Benasich, Brooks-Gunn, & Chu Clewell, 1992), maternal competence, and parental attitudes and behavior (Pehrson & Robinson, 1990). When parents were included in the programs, an increase in consistent maternal behavior and maternal sensitivity (Asscher, Hermanns, & Dekovic, 2008), and a reduction in maternal stress (Conners, Edwards, & Grant, 2006) were observed. White, Taylor, and Moss (1992) analyzed previous research that examined the benefits of involving parents as interveners (Bronfenbrenner, 1974; Datta, 1971; Florin & Dokechi, 1983; Karnes & Lee, 1978; Lazar, 1981) and concluded that there was a need for further scientifically sound research to come up with real evidence.
There is no specific early childhood education curriculum associated with success in early intervention. Recent research indicates that success depends on numerous factors such as the appropriateness of the model to the context (home-based vs. center-based), age of onset (as early as three-to-four years vs. kindergarten), duration of the program (one vs. more years), intensity of the curriculum (semi-structured, child-centered vs. teacher-centered programs), and the quality of the school children start afterwards (Lee & Loeb, 1995; Reynolds et al., 1998; van Tuijl, Leseman, & Rispens, 2001).

Various intervention models such as center-based, home-based (where parents are provided with different strategies about parenting) or a combination of center and home-based education (where children attend an institution while parents are included) were tried out in different contexts, taking a series of socio-cultural and economic factors into consideration. Blok et al. (2005) compared the efficiency of center-based, home-based and a combination of center and home-based education models in their meta-analysis of 19 studies and found that center-based and combined models yielded more promising results in the cognitive domain, compared to the home-based programs. In another meta-analysis, Camilli, Vargas, Ryan, and Barnett (2010) analyzed 123 early intervention program studies. The results indicated a difference in the children who had received preschool education before starting school when compared to those who had not. Although the greatest impact was observed in cognitive skills, preschool education was found to influence social skills and progress in school positively.

The results of the evaluation research that were carried out in recent years have displayed positive outcomes of the programs that support both the parents and the child (Bekman, 2003; Eccles & Harold, 1993; Hadeed, 2004; Kağıtçıbaşı, 2007; Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2001; Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2009; Korenman, Miller, & Sjaastad, 1995; Lee & Croninger, 1994; Masten & Coatsworth, 1998; McLoyd, 1998; Yoshikawa, 1994; Zigler et al., 1992).
THE MOTHER-CHILD EDUCATION PROGRAM

Setting for the Mother-Child Education Program in Turkey

When the population between 0-6 years is taken into consideration, 26.92% of 3-6 year olds (36-72 months), 38.55% of 4-6 year olds (48-72 months) and 61% of 5-6 year olds (60-72 months) receive early childhood education. This percentage drops to 23% when the whole target population is considered (MONE, 2009-2010). On the other hand, when the schooling of the 3-6 year olds in the world is examined, it can be seen that 41% of this age group receive early childhood education. This rate is 80% in developed countries, while it drops to 36% in developing countries (UNESCO, 2010).

The existing early childhood education services fall into the following main categories. Nursery classes (kindergartens), which cater to children between the ages of 5-6 in the year before they begin formal schooling; preschool centers (day care centers, child houses), which cater to children aged 3-6; and creche and day care centers that cater to children from 0-6.

These services either belong to the Ministry of National Education (MONE) or the General Directorate of Social Welfare and the Child Protection Agency of the Prime Minister’s Office (SSCPA); or they belong to individuals, but are under the supervision of either of these two government agencies. The government institutions that belong to MONE mainly fall into the category of nursery classes since these classes are attached to the compulsory education institutions, i.e. basic education schools. There are few governmental preschool centers which belong to MONE. The kind of institutions which are under the supervision of MONE but belong to individuals are mainly the preschools or nursery classes of private elementary schools. On the other hand, Private Crèche and Daycare Centers and Private Child Houses are under the supervision of the General Directorate of Social Welfare and Child Protection Agency of the Prime Minister’s Office (SSCPA). The numbers are shown in Table 1.

The Ministry of National Education reached a decision and planned to make preschool education for five year-olds compulsory in 2009. According to this decision, compulsory preschool education for five year-olds started in 32 cities during the 2009-2010 academic year and in five years, the schooling will reach 100% at the end of the 2013-2014 academic year (ANKA Press).

As seen from Table 1, the quantitative state of the early childhood education system does not meet the needs of the current population. It is expected that the decision of MONE to make preschool education compulsory will improve the system.
When the quality and the efficiency of the system are taken into consideration, it is evident that the state has preferred a center-based education model during dissemination. Nearly all the services are center-based and located in the big cities. Only 5-6 year olds (60-72 months) are targeted. This narrow target group and a single early childhood education and development model lead to inadequate rates of children who can be reached. Programs which target parents of young children are nearly non-existent.

The present situation is even more critical for children from unstimulating environments because most of the facilities available (preschool centers, day care centers, nursery classes) are privately owned and charge tuition. The services that belong to the state operate on a monthly tuition that is defined by the local administration. Children from environments with high-risk conditions are not given priority in the system. These implementations affect the children from less stimulating environments negatively. Children who could be prioritized because of their needs cannot benefit from these services.

There are no accreditation criteria and no follow-up of the quality as well. This leads to differences in quality and is reflected on the development of children. The development of children attending educationally-oriented centers is found to be better than those attending custodial centers (Bekman, 2002; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2001).

Table 1
*Distribution of Preschool Education Institutions in Turkey*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Institution</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Number of Schools/Institutions</th>
<th>Total Number of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of National Education – MONE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Nursery Classes</td>
<td>60-72 months</td>
<td>22,225</td>
<td>601,416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Preschools</td>
<td>36-72 months</td>
<td>1,248</td>
<td>117,153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Nursery Classes</td>
<td>60-72 months</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>17,110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Preschools</td>
<td>36-72 months</td>
<td>928</td>
<td>24,239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Public Institutions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>148</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,696</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions opened according to law no: 657 reg. 191</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSCP A</td>
<td>1,555</td>
<td></td>
<td>36,443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>26,681</td>
<td><strong>980,654</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Statistics of National Education, 2009-2010)
Historical Background of the Mother-Child Education Program

Before the Establishment of the Mother-Child Education Foundation (MOCEF)

The first studies about the Mother-Child Education Program started in 1982, within the framework of the Turkish Early Enrichment Project (Bekman, 1998, 2003, 2004; Kağıtçibaşı, 2007; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2001; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2009). This project was a four-year longitudinal study that aimed to assess the effects of both center-based and home-based education on the overall development of the child in the early years. The operations of the existing educational or custodial care giving institutions were examined in order to evaluate the activities of the center-based education. The effects of the home-based education, on the other hand, were assessed through the effects of the Mother-Child Education Program, which had been developed by the project team. The Program at the time had two main elements. The first element, which was developed by the research team and named the Mother Education Program (Kağıtçibaşı, Bekman, & Sunar, 1991), had the purpose of informing about and supporting the mother in the social, emotional and personality development of the child. Various topics were discussed in group meetings with the mothers to this aim. The program to foster the cognitive development of the child was a Turkish translation and adaptation of the Home Instruction Program for Preschool Youngsters Program developed by Avima Lombard (1994). It was a two year program for 4 and 5 year-old children and it was implemented in periods of 30 weeks through group meetings and home visits.

The Turkish Early Enrichment Project lasted four years (1982-1986). The fourth year assessments investigated the short-term effects of the Program. The short-term results indicated substantial differences between the children attending educational and custodial daycare centers and between those participating in the mother training and those who did not. The children attending an educational daycare center were found to be superior in all indicators of cognitive, social and emotional development as well as school achievement when compared to those in custodial or home care. The same trend was also valid for those children whose parents had training. The children in the trained group exceeded those in the control group in all measures of cognitive, social and emotional development (Bekman, 2002, 2003, 2004; Kağıtçibaşı, 2007; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2001).

The effects of the Mother Education Program on the mothers were also impressive. The main difference of the Program was observed in the mother-child relationship. The mothers who participated in the Program were observed to be more sensitive to the developmental needs of their children, to have more verbal communication and to have higher aspirations and expectations about their children’s success. The direct effects of the Program on the mothers revealed a higher status of the woman within the family and a more optimistic perspective for future life.
A follow-up study was conducted in 1991-1992 to evaluate the long-term effects of the project six years after the finalization of the actual study (ten years after the project had started). The findings of the follow-up research revealed better cognitive functioning, higher school grades, more positive attitudes toward school, and a higher number of children who were still in school among those whose mothers had undergone training (Bekman, 2003, 2004; Kağıtçıbaşı, 2007; Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2001).

The long-term results of the Program on the mothers indicated that the Mother Education Program had effects on the mother-child relationship and on the mothers themselves. The mothers were observed to have formed closer relations with their children and provide a more stimulating environment for them. These mothers also had the last word in the decisions made at home (Bekman, 2003, 2004; Kağıtçıbaşı, 2007; Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2001).

The second follow-up study of the Program was carried out 19 years later in 2003-2004, with the child subjects who were then adults. The findings indicated that the children who had attended the Program or an educational child care center had more education, worked in higher quality jobs and used computers and credit cards more (Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2009). These results confirm that only the preschool education programs which are of good quality are effective.

The Program has been revised and enlarged since the implementation in 1983. The most important modification was made in the duration of the Program. It was reduced from 60 to 25 weeks. Furthermore, the Program targets only 5 year olds, not 4 and 5 year olds as it had, because it aims to reach children in the year before they start formal schooling. A Cognitive Education Program was developed by the project team in line with these modifications. The purpose was to replace the Home Instruction Program for Preschool Youngsters Program (HIPPY) (Lombard, 1994). The new program was named the Cognitive Education Program (Kağıtçıbaşı, Bekman, Özkök, & Kuşçul, 1991). The content of the topics of the Mother Education Program was modified and enlarged (Kağıtçıbaşı, Bekman, & Sunar, 1991). A new component named the Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program was added. The Program is now implemented only through weekly group meetings instead of home visits and group meetings, as was done in the original study. The whole Program was named the Mother-Child Education Program (MOCEP) thereafter.

MOCEP was implemented in İstanbul in seven adult education centers with the collaboration of the Finance Foundation and Ministry of National Education during 1991-1993 and reached 716 mothers and 1432 mother-child pairs during those two years.
After the Establishment of the Mother-Child Education Foundation

The Mother-Child Education Foundation (MOCEF) was founded in August 1993. MOCEF is a privately funded non-profit organization. The stated purpose of the Foundation is to “contribute to the development of modern Turkey through educational, social, economic and financial activities.”

The Mother-Child Education Foundation has been continuing to implement MOCEP since 1993, mainly in collaboration with MONE, the General Directorate of Apprenticeship and Non-Formal Education. Table 2 displays the number of provinces in which the Program has been implemented, the number of the teaching staff and the mothers participating in the Program. The Mother-Child Education Foundation also has collaborated with the General Directorate of Social Welfare and Child Protection Agency, in addition to the Ministry of National Education. Although the number of beneficiaries reached through this collaboration has been less than those reached through the collaboration with the Ministry of National Education, it has enabled the Program to be implemented on a wider scale. The numbers are shown in Table 2.

Table 2
Number of Courses and Mothers that MOCEP Reached in Collaboration with MONE and SSCP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Number of Courses</th>
<th>Number of Mothers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1,146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>1,760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>5,490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>366</td>
<td>7,462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>9,484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>388</td>
<td>8,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>406</td>
<td>8,595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>8,549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>465</td>
<td>9,776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>10,799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>567</td>
<td>12,143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>552</td>
<td>12,684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>679</td>
<td>13,571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>640</td>
<td>13,386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>640</td>
<td>13,002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>6,638</td>
<td>140,250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Number of Courses</th>
<th>Number of Mothers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>5,788</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Content of the Mother-Child Education Program (MOCEP)

The Mother-Child Education Program has a holistic approach. It targets the child and the child’s immediate environment rather than the child alone. The Program aims to create an environment that will provide optimal psychosocial development, better health and nutritional conditions and to promote school readiness for the child. This necessitates fostering the role of the parents in the cognitive, social and emotional development of the child. It is an example of both an adult education and a child development program. The Mother-Child Education Program reaches children and parents right before the child starts formal education, with the understanding that the mothers will be more receptive to new information during this period.

The Program has three main elements: the Cognitive Education Program that fosters the cognitive development of the child, the Mother Support Program that sensitizes mothers to the overall development of the child, and the Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program that sensitizes mothers to reproductive health and family planning. The Program lasts 25 weeks and targets children who are “at-risk” because of their environmental conditions.

The Cognitive Education Program

The Cognitive Education Program was developed in 1991 by a team (Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 1991) and revised in 1995 (Kağıtçıbaşı, Bekman, Kuşcul, Özkök, & Sucuka, 1995). The final revision of the program was realized in 2005 (Sucuka-Çorapçı, Algan, & Bekman, 2005).

The primary aim of this component is to prepare children for school by stimulating their pre-literacy and pre-numeracy skills. There are 25 worksheets in the Cognitive Education Program. Each week’s material contains various exercises to be completed daily by the mother and the child and it takes about 15-20 minutes to complete them. A typical weekly worksheet contains 20-25 pages. Each page is assigned and marked for each day of the week (1st, 2nd day) in order to help the mothers follow the activities of different days. The worksheets become more difficult with time. The exercises are targeted mainly at eye-hand coordination, sensory discrimination, pre-literacy (letter recognition, letter sounds recognition) and pre-numeracy skills (number recognition, addition and subtraction), language development, classification, seriation, concept formation (direction, size, and place), learning of colors and shapes, problem solving skills and general ability. Each week’s worksheet contains exercises in the different fields mentioned above.

A mediated learning approach is adopted for the Cognitive Education Program. The aim is to maximize the cognitive development of the child. The mother is expected to support her child while doing exercises especially in pre-literacy, pre-numeracy and reading skills. During these exercises, the mothers create suitable conditions to enable the children to function within their “zone of proximal development” by asking questions, making suggestions, guiding and answering questions.
Eight picture story books (Alpöge, 1995) are used to develop listening comprehension, verbal expression, vocabulary, question-answer activities and reasoning skills in addition to the worksheets.

**The Mother Support Program**

The Mother Support Program was first developed in 1982 and its first publication was realized in 1991 (Kağıtçibaşı, Bekman, & Sunar, 1991). The program was revised during the establishment of MOCEF (Kağıtçibaşı, Bekman, Özkök, & Kuşcul, 1995). The final revision of the Mother Support Program was carried out in 2002 (Sucuka, Özdemir, Kizir, Erman, & Bekman, 2002).

This program aims to increase the mother’s sensitivity to the child’s cognitive, social and emotional development and to assist her in preparing a home environment that will support the child’s development. It also has the purpose of supporting the parents in creating a consistent and positive mother-child interaction. Child health, nutrition, developmental characteristics in the cognitive, social and physical domains, creative play activities and the importance of play can be cited among the topics of the program. Topics such as discipline, methods for changing negative behavior, mother-child interaction and communication also are emphasized. In addition, the program focuses on the expression of feelings, listening and acceptance of the child. Then, generalizations are made about relationships with other people, including the one with the spouse. Some meetings are devoted to the mother’s feelings about being a woman and a mother.

The mothers are encouraged to develop a positive self-concept throughout the program. The group discussions have the intention to support the mothers in developing feelings of competence, efficacy and self-confidence.

Later some topics of the Mother Support Program were chosen and a separate 13-week program was structured and named also the Mother Support Program in 2004 (Sucuka, Özdemir, Kizir, Erman, & Bekman, 2004). The Mother Support Program was then further revised in 2008 and two versions emerged, focusing on 3-6 and 7-11 years of age (Sucuka-Çorapçi et al., 2008).

**The Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program**

The Mother-Child Education Foundation cooperated with institutions that were active in the field in order to develop the Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program. The first program implemented was developed in 1993 (Balkan, 1993). When there was a need to expand the program later, a new program was prepared (Coşkun, Kızıkaya, Yıldız, & Hotun, 1996). The program contains 23 topics. The first part is composed of 14 topics that discuss the importance of reproductive health. This part mainly sensitizes the mothers to their own reproductive system and the prevention of the simple illnesses
of this system. There is also information on healthy pregnancy and safe motherhood. The second part mainly discusses different methods of family planning in nine different meetings.

- **Implementation of the Mother-Child Education Program**

Mothers attend weekly group meetings for 25 weeks in adult education centers. The meetings are conducted by the teachers of the Apprenticeship and Non-Formal Education General Directorate, who are trained by the Mother-Child Education Foundation staff. The week’s topic of the Mother Support Program is discussed for an hour and a half in the first part of each meeting. Each week’s topic is predetermined, which allows the teachers to be prepared about that topic. The mothers actively participate, ask questions, and express their opinions and share ideas and experiences during the group meetings. After the group discussions, group decisions are taken about the applications to be done at home. In the following meeting, the results of the decisions and applications are evaluated and new group decisions are possibly taken. In this way, techniques of group dynamics are used to provide mothers with the opportunity to support the healthy development of their children.

The Reproductive Health and Family Planning Program is discussed in the second part of the meeting and lasts 15 minutes. The main purpose is to convey information to the mothers in the group context. This allows the mothers to share their experiences and hear those of other mothers about family planning and reproductive health.

In the last part of the meeting, mothers are asked to make groups of five or six to learn the exercises of the Cognitive Education Program through “role playing.” In each small group, an aide (one of the mothers) is responsible for the correct implementation of the program. Mothers in the groups learn the activities that they will later carry out with their children through taking turns and role playing. Each mother is given the opportunity to experience the roles of both the mother and the child. An extra effort is made to teach the worksheet of that week to the mothers in order to ensure the effectiveness of the implementation at home.

The whole meeting lasts about three hours and each group consists of 20-25 mothers.

- **Evaluation Studies of the Mother-Child Education Program**

An evaluation was conducted after the implementation of the Program on a larger scale in collaboration with the Ministry of National Education. The evaluations were done right after the termination of the Program and a year after the Program when the children had completed their first year of formal schooling (Bekman, 1998). When the children who had attended the Program and the control group were compared, it was seen that the Program had effects on cognitive development, especially on pre-litera-
cy and pre-numeracy skills. The children who had participated in the Program were much better in these skills than those in the control group. The same findings were found after the end of the first school year. Again in that period, they were better than their counterparts in the literacy and numeracy skills used in primary school. In addition, those children started reading earlier and had higher passing grades.

A difference in the child rearing attitudes of the mothers was also found. When the trained mothers were compared to the control group, it was seen that mothers in the Program had stopped using authoritative attitudes and behaviors and replaced them with more democratic methods. These changes were observed to continue at the end of the first year of school.

The only small-scale qualitative analysis of the Program was carried out in 1998-1999 with a group of mothers in Istanbul. This research aimed to find out the experiences of participant mothers and the changes that the mothers underwent. The mothers’ statements revealed the major positive contributions of the Program to their own behavior, their relationship with their spouses and children, and to their children (Koçak & Bekman, 2004).

### Dissemination Structure of the Mother-Child Education Program in Turkey

The Program was executed by the teachers and province coordinators who were both MONE personnel and by the supervising team.

The teachers were responsible for the implementation of the Program in groups and for the supervision of it in the homes. Thus, while the teachers ran the group meetings, they also made home visits and observed the mother while working with the child. The aim of the home visits was to ensure correct implementation of the Program with the child. The teachers attended a two-level training seminar, conducted by the Foundation staff, each lasting 10 days. During the training seminars, the teachers learned about the basic principles of the implementation of the Program and experienced the group meeting process through role playing. During the training, they were asked to run a group meeting that included the three parts of the Program. The aim here was not just the transmission of information, but also providing the teachers with the opportunity to experience the group process as much as possible.

The province coordinators were responsible for the implementation of the Program in each province until 2007. They worked with at most eight teachers in their province. They were expected to observe the group meetings and supervise each teacher. The province coordinators attended a five-week training seminar run by the Foundation staff and they were given information about the content and the implementation of the Program. In addition, they were trained through role playing and were asked to carry out their roles as coordinators in the simulation of problems they might encounter during
the implementation of the Program. A week also was set to observe the implementation of the Program. Province coordinators were required to join to the teachers’ group in the last week of teacher training. During this week coordinators undertook the role of a coordinator in the activities done with the teachers with whom they were going to work and would learn through this experience.

After the province coordination system was terminated in 2007, all the follow-up and supervision were carried out by the supervision team formed in the Ministry. The Observation and Supervision Team continued the follow-up by visiting the provinces for which they were responsible between 2001 and 2007. This team also was trained by the Foundation staff. Since 2007, follow-up work has been done by e-mail.

- International Implementations of the Mother-Child Education Program

The first implementations of MOCEF started with Turkish emigrant families in Europe. Considering the Turkish emigrants to be the recipients of the implementations abroad had two reasons: To support the emigrant children whose development might be at risk because of environmental conditions and to introduce MOCEP abroad. It is evident that the first reason was more important for MOCEF, being an NGO. Some institutions abroad already were working to provide support to emigrant families and children. The fact that MOCEP was a ready-to-use program the efficacy of which had been proven increased the demand.

The number of Turkish emigrant families is estimated to be four million people in European Union countries, 300,000 in Northern Europe, 200,000 in the Middle East, and 150,000 in Australia (http://ec.europa.eu/education/news/news490_en.htm). The findings revealed that the first generation that went to the European Union countries did not know the language of the country, had lower education levels and preferred to live in closed family environments, by isolating themselves from society. The life styles and educational levels of these families affected the education and adaptation of their children. The countries which they emigrated to did not provide the necessary policies, so there were problems in adaptation. Especially the second and the third generation were unable to receive education in their mother tongue; they have poor Turkish and are not good at the language of the country in which they reside, all leading to problems in communication both in the family and at school. Under these conditions, the children cannot be successful at school and they are mostly sent to “special” education classes (Arayıcı, 2003).

Families are regarded to be a major component in assuring adaptation. Women in these families are not integrated into the society. Therefore, there is a need for activities to introduce them to society. Another problem resulting from the family is the fact that they may have different expectations for boys and girls regarding education and life
The children become alienated from their culture and language during adolescence, which results in more conflicts with families (Arayıcı, 2003; Crepeau, 2004).

Parenting, child rearing practices and intra-family relationships are indicated to be important in the education and adaptation of emigrant children (Birman & Taylor-Ritzler, 2007; Moon, Kang, & An, 2009; Roopnarine, Krishnakumar, Metindogan, & Evans, 2006). Calzada, Brotman, Huang, Bat-Chava, and Kingston (2009) reported that the adaptation of the families to the new culture influences the children’s behavior. These authors emphasize the importance of this fact in designing the content of the intervention programs. In addition, it is evident that these emigrant children have different problems at school than those of their counterparts (Wells, 2000).

The Mother-Child Education Foundation started its activities abroad with the Mother-Child Education Program in order to intervene in the early ages to counteract the basic problems mentioned above and to optimize the family resources.

Apart from Western Europe, the implementations in Saudi Arabia have served different purposes as well as those mentioned above. The target population in this country was families who were already sending their children to the schools of the Ministry of National Education or who had the intention to. MOCEP, in this country, had the aim of consolidating the cognitive skills and to support the mothers to acquire skills to foster the development of their children. The Program was important for the mothers here from the social aspect, too. However, in Bahrain, attending a mother-child education program in their native language was more important.

The international implementations of MOCEP continue in two different ways: the Mother-Child Education Program (CEP and MSP) and only the Mother Support Program (MSP). The Family Planning part is not covered separately, as in Turkey, but is discussed only in two meetings in the Mother-Child Education Program.

Implementations of the Mother-Child Education Program in Belgium started in Gent in the 1998-1999 education year in cooperation with the Gent Turkish Women’s Association. These applications continued until 2002 and after that only the Mother Support Program started to be implemented. Although the Mother Support Program was translated in Flemish, it is not widely used in this language. Starting from 2004, cooperation has been made with the Gent Adaptation Center.

The second implementation of the Mother-Child Education Program started in Brussels, again in the 1998-1998 academic year, in cooperation with the Belgium Turkish Women’s Association. The Mother Support Program is also implemented in some of the groups in Brussels.

The applications in Switzerland started in 2007, as a result of the attention shown by the Turkish Consulate General of Geneva. The programs have been applied in Wintertur, Schafffesen, Bern and Lozan and they continue by decreasing in number.
Only the Mother Support Program has been implemented in Bremen, Germany, since 2000-2001. The first collaboration started with the Migrantinnenrat, and since 2003, the Program has been implemented in collaboration with the Red Cross. In addition, the Mother Support Program started to be implemented in Berlin in 2010.

In Bahrain, the translated version of the Mother-Child Education Program was implemented in Arabic in 2002 in collaboration with the Bahrain Child Association. Since 2003, the Program has been implemented together with the Red Crescent.

In Jordan, teachers were trained in collaboration with Jordan UNICEF and the National Council for Family Affairs and only the CEP was applied in 2004 and 2005, within the framework of the Better Parenting Initiative.

The Mother-Child Education Program will start for the first time in Lebanon in 2010, in a Palestine Refugie Camp, in collaboration with the ARC-Arab Resource Collective.

In Saudi Arabia, the Program was initiated in the 2006-2007 education year with the involvement of the Education Attaché of the Embassy of Riyadh. Both the Mother-Child Education Program and the Mother Support Program are implemented in Turkish. The programs are applied to Turkish families in four different provinces: Riyadh, Dammam, Jidda and Medina. These provinces had Turkish schools that were affiliated to MONE and this played a substantial role in the choice of these provinces.

In Saudi Arabia, the Mother-Child Education Program has been applied in Al Qassem since 2006 and in Al Nahda since 2008 education year. Both of these implementations were in Arabic and were realized by the institution with which MOCEF made collaboration in Bahrain.

In France, the first implementation of the Mother-Child Education Program was carried out in 2000-2001 in collaboration with the l’Accort Association. Later, there was collaboration with the Elele Migrations et Cultures De Turquie Association. The Mother Support Program was applied together with this Association from time to time.

The implementations in Cyprus have been very recent and started in 2009 in collaboration with the Cyprus University and the Ministry of Education of the Northern Cyprus Turkish Republic. In Cyprus, only the Mother Support Program has been implemented.

Only the mothers who participated in the Mother-Child Education Program were included in the research that was conducted abroad. The numbers related to the international implementations of the Mother-Child Education Program can be seen in Table 3.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Mothers</th>
<th>Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>France (Accort)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>France (Accort)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>CEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>CEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia (Al Qassem)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia (Al Qassem)</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Belgium (Brussels)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia (Riyad, Cidde, Dammam, Medine)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>MOCEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia (Al Nahda)</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>MOCEP (in Arabic)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>1,891</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Number of Mothers</td>
<td>Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>France (Elele)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent)</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent)</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent)</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent)</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent)</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>MSP (7-11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Belgium (Gent-Brussels)</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>MSP (7-11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia (Riyadh, Jidda, Medina)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>MSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>2,097</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE AIM OF THE RESEARCH

The aim of the research was to learn about the experiences of mothers regarding the Mother-Child Education Program from their perspective. Short and long-term quantitative evaluations of MOCEP’s first and modified versions had been carried out. These evaluations focused on the outcomes (Bekman, 2003; 2004; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2001; Kağıtçibaşı et al., 2009). There was only one qualitative study carried out with a group in Istanbul (Koçak & Bekman, 2004). The need to do a study that would focus on the process paved the way for this research. In addition, MOCEP has been implemented abroad since 1998 and no evaluations of these implementations had been done.

The aim of the research was to find answers to four basic questions through mothers’ statements.

For whom is the Program effective?
How and why is the Program effective?
What are the effects of the Program?
Do the implementations in different countries reveal variations regarding these three basic questions?

When trying to find an answer to the question of for whom the Program was effective, focus was given to different aspects such as why the mother had attended the Program, what reactions she had received from her family and from the people around her upon her decision to participate, and what she thought about these reactions.

The effects of the Program were approached from two aspects: The expected/direct effects of the Program, and the unexpected/indirect effects.

The question of how and why the Program was effective was analyzed through the experiences of the mothers during the Program. The mothers’ experiences regarding the group process, the teacher and the CEP implementations would reveal what the mother had gone through during the Program. The experiences of the mother while implementing the Program, her feelings, the similarities and differences between what had been discussed in the Program and how she had been brought up, the feedback and support she had received from her family and the people around her were all considered to be factors that contributed to the effectiveness of the Program.
**DESIGN**

### Sample

The sample consisted of 100 volunteer mothers from Turkey, Saudi Arabia, Switzerland, Belgium and Bahrain. The mothers in Turkey and Bahrain were natives living in their own country, whereas the mothers in Belgium, Switzerland and Saudi Arabia were Turkish emigrants.

The mothers in İstanbul lived in two districts, namely Bahçelievler and Maltepe, while the ones in Belgium were from Schaarbeek, Brussels. In Switzerland they lived in Wintertur, Schauffesen and Bern; and in Riyadh and Medina in Saudi Arabia. The mothers in Bahrain came from different cities.

The only criterion to be included in the sample was that the mother had to have participated in MOCEP during the previous two years. However, as the required number could not be reached in Belgium, mothers who had attended the Program more than two years earlier also were included in the sample. Meetings were organized with the mothers in every place and the aim of the research and expectations from them were explained to the mothers. In cases where the required number could not be reached during the first meeting, individual contact was made with the mothers to include them in the sample. In some countries, all the mothers who were eligible to be in the sample, constituted the sample.

### Description of the Sample

#### General

**Age, work and education status**

The mothers were between 22-48 years of age, with an average age of 33. The majority of the mothers (44%) were high school graduates (See Table 4).

The percentage of mothers who were working at the time of the study was 21%, whereas 27% had worked before, but were not working then. Among the working mothers 57% were skilled workers and 42% unskilled. Table 5 reveals the working mothers’ status with respect to their education levels.

**Table 4**  
*Distribution of Mothers’ Education Levels*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle school</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The fathers’ ages ranged between 28 and 52, with an average of 38. The majority of the fathers (47%) were high school graduates (See Table 6). As table 7 displays majority (82%) of the fathers was working. Among these fathers, while 72% were working in skilled jobs, 18% were working in unskilled jobs. Only 10% of the working fathers owned their own business. Table 7 displays the working fathers’ status with respect to their education levels.

### Table 5
**Working Mothers’ Status with Respect to Their Education Levels**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SKILLED</th>
<th></th>
<th>UNSKILLED</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle school</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6
**Distribution of Fathers’ Education Levels**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle school</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>47.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7
**Working Fathers’ Status with Respect to Their Education Levels**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th></th>
<th>Unskilled</th>
<th></th>
<th>Skilled</th>
<th></th>
<th>Employer</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle school</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>50.8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Only two of the families consisted of divorced parents. The majority of the mothers (91%) were attending MOCEP for the first time, whereas 9% had already participated in the Program for their elder children. When the target children’s attendance to preschool was examined, it was seen that 72% had gone to preschool for at least a year, while 7% had attended a play group before the preschool age. Forty-five of the target children in the sample were girls and 55 were boys.

**Differences in the sample with regard to countries**

When the education levels of the mothers among all five countries were taken into consideration, it was seen that the majority of the mothers in Bahrain (65%) and Turkey (60%) were high school graduates, whereas the majority of the mothers in Saudi Arabia (60%) had graduated from primary school. The majority of the mothers in Switzerland and Belgium were either primary school (35%, 45%) or high school graduates (40%, 35%) (See Table 8).

**Table 8**

*Distribution of Education Levels of the Mothers among the Five Countries*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Literate</th>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>Middle School</th>
<th>High School</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When the education levels of the fathers in the sample were compared among the five countries, a similar picture to that of the mothers’ was seen. The majority of the fathers in Saudi Arabia (80%) were primary school graduates, while 50% in Turkey, 83.3% in Bahrain, 63.2% in Switzerland and 56.3% in Belgium had graduated from high school (See Table 9).

**Table 9**

*Distribution of Education Levels of the Fathers among the Five Countries*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Literate</th>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>Middle School</th>
<th>High School</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The majority of the mothers (55%) in Switzerland, Belgium and Bahrain were working at the time of the research or had worked beforehand. The majority of the mothers (65%) in Turkey and Saudi Arabia, on the other hand, had no work experience. Switzerland (40%) and Bahrain (30%) had the highest number of working mothers. Other countries had only 10% working mothers. Among the working mothers, Belgium had the highest percentage (66%) of unskilled workers while Switzerland had the highest percentage (62%) of skilled workers. The percentage of the skilled and unskilled working mothers in Bahrain (50%) and Turkey (50%) were half and half. All the working mothers in Saudi Arabia were unskilled workers.

The time at which the mothers had started working revealed differences between the five countries. Mothers in Belgium were either working or started working after they got married (77.8%), whereas those in Bahrain started working before they got married (72.7%). There was no difference between the numbers of the mothers who started work before or after marriage in Switzerland, Turkey and Saudi Arabia (See Table 10).

Table 10
The Distribution of the Time to Start Work for Mothers among the Five Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Before Marriage</th>
<th>After Marriage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>72.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fathers who worked as skilled workers were 44.5% in Belgium, 53.3% in Bahrain, 60% in Turkey, 70% in Saudi Arabia and 95% in Switzerland. The percentage of the skilled workers was the lowest in Belgium, while 33% of the fathers in Belgium were unemployed (See Table 11).

Table 11
The Distribution of the Work Status for Fathers among the Five Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Unskilled</th>
<th>Skilled</th>
<th>Employer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The migration status of the families in the sample showed variations among countries. The interviews in Belgium, Switzerland and Saudi Arabia were conducted with Turkish mothers and all, except two, had emigrated from Turkey to the country which they were living at that moment. 75% of the mothers in Turkey and 55% of those in Bahrain had immigrated to the city they were living in from another city. Only one mother in Turkey and two mothers in Bahrain had come from another country.

The number of people and children living in the household showed differences among countries. The number of children in the household was 3 on average in Bahrain and Saudi Arabia, whereas there were 2 children on average in Switzerland, Belgium and Turkey. The average for the total number of people living in the household was 7-8 in Bahrain, 5-6 in Saudi Arabia and 4 in Belgium, Switzerland and Turkey.

When the sex of the target children for whom mothers attended the Program was taken into consideration, 65% of those were boys in Switzerland, while boys constituted 60% in Saudi Arabia and 55% in Turkey. The number of boys and girls was equal in Bahrain, whereas the girls in Belgium had a higher percentage (55%) (See Table 12).

Table 12
The Sex of the Target Child among the Five Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Girl</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Boy</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahrain</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Only 7% of the target children for whom the mothers participated in the Program in Switzerland attended a play group before the age of preschool. When the duration of preschool attendance of the target children were taken into account, there were differences among countries. Majority (95%) of the children in Switzerland, Belgium and Bahrain attended a preschool for at least a year, while this number was 60% for Turkey and only 10% for Saudi Arabia.

**Instrument**

The data was collected through semi-structured, in-depth interviews. The interview consisted of 73 open-ended questions for which the order was determined. The interview had different sections. These sections tried to investigate the effects of the Program on
the mother, the experiences of the mother before starting the Program and during the implementation. The mother’s ideas regarding the Program, her experiences in the group process, with the teacher and during CEP implementations, her ideas regarding the information she received were also aimed at. Finally, for the mothers living abroad, questions regarding the benefits of the Program specific to them were included in the interview (See the Appendix).

The pilot testing was carried out by the actual interviewers, which enabled the training of the interviewers as well.

The interview had been modified three times during the testing before taking its final form. Individual interviews were conducted mainly at each mother’s home. In very few cases where the mother had difficulty in giving the interview at home, the interviews were realized at different places (at the Association, school or at the Office of the Education Attaché as that was the case in Saudi Arabia). The interviews lasted about 1.5 to 2.5 hours and all were recorded.

**Procedure**

The preparations for the research took six months. The formulation of the interview questions, testing the interviews and training the interviewers constituted this preparation phase. Data collection first started in Belgium and Turkey, followed by Switzerland and Bahrain. Saudi Arabia was the last country for data collection. The data collection lasted 15 days, except in Bahrain and Turkey. There were two interviewers in Belgium, Switzerland and Saudi Arabia and each conducted two interviews daily. There was only one interviewer in İstanbul and Bahrain and data collection lasted one month. After all the data had been gathered, all the interviews were transcribed and the analysis started.

**Analysis**

Basic meaningful categories were formed through a detailed reading of each interview. Then, data from five countries and 100 mothers were classified taking these categories into consideration. Revision of the basic categories was realized, leading to subcategories. Interviews from each country were encoded in two steps and basic questions the data might respond to in all countries were formulated. Simultaneously, the conceptual framework of the research was built. The categories and the subcategories were further revised and modified taking the conceptual framework into consideration. Finally, data from five countries were brought together within this framework.
RESULTS

The results will be presented taking the four research questions into account:
- For whom does the Program work?
- What are the effects of the Program?
- Why and how does the Program work?
- Do the implementations in different countries reveal variations regarding these three basic questions?

The statements of the mothers with respect to these questions will be presented in basic and subcategories. Attention is given to include data from each country in the subcategories. However, when a category does not display data for a country, it should mean that no relevant data from that country were obtained. In cases where the subcategories contain more than one statement for a country, it points to different aspects of the same data.

- Who Participates in the Mother-Child Education Program?

One of the fundamental aims of this research was to find out who participates in and benefits from the Mother-Child Education Program. The results of the quantitative research show that the Program worked and was effective. However, there was no information about for whom the Program was effective, apart from the demographic information. In fact, it is important to know for whom an intervention program is effective.

In order to find the answer to this question, it was decided to analyze the statements of the mothers about why they had attended the Program and what they had gone through just before their participation.

The responses to who participates and benefits were covered under four categories: “to raise a child in a better way,” “to be better equipped,” “the family is already interested,” and “to find a job.”

What the mother had gone through just before attending the Program is presented taking into consideration the positive and negative reactions of the husband and the people around her, as well as the ideas and feelings of the mother about these reactions.

- Reasons for Participation

To raise the child in a better way and to be better equipped were the most frequently mentioned reasons for attending the Program among all countries. It can be seen from these statements that the mothers were open to change since they wished to raise their children in a better way and to have better parenting skills.
Why did the mother participate in MOCEP?

- To raise her child in a better way
- To be better equipped
- The family is already interested
- To find job opportunities

To raise her child in a better way

- I did not start the Program for myself in the first place. I went there thinking about my child. I have always wanted my child to be successful. I have always wanted to support him cognitively. I started the Program believing that I might educate myself and that I could be of more help to my children. (19.tur)

- Our children are very important to us. Raising them well is of utmost importance. Everything depends on the family, really, everything depends on the parents. In fact, the child looks up to the mother and the father as role models. (15.sw)

- I participated in the Program to educate my child, I wasn’t expecting something for myself as this is MOCEF, mother-child education; in other words, it is about the mother educating her child. However, it turns out that the mother understands her shortcomings while educating her child and makes an effort to educate herself as well. (5.bel)

- The reason for my participation was the kids. I would benefit from everything there. I got more ambitious. I went there for one thing, but I got two, both for myself and for my child. (15.bah)

- I wanted to make a contribution and give something to my child. It was a change for me, too, for the family members, for my husband as well. I was not expecting these. I am educating my child. I believe that my child will say one day, “It is a good thing that my mom taught me.” I want my child to continue his education; I want him to know everything in life. (11.sar)

To be better equipped

- I have always felt something missing in me, thinking that I cannot be a good mother. Motherhood and love exist in every mother, in all the living things, but you can be an
uneducated mother or a knowledgeable one. I have always sought to do my best for my children. My expectation from the Program was to find out what else I could do for my children. (12.tur)

- I thought I might have shortcomings. I realized that thinking what I know is enough for me was wrong. I participated to see my mistakes, to be a better mother and wanted to see what more I could do for my child. (15.sw)

- In fact, it has always been my dream to be a compromising mother with my child. I have always wanted him to come and talk to me about anything all the time without any hesitation. I have always wanted to be such a mother and MOCEP supported it. I was aware that I would learn useful things about my child’s education because I knew what the Program was about. I knew that I would learn about my mistakes. As I said, you believe in something much more when you see the book or the teacher rather than just hearing about something; you say yes, this is the rule. (8.bel)

- We were raised up in quite different conditions than our kids. However, I want to be a better mother and an understanding mother; I always want to be by their side. Let’s help them learn and develop. (1.sar)

**The family was already interested**

Some mothers stated that they had always been curious and conscious about child development and education, and that they participated in the Program in order to become more knowledgeable. These mothers emphasized that they had always read books about child education and had been sensitive to the child and to his/her education. They stated that they had already known most of the information presented during the meetings, but added that they were more open for implementation after hearing about them in the Program.

- I have always given importance to these, the education I got in Turkey, what I experienced in my family, the attention they have shown me have all contributed. I have seen around more oppressive families, they give less importance especially to girls; they are not sent to school. These have all affected my way of thinking. I was lucky to have had such an education. Everybody knows that these things are important to me, that I am persistent and that I do what I decide to do. (3.bel)

- As my education is not complete, I have always tried to educate my children. It was not difficult for me, I have always been interested. Besides, I had raised a child before, so I was knowledgeable, I just completed what was missing. (11.bel)

**To find job opportunities**

On the other hand, there were some mothers who participated in the Program thinking that it would provide them with job opportunities.
- You never know what might come up in the future so if I have to, I might be a kindergarten teacher after completing this Program. (6.tur)

- The diploma the Program gives, it has changed a lot; they accepted my diploma and I started working. (10.bah)

- As I have said, I want to work. I do not know for sure, I might work in a kindergarten or a preschool, I would behave accordingly. I do not have much of a problem with kids, or to put it in another way, I do not have problems in communication with children other than mine. (13.sar)

### Reactions Received Before Starting the Program

The reactions mothers received when they decided to participate in the Program were expected to be influential on their decisions. Therefore, this section will cover the content of these reactions and mothers’ ideas about them. The mothers stated that they had received reactions both from their spouses and from the people around them. Mothers and fathers, mother-in-laws and father-in-laws, siblings, neighbors, friends and preschool teachers can be counted among the people around the mother. The reactions before starting the Program can be classified as “positive” and “negative” ones.

- **NEGATIVE**
  - The people around
    - Reactions involving condescension
    - Reactions stating that it was a waste of time
  - Spouse
- **POSITIVE**
  - The people around
    - Support in the general sense
    - Support as it would be beneficial to the child
    - Support as the mother would socialize
  - Spouse

Mother’s ideas about the negative reactions:
- Believed her own decision was important and right
- Believed what she was doing would be good for her child
- It did not matter as she would get information
- She hesitated

Mother’s ideas about the positive reactions:
- Thought she was supported
- Thought she was motivated
- Felt more confident
- Thought it was a confirmation that she was doing something right

The reactions mothers received when they decided to participate in the Program were expected to be influential on their decisions. Therefore, this section will cover the content of these reactions and mothers’ ideas about them. The mothers stated that they had received reactions both from their spouses and from the people around them. Mothers and fathers, mother-in-laws and father-in-laws, siblings, neighbors, friends and preschool teachers can be counted among the people around the mother. The reactions before starting the Program can be classified as “positive” and “negative” ones.
Negative Reactions Received from the People around Her

The negative reactions the mother received from the people around her were mainly reactions not approving of the mother’s participation in the Program in general. Their disapproval was evident in their condescending statements, stressing that motherhood could not be learned at school and that she, being a mother at a certain age, should already have this knowledge. There were also statements about the belief that participation in this group was a waste of time and that the mother could use this time more effectively.

Reactions involving condescension

- My neighbor asked me where I was going to and I said to MOCEP, mother-child education. Her reply was, “Can’t you educate your child?” My family asked what mother-child education meant, what it was like. I told them that we have become mothers, but that we do not know how to mother in the correct way. (9.tur)

- The elder people in the family, my parent-in-laws said, “Are you a new mother? Will you educate your child according to what they say; will you learn how to raise a child from them?” For example, I had a friend who had a newborn baby. She said, “What is the use? What will you learn from them that you already do not know?” (16.sw)

- I have heard people say, “We were mothers too, but we did not have any education for that. What is the use? If it is about mothering, we are all mothers.” (8.bel)

- Some people denied saying that they knew how to raise a child, that they were parents. (2.bah)

- They said that I was 25 and asked me whether I believed someone could educate me at this age. They said that I was too old, they laughed at me, made fun of me, and they were even against it. They tried to convince my family that it was useless. (14.sar)

Reactions stating that it was a waste of time

- They said, “Your two kids have grown up, what good will it do now? What will you do there? You hurry to go there, but you are spending a day for nothing there.” (13.tur)

- They believed it was useless to attend a course to raise a child. “Instead of killing your time like that, go to work or do some housework,” they would say. Others asked me about the use of it, they believed it was a waste of time, and added that I would not be able to get a job after the course. (1.bel)

- Of course, there were some people against it. They said that we should prefer a course for the Koran, that it would be more useful, that this Program was a waste of time. It was a pharmacist here who told this. People from Bahrain as well as Sudanese said that Koran classes were much better. (1.bah)
When the content of the negative reactions was evaluated, a different view emerged in Bahrain. The negative reactions in Bahrain mainly resulted from the traditional place of the woman in society. They reflected the idea that a woman’s primary job is to stay and work at home and that her leaving the child and going out is not welcome.

- Leaving the house for the Program would be difficult as my family was very conservative. I was a housewife, I was in this conservative family and they could not accept a woman leaving her house to go somewhere. They showed their reaction by saying, “How can you leave your husband, what will you do with the kids?” (3.bah)

- Some of my neighbors asked me where I was going without my children. I said that I was going there to learn, to get some knowledge. They were anxious about who would take care of my children and I replied that my elder daughter was old enough and I went to the Program. (14.bah)

Negative Reactions Received from the Husband

The negative reactions received from the spouses mainly reflected a concern that the woman would not be able to fulfill her responsibilities at home. Their concern was about who would look after the younger children, what would happen if the children were left alone at home and what would happen if the mother failed to keep the order at home. The negative reactions of spouses stressed the fact that the mother did not need to attend such a program. The women in Saudi Arabia, on the other hand, had to be escorted to the Program by their spouses or another solution had to be found as women are not allowed to go out without a man. This was reported to be an important reason why the spouses showed some resistance about the mothers’ participation in the Program since they were reluctant to accompany the mother to the meeting every week.

Reactions reflecting concern

- He said at first that I could not do it. “What will you do with the kids, it will be a problem,” he said. Then, I went 3-4 times; he asked me whether I would continue. I said that I would. He was only anxious about with whom I would leave my daughter. (13.tur)

- He did not want me to go actually. He said it would be tiring and asked me if it was worth the effort. (5.sw)

- At first, he didn’t give permission, but then he did. I said, “You forbade me to work. I got married and could not continue my education. Let me try this.” I said it before they called me for the Program and later I said that they had called and that the Program was starting. I said, “Why not give it a try, maybe I won’t like it.” Then I started the Program
and told him what we talked about and that I was not the only one, that there was a group and the other women were like us, from villages and lived in cities. That gave me courage. He said yes then. (15.bah)

- I really enjoyed the Program and I was happy. I registered but my husband said that was not right. I told him to see the results first. I did not go out much and he was used to that. My whole life was at home. I had never worked and every day was the same. As a husband, he had always found everything ready when he came from work, a meal was ready, and the house was clean. He believed this would be lost and that’s why he was against my participation in the beginning. I proved that he was wrong, so he had to accept the idea. (20.bah)

- My husband first opposed it. I said, “You will take me there. All I want from you is just one day in the whole week, you will take me there.” Actually if it had been in the morning, I could not have come. His opposition was not because he did not want me to learn, he was coming home tired and he would not be able to rest and sleep if he were to take me there. He was taking me there and was going to work from there. That was tiring for him. Otherwise, he would surely want me attend the Program to be more beneficial to our kids. (10.sar)

- I have heard the Program from a friend. She was thinking of registering and gave me a brochure. I talked to my husband and at first he didn’t want it. “What is it like? What will you learn? Don’t you know how to be a mother” were his comments. Then I said that I wanted to go, that I was old enough to separate good from bad. At first, he was suspicious about what they would teach us. His friends affected him badly as well. I tried so hard to convince him, we had quite a dispute. Then I went. Later, when I told him about the topics discussed, when he saw its effects on children, he forced me to go the second year. (6.sar)

Mother’s Ideas about the Negative Reactions She Received

The mothers’ ideas about the negative reactions received provided valuable information about who participates in this Program. When the mothers were asked about how much they were influenced by the negative reactions, their statements indicated that these reactions did not affect their decisions negatively since their own decisions were important for them rather than others’ reactions and they believed what they were doing would be good for their child.

Believed her own decision was important and right

- I did not pay any attention to that because my ideas are very important. (19.tur)

- First you hesitate; you say “Can they be right?” as everybody says it. However, you believe doing the right thing and you participate. (11.tur)

- The reactions were not important to me because what counts for me is whether it would be beneficial for me. Even if others had been against it, I still would have gone. (1.sw)
- I did not take them seriously; my decision was important. I didn’t care about what they thought. I was thinking, “I will continue going there no matter what they thought.” (3.bel)

- I first thought about it, thought that I should not go as my husband didn’t want me to. But then I said my husband does not want me to go out. That’s typical of him. He doesn’t want me to go out even if it is something useful. He wants me to stay at home all the time, but it’s not possible, a woman should go out and breathe. (17.bah)

- I felt that they didn’t want me to get information, to be skilled, that was how I felt. Then, I felt like going there and being successful. My ideas haven’t changed, they said so but I wanted to participate more, I was happier. (20.sar)

**Believed what she was doing would be good for her child**

- I was not affected at all as I knew that the Program would be useful both for me and my child. Even if I had already known the topics, it would have been a revision for me. It is not possible for someone to know everything and it gets better by revision. (20.tur)

- Negative reactions did not affect me much because I knew that MOCEP would be good for my children. I continued despite negative reactions. (20.sw)

- I never forget replying, “Yes, I am going there to be a teacher, to be the teacher of my child.” I could not become a real teacher and get a diploma, but I attended the Program to be the teacher of my child. My reply to those giving negative reactions was to tell them that they should continue being narrow-minded. I always heard them say those things behind me, but I did not take them into consideration. I only became more ambitious to learn. (9.bel)

- My friends at work told me not to go. I said that I should as it would be good for my kids, it would help them have good manners. (7.bah)

- I told them that I had an only child and there is no age for education. I added that I wanted to get this education. I laughed actually because I didn’t care about those people. I wasn’t bothered by their negative statements because they weren’t that important. (14.sar)

**It did not matter as she would get information**

Knowing that they would get information about child development and education in the Program was an important factor in ignoring the negative reactions.

- What others talk about doesn’t affect me much if I have more important knowledge at hand. (4.tur)

- I did not think about anything. I would continue if it was good, and wouldn’t continue if it wasn’t, but I knew I would so I gave it a try. (1.bah)

- When the people around made fun of me, I thought about it for a moment but then I laughed at them as I would get some information. (15.sar)
She hesitated

Of course, there are some mothers who said that they hesitated upon hearing negative reactions, but still they did not drop out.

- When people ask you, “Why are you going there? Don’t you know how to raise a kid?” one feels bad. You take a step forward, but meet with obstacles and these diminished my enthusiasm. You start having doubts, doubts about whether it would be worth it or not, whether you would see the benefits or whether it is for nothing. (17.sw)

- It made me think, “Am I really going there for nothing? Will I actually learn something there?” (12.bel)

Positive Reactions Received from the People around Her

The positive reactions, like the negative ones, mainly came from the people around the mother and the spouses. In general, these statements reflected support since participation in the Program was perceived as doing something good for the child and a motivation for the mother to get socialized.

Support in the general sense

Some of the positive reactions the mother received from the people around her reflected contentment about her participation in the Program and support in the general sense about her attendance.

- I told my relatives or the people around me that I was starting the Mother-Child Education Program. They all supported me and liked the idea. They said “Well-done.” (3.tur)

- I talked to the preschool teachers. They were glad. They are German and Swiss. They also said that this course was very beneficial. (14.sw)

- My father is not empty-headed and when I told him that I was attending this Program his reaction was very positive. Thinking that my family would support me and knowing about their positive approach might have helped me take this decision of participation. (15.sw)

- My parents-in-law asked me what this Program was about. When I explained them, they liked it and told me to take part. (8.bel)

- One of our neighbors told me about the Program and supported me to go. My mother and my sisters also supported my participation. (11.bah)

- Some people liked it. I was telling about the Program to my relatives and sister in Turkey, they were listening to me enthusiastically. I was talking to some of my friends here as well. Some told me that they would have liked to go but that they couldn’t. They believed we were doing something good. (7.sar)
Support as it would be beneficial to the child

There were reactions emphasizing the importance of attending a Program that would be beneficial to the child and that would help the mother to become more socially integrated.

- When I first started the Program, they all congratulated me because my close friends have elder children and they had not attended such a Program. When I told them about it, they liked it. My child’s Swiss teacher was surprised to hear that such a program was carried out here. They were glad, actually surprised, that there was such a Program. (2.sw)

- My friend was attending MOCEP and she told my mother-in-law about it. She said it was a very good Program and asked me to attend as well. Then, my mother-in-law told me to take part and said that I was beating my daughter a lot. She supported my participation and so I attended. (2.bel)

- The elder people in the family liked the idea, they approved it. They supported me by saying that I would learn a lot of things and that I would know better how to behave to children. (17.bah)

Support as the mother would socialize and improve herself

- My parents supported my participation strongly. When I was single, I was very active, open and took part in many things. After I got married, I became somewhat introverted because of my husband. But my parents told me to attend this Program. (2.tur)

- The elder people in the family and my neighbor welcomed the idea. One of my neighbors told me to go and added that it would be a change for me rather than being at home all day long and that I would learn new things. My mother said that I was doing something good. (3.sw)

- I told my parents in Turkey and they said, “Do something, don’t waste your time.” Because the Program was in Turkish, they reacted positively. (12.bel)

- My sister supported me and forced me to attend. “Go there once, you live between four walls,” she said. I was convinced to give it a try. “If I don’t like it, I won’t continue,” I said to myself. I went there and thank God, I felt I was waiting for the next week to come. (15.bah)

- My mother only said, “It will be a good social activity, well-done,” because she didn’t know what we were learning in the Program. She doesn’t live with us so she only said, “It must have been a change for you.” There was no one else to comment. (15.sar)

- My father supported me a lot. My parents, my sisters and especially my elder brother live in Istanbul. He said, “You didn’t get the necessary education earlier so do it now. There are Programs like that here as well. It won’t do any harm, you will learn many things.” Actually, I had already made up my mind; I didn’t take anybody’s permission. (14.sar)
Positive Reactions Received from the Husband

The spouses supported mothers’ participation as their children would receive some education. The most important reason for the husband’s support and positive reaction was the mother’s doing something useful for the child. Mothers reported that their spouses supported them as they realized the need for a change in the mother-child relationship. Similar to the reactions of the people around, the spouses believed that attending this Program would help the mother socialize.

**Support as she would educate the child**

- He didn’t say anything, he told me to attend. We couldn’t send our child to preschool and MOCEP provides a similar education. My husband was happy about that. (2.tur)

- Normally he would ask about anything, would try to learn more, but as he knew that this was about children and that it would be beneficial for him, he told me to take part. (4.sw)

- He really wanted me to participate. He said, “You will improve yourself; you will learn how to behave and look after children.” (19.sw)

- He was very positive about it. He said, “As long as it is beneficial for the children, you can attend the Program. The housework can be done any time.” All I received was positive reactions. I really didn’t receive any negative reactions. (15.bel)

- He supported my participation. He especially said, “If it is about child education, go listen and then apply it.” He was always supportive. (7.bah)

- He was suspicious at first. He wanted to know what it was like. I said that I didn’t know much, but that it was about educating children. He told me to participate. He said, “I hope you will stop shouting at and beating the children, stop the violence and learn to talk to them.” He didn’t oppose, he has always supported me. (14.sar)

**Support as the mother would socialize**

- My husband is very open-minded about activities because he knows that I had become introverted. I was passive at home. My husband wanted me to be more extroverted and when I asked him whether to take part or not, he said “You have been there. If you liked it, why hesitate, go.” (7.tur)

- My husband wanted it, I wanted it. In fact, if he hadn’t said yes, I wouldn’t have attended the Program. We talked about it together. He told me that such a milieu would be good for me as well. We discussed that I had no friends, no social milieu and that it would be good both for me and for the kids. He also supported me. (13.sw)

- My husband usually likes my taking part in these things. He wanted it a lot so that I could open up and change. (13.bel)
- My husband realized that I was bored and depressed and the psychologist also proposed it so he was very supportive. He wanted me to go wherever I wanted if that would make me happy and relaxed. (1.bel)

- When I told my husband about the Program, he said yes. He had always supported me on things like that, like the sewing course. He likes my attending these sorts of things and is supportive. (9.bah)

- Both my husband and my children were very supportive. He wanted me to take part. He said, “It will be a change for you, you are home all day, you never go out, and you will meet new people.” (20.sar)

Mother’s Ideas about the Positive Reactions She Received

The mothers reported that all these positive reactions from the people around and from the spouses before attending the Program supported and motivated them. With this support, the mother started having more confidence in herself and her decisions and was convinced that she was doing something right.

Thought she was supported

- The reactions of my family are very important. My mother’s positive reaction means she will look after my child. That was very important to me. My husband needed to have a positive stance so that I could attend the Program happily and comfortably. They are all very important to me. (16.tur)

- I was very happy when everyone told me to participate. It was a joy. (7.bah)

- It is so nice to have support. One feels special, feels that she is worth it. I received acknowledgement. (13.sar)

Thought she was motivated

- It motivated me. I was sure that I was doing something good. I attended the Program with this confidence. (14.tur)

- I was happy, of course. It motivated me to take part more. (11.sw)

- It motivated me to participate more enthusiastically. (19.sw)

- A positive reaction gives you courage, in the first place, to do it. (14.bel)

- What was important to me was my husband’s permission. This, of course, increased my desire. (15.bah)

- I was really joyful; I had a strong wish to attend. (3.sar)

Felt more confident

- It makes you happy and boosts your confidence. When they react like that, I feel happier and eager. (10.tur)
- It is evident that when you get support, you do whatever it is with more enthusiasm and confidence. (17.sw)

- I was happy because he supported me. When my husband supported me, I was attending with more joy; I had more confidence in myself. The other people don’t count as long as my husband tells me that I can do this. (20.bel)

- It made me powerful and courageous to continue. Nobody was against it. (5.bah)

- It felt nice. I regained my confidence; I believed that I was doing something worthwhile. (8.sar)

Thought it was confirmation that she was doing something right

- It made me happy as it proved that I was not doing anything wrong. (9.sw)

- I decided about attendance believing that it would be good for me. But when I received supportive reactions from other people, I told myself that I really was doing something right. It was a confirmation of the rightness of my decision. I was proud of myself for doing something good. (8.bel)

- I saw that what I did was right and useful, it made me happy. I had nothing to do. I had felt that everything was over for me, but this was a new beginning for me. (1.bel)
**Effects**

When the effects of the Program were analyzed, the mothers’ statements revealed that the expected changes took place as a result of the participation in the Program. These changes were the “direct effects” as they were in line with the purposes of the Program. On the other hand, mothers reported some changes that were not among the aims of the Program and those changes were the “indirect effects.”

**Direct Effects**

Direct effects were reported on children, on mothers and on the mother-child relationship.

**Changes in the Child**

The mothers’ statements indicated changes in the social, physical and cognitive development of the child. The changes in the child are summarized in Table 13.
Table 13
Changes in the Child

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes in the child</th>
<th>Cognitive Development</th>
<th>Socio-Emotional Development</th>
<th>Physical Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Learned the concepts</td>
<td>- Had more self-confidence</td>
<td>- Better small muscle development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Had better concentration</td>
<td>- Was better organized and more responsible</td>
<td>- Gave importance to nutrition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Learned how to read and write, improved story telling</td>
<td>- Understood other people better</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was better prepared for school</td>
<td>- More social</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Had a better relationship with the family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Change in the Cognitive Development

The mothers stated that changes in the cognitive development of the child had mainly resulted from the implementations of the Cognitive Education Program of MOCEP. The activities of the Cognitive Education Program were regarded by the mothers as preparation for school. They stated that the child had acquired the basic skills in cognitive development that would be necessary for being prepared for school. These were skills like learning new concepts, colors, shapes, and numbers. The mothers also said that the child’s concentration improved as a result of doing the CEP activities.

Learned the concepts

- She learned the numbers and letters. She had already been learning them at school but, when we went over them at home, she learned them better. (3.tur)

- Generally Turkish people are seen as foreigners here, as they don’t know much. They can’t attend a normal school; they absolutely put an obstacle in the way. For example, they said that my son wasn’t good at those shapes, present in the CEP as well. My children actually learned those shapes thanks to the CEPs. They learned to connect the dots. We really had a rewarding result. (13.sw)

- He didn’t know concepts like finding the difference between two pictures and geometric shapes. He learned about squares and rectangles through the CEPs. When he sees them now, he says, “Mom isn’t this square?” In this way, I can see that he can apply this knowledge to his everyday life, he uses it. (8.bel)

- Below, over, same, different, he tells the differences himself. He says, “We are boys, you are girls.” When having dinner, if there is a different glass on the table, he talks about it. These attracted my attention. (5.bah)
My child didn’t know about shapes like triangles or circles. When I want something from her, a piece of paper, for example, she can say, “Which one, the square or the triangle one?” She can now perceive these things. When I tell her to bring the round table cloth, she says, “Mom, that’s circular in shape.” She didn’t know that before. I could teach her many things through CEPs, especially colors, shapes and ways of behaving. (19.sar)

**Had better concentration**

- I noticed that he had poor concentration. He has started to concentrate better. (4.tur)
- They were asked questions about the tales and stories. They sort of helped improve his concentration. When I tell him a story and ask about it, he understands what I am telling him, but before he didn’t pay that much attention. (5.sw)
- He started to concentrate better. The CEPs had many things like paying attention to similar shapes. He started understanding better. (11.bah)
- His concentration improved, I believe. He is more vigilant when he sees things. His concentration improved. (10.sar)

**Learned letters and improved telling a story**

Some children were reported to have learned the letters and even reading and writing. Furthermore, the mothers reported improvement in skills like listening and comprehension of a story, looking at the picture and telling a story, as well as answering questions after listening to a text.

- She didn’t know how to write the numbers, she learned that. She learned how to write her ABC’s, she can do it herself. (10.tur)
- After MOCEP she can tell a story really well. She likes telling stories by looking at the pictures. She learned it there. (3.tur)
- He learned how to read and write before starting school. (8.sw)
- She tries to understand the stories better. She listened and learned a lot. She learned to listen to the stories a bit because she couldn’t answer the questions, she was always giving excuses. Other things were easy for her. (9.sw)
- A book every 15 days was like a present for her. She was looking forward to the day she would get the book. She got used to reading books. She learned how to write, the letters and how to tell a story, where to stop. It was beneficial. (19.bel)
- The story books helped them like reading; they are still reading and they even ask questions about the story. (9.bah)
- Her talent at making up a story improved, looking at the pictures and planning something. She can’t read, we are reading to her, but she knows what is meant through the pictures. (13.sar)
Was better prepared for school

- It helped a lot especially with his lessons. They were giving report cards and his report cards began to be better after starting MOCEP. Also, the teacher informs us about what he is doing at school. When I look at them, I see that they are almost the same as what we do in the CEPs. It really helped in that respect. His report cards are good. (4.bel)

- They learned about geometric shapes. The preschool did not give much attention to that. They learned it from the Program and it helped them at school. The Program supported their math, they improved in Arabic, and they learned to listen by listening to the stories. (2.bah)

- Following MOCEP and the CEP, I was very relaxed when she started primary school. I didn’t have any problems with my daughter. The teacher always says good things about her because she learned how to hold the pen and behave, she learned everything. She even learned how to use a book, how to open up a book, look at the pictures first and think and then she understands it better when she reads it. She understands that much better now. (9.sar)

Change in the Socio-Emotional Development

The mothers expressed that there had been changes in the socio-emotional development of the child as well. The child had realized that s/he could accomplish certain things while studying the CEPs, which might have helped him/her feel confident. The child’s being more responsible and better organized should be seen as a result of studying the CEPs regularly. The socio-emotional activities in CEP and the story books are reported to have helped the child to better understand other people’s emotions and ideas. In addition, some of the topics discussed in the Mother Support Program such as showing the outcome of a behavior and how a behavior is perceived by the other person might have helped the enhancement of these skills in children. The difference in the child’s relationships within the family could be the result of the positive changes in mother-child and father-child relationships reported after attending the Program.

Had more self-confidence

- She realized that she was successful at the CEP, that she achieved certain things, she had more confidence. (14.tur)

- She doesn’t behave as aggressively as she used to, she speaks in a lower tone. I believe that she has more confidence probably because I praise and motivate her whenever she does something well. (9.sw)

- She has more self-confidence. (17.bel)

- I noticed that she didn’t use to have confidence when she was together with other kids
but now her self-confidence has improved. She goes and plays with them, I can’t stop her now. (15.bah)

- Her feelings and her self-confidence have improved. She made friends easily. She could express herself and felt productive. She felt herself better, more qualified than the others; she talked and expressed herself, played games. She learned a lot. (15.sar)

**Was better organized and more responsible**

- Before the Program I would run after her with a plate in my hand. Now when I set the table, I tell her either to eat or wait for the next meal. Now she does eat. She wouldn’t go to the toilet, I would force her to, but now she does it all by herself. She cleans up her room; she would play “being a teacher” and make a mess of all the books and pencils. When I told her to tidy up, she wouldn’t and would say that she was very tired. Now it is different. “You played this game; you have to tidy up before passing onto the next one.” She learned to be better organized. (13.tur)

- He learned how to tidy up his toys and sometimes he makes his bed himself. He started to look for a similar responsibility from his sister after realizing his own. (4.sw)

- Now there is order in the room. Before she was very untidy, we couldn’t see these doors for the paper. She would put them on the door no matter what I said. Then the teacher told us to let go, told us that she would grow tired of it one day. I stopped nagging and she really stopped. One day I realized that there was nothing on the door; she had put them all away. Now we don’t see it any more. (19.bel)

- This Program enabled her to sleep alone. (18.bah)

- He absolutely cares less about television, but before he wanted to watch television all the time. He would watch television all day; he didn’t want to do anything else. But now when he has homework, he studies. He watches television for an hour, I make him study and send him to bed. (11.sar)

**Understood other people better**

- When he does something rude, when he behaves unkindly, he learned to put himself in the other person’s shoes. When he had pain, he learned to have empathy. He became positive. (4.tur)

- He learned about empathy as a result of the talks during the meetings and the handouts and the CEPs, otherwise this isn’t something that you would normally think. (8.sw)

- He started understanding other people better, started thinking about why elder people said yes or no. (5.bel)

- He wasn’t interested in my facial expressions before the Program, but now he can easily understand when I am sad. He asks me why I am sad, why I cry. He asks about the reasons for my sorrow and I tell him. When he knows that someone is sad, he immediately
goes to that person, tries to make that person happy or tells them he is sorry. He can understand everything from facial expressions, whether someone is angry or happy. (8.sar)

More social

- Before the Program, when we went somewhere he didn’t know, he would cling to me, he would get bored and cry from boredom. Now it is different. When we go somewhere, he sits and talks comfortably, his relationship with his friends is better. He wants to play with his friends. When we go to the park, he asks others to be friends with him. (9.tur)

- She was a bit shy before the Program; she was shy even with the teachers. But now she is social, even the teachers at the preschool are happy about it. (12.bah)

- He didn’t know anything about a cinema or a theatre. He learned that we should be silent in a cinema and that we should get in the queue to pay a bill or in a supermarket. He learned about the places we should queue. He learned all those from the CEPs. (10.sar)

- My son was a little introverted. For example, when he went to the preschool, he would sit in one corner, he wouldn’t sympathize with others. But now it is better both at home and at school. For example, he now talks with the guests who come to our house. (2.sar)

Had a better relationship with the family

- My son is milder to his brother as I shared what we learned at the Program at home. Actually, he has always been reasonable, but he started being more conscious toward his brother. (4.sw)

- She changed for the better toward the family; she got closer to the family. (7.bel)

- They would fight over toys, but now they get along well. When we buy them a toy, they share it. They each want to get something different so that they could play together at home. “You get the crayons, I’ll get the notebook and at home we’ll change.” They help each other. (15.bah)

- She used to play alone, she liked to play alone, but now she plays with his brother. That’s something. (5.sar)

Change in the Physical Development

It can be understood from the mothers’ statements that the children underwent some physical changes as well. As a result of the CEP activities, the children were able to use their small muscles better. The coloring and pencil control/drawing also improved. The children were reported to stay away from unhealthy food by changing their nutrition habits. This might have been due to the group discussions of MSP topics.
Better small muscle development

- She learned better how to hold a pencil. For example, she helps clean the table, she can better hold and grab and she understands that she can manage it. (14.tur)

- He is very good with his hands, drawing a line. He was cutting and gluing, drawing because he liked to. So, these helped him to become better with his hands. (18.sw)

- She wouldn’t completely color inside the shapes, she learned that. Her eye-hand coordination, improved. Drawing properly over the dots and drawing and matching got better. (12.bel)

- He draws and writes; he looks at and writes the letters. He couldn’t draw a tree before but now he can. (19.bah)

- His coloring, holding the scissors and cutting are all good. Sometimes he was cutting and gluing things; he made a house out of matches, and that was quite an improvement. He learned cutting, coloring, painting and making a house. He also learned tracing the numbers. (20.sar)

Gave importance to nutrition

- He liked to drink coke all the time but now never. He absolutely prefers milk instead. Now he doesn’t drink those. He eats whatever is good and healthy whereas before he didn’t. (11.sar)

The Mother’s Contribution to the Change in the Child

It becomes evident that the mothers played a vital role in the changes children were reported to have experienced. They stated that they paid special attention to taking the child out, taking him/her to the parks or to arrange meetings with the friends in order to enhance his/her social development. They tried to create environments where the child could spend time with peers. It is also understood that activities like theatres and cinemas were given more importance. The mothers also tried to spend more time with the child and tried to teach him/her social rules by preparing appropriate environments.

- About social activities, I took her to theatres and cinemas, or to puppet shows once or twice a week. (18.tur)

- Teaching him how to behave in public. For example, he apologizes when he hits a friend unintentionally; he thanks. He does these very nicely, when I give him something he says, “Thank you, Mom.” (11.tur)

- For example, the school picnic was very pleasant, everyone came together there. (14.sw)

- I invite his friends over so that they could play together. I do these to make him socialize. (8.sar)
The mothers also reported paying more attention to encouraging the child more to develop empathy and understanding for others’ feelings and behaviors.

- Putting oneself in someone else’s shoes. For example, he sometimes beats his younger brother. I tell him not to. I tell him that if he had been the younger one, if his brother had held him that way, he would have been hurt. I tell him to put himself in his shoes and in this way I make him think. (11.sw)

Furthermore, the mothers stated that they allowed the child to play with dough, scissors and paints more often in order to support his/her physical development. They also mentioned being more tolerant about the child’s play at home or outside for the development of large muscles and that they tried to create the necessary conditions for that. There were some mothers who paid more attention to the child’s nutrition.

- Playing with dough, I let them play with dough at home. We play games, do sports and jump to strengthen the muscles. (1.tur)

- I started giving him scissors to help his finger muscles develop. I showed him how to hold the scissors. (10.sw)

- I bought a board and board markers so that he could use his hands. Dough, sand, I didn’t use to allow my kids to play with the sand thinking that their clothes would get dirty. (19.bah)

- I let her use scissors. I gave her glue and coins and told her to do whatever she wanted to enhance her hand skills. (18.sar)

- About food, for example, about physical development, when she had a meal rich in carbohydrates one day, the next day, I prepared beans and peas so that she could have balanced nutrition. (3.sar)

Some mothers also talked about creating a learning environment at home. These mothers said they read more books to their child and bought more educational games and toys.

- We empty the dishwasher together. I believe that he learns while doing that because he separates the forks and the spoons, and tries to figure out how many plates, spoons or napkins he should put. (11.tur)

- I went to the market, bought this much, but this many broke, so how many are left? We practice a lot in our heads with these. We played games with the letters, I told him a word and he was supposed to find another word that began with the last letter of my word. We did puzzles. I also bought him games for intelligence. (4.tur)

- I used to read him books and ask questions about the book. I asked him questions to understand whether he was listening to me or whether he got the story. I made him think. (8.sar)
Changes in the Mother

The mothers mentioned changes in their perspectives on different aspects of life, in their self-perception and in their own behaviour. The changes in the mother are summarized in Table 14. “Behavior” is defined as giving different reactions to the child or behaving differently in topics related with the mother herself as a result of her participation in the Program. On the other hand, “perspective” was used for situations where the mother mentioned that she had changed her point of view, her present ideas or that she had acquired new ideas and/or a new way of thinking.

**Table 14**

*Changes in Mother’s Perspective on Different Aspects of Life, Self-Perception and Behavior*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perspective on different aspects of life and self-perception</th>
<th>Child</th>
<th>Mother</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- The understanding of motherhood changed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Realized the importance of family in education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Felt more conscious as a mother</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Felt more valuable as a woman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Felt she can be beneficial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Had more self-confidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wanted to work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wanted to continue her education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behavior</th>
<th>Child</th>
<th>Mother</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Decreased her use of negative discipline methods</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Paid attention to and valued the child’s ideas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Listened more attentively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Established more effective communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was more tolerant, patient and understanding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was aware that her child was an individual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Spent more time with her child</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was more consistent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was more knowledgeable about child development and behaved accordingly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Presented choices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prepared the right kind of environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Stated and observed the rules</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was more social</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Acted with courage and confidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Started giving more importance to herself</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Tried to improve herself</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Change in the Mother’s Behavior Toward the Child

The change in the mothers’ behavior toward their children took place in various ways. The mother decreased her use of negative discipline methods, valued her children more and asked for their opinion, listened to them more attentively and had a more effective communication. At the same time, she was more tolerant and understanding, was aware that her child was an individual, spent more time together and was more consistent. She behaved differently as she was more knowledgeable about child development. This difference in behavior comprised presenting choices, preparing the right kind of environment, and setting the rules.

Decreased her use of negative discipline methods

- For example, I would immediately punish her by locking her in a room if she behaved differently when there was a guest. I used to beat her, but now I don’t. This Program helped me a lot in not beating them, in listening to and understanding them. I realized that I was a better mother; it’s not enough just to give birth; education is also very important. I don’t beat and shout at her anymore. I used to punish a lot but now I don’t. I used to deprive her of the things she liked, but now it’s over. (18.tur)

- When he did something wrong, all I thought of was punishing him. Thanks to MOCEF, I learned that this was not the only way and that I could explain to him about his wrong behavior. I was more rigid, I had strict rules for everything, but that changed. (20.sw)

- I was beating my kids, I was aggressive. I stopped those even though I get angry verbally. I would hit when something happened, now I stopped that hand movement. (13.bel)

- I didn’t beat him, but I used to punish him. I don’t anymore. (18.bel)

- I am aware that I don’t beat them anymore as I used to. My behavior has changed somewhat. I am still nervous, but not as much as before. I used to beat a lot, but now I talk to them. Before the Program, I would beat without asking them anything. (11.bah)

- I used to yell, get angry and beat them. Then I realized that it was wrong and I am trying to control myself. I was able to control myself one step before the mistake (beating) and that was better for me. (7.sar)

Only two mothers, one in Istanbul and one in Belgium, reported no change in this matter and said that they still continued beating at times although they knew about the harmful effects.

- Beating, there have been times when I was very calm, but sometimes I can still give a slap. I wasn’t able to implement it altogether. (20.tur)

- I learned that beating, telling bad things and saying, “Don’t do this, don’t do that” all the time were harmful, but unfortunately I wasn’t able to implement it. (17.bel)
The mother, having realized that her child was an individual, changed her behavior and started giving more importance to her child’s ideas. The mothers reported listening to the child more attentively, as a result of which effective communication was established.

**Paid attention to and valued the child’s ideas**

- I now believe that my children have more rights. When we buy a couch, I think that we should ask them as well, and that’s what we do. Thinking of him as an individual, showing that we value him resulted in more self-confidence. Asking our children about whether we could do that enabled them to understand that they were important to the family. Children get that. (15.tur)

- For example, I learned to knock on her door before entering her room, being respectful of her privacy; especially to that of my elder son’s. (14.tur)

- I didn’t think of them as individuals. If I was cold, they should be cold; I mean I couldn’t see them as separate individuals. I gave birth to him but he doesn’t have to do everything I tell him. However, I need to insist if that’s something really harmful but otherwise, he should do it and bear the consequences. I learned that. (10.sw)

- For example, he would come and talk to me, but I wasn’t paying much attention and getting rid of him, thinking that he was just a kid. The teachers reminded us again, they kept telling how important that was. As I said I wasn’t giving the necessary attention to my child but now I do. (3.bel)

- Everybody has a different personality and temperament. Everybody has a different psychology, one cannot generalize what he likes or dislikes with one child. I learned that in the Program and started implementing it. (20.bah)

- I didn’t use to ask the kids about what we should do, if we should do it altogether or what they thought about something. I decided myself. Now it has changed. I am calmer; I pay attention to their ideas as well. I care about what they say. (15.sar)

**Listened more attentively**

- I listen to her problems; when she wants to tell me about something I listen to her, whereas I didn’t before the Program. I used to say, “I have things to do now, you can tell me about it later” and then it was forgotten. “You can tell me about it later,” I would say and would have her watch cartoons. Now, I listen to her even if I have something to do. I stop doing my work to listen to her. (10.tur)

- I am listening to them and I do this not while I am washing the dishes. I sit opposite her, find the same eye level and listen attentively. I understand her better now because when I did housework, I couldn’t concentrate on what she was telling me. I learned how to listen. I thought I was listening, but I wasn’t, I was just getting rid of her. (18.tur)

- When he has a problem, when he gets angry, I don’t shout and shush him. I try to learn
the reason for his aggression; I try to share his problem and joy. Actually, we should listen to our children till the end, let them talk. I learned to listen, for example. I was the one who talked all the time, now I am the listener. (20.sw)

- When I had work to do, when guests would come and I was busy in the kitchen, if he tried to talk to me I would shush him saying that I couldn’t take care of him then. Examples were given in the MOCEP and I saw that this wasn’t right. Then things changed. When I had work to do, I started saying, “I’ll listen to you later” and as soon as I was available, I would go and listen to him. When he comes from school, I pay attention and give him a warm welcome. I try my best to listen to him attentively when he wants to tell me about something. (3.bel)

- I didn’t use to listen to my kids, didn’t care about what they were telling, but now I talk and listen to them. (7.bah)

- I didn’t use to listen to my child when I was working. “Go, I am busy,” I would say. I learned that this was wrong. I can now listen. (2.sar)

Established more effective communication

- I learned that things could be solved through talking, not through getting angry. I learned the “I language.” There were disputes with the children. Now we settle things talking and in agreement so he doesn’t get angry, I don’t get angry. There is no fatigue. The most important thing is that your way of speaking changes; you don’t resort to violence or punishment anymore. This, in turn, has quite an influence on kids. (11.tur)

- For example, when I saw my child misbehave, I would get angry and shout. I was trying to solve my problem by shouting. Now that I have thought about it, I see that staying calm and talking together and pointing to the right and wrong are more fruitful. (17.sw)

- I am talking to my son emotionally now. I try to be friends with him. I used to yell a lot. Everyone in the block was telling me that I was shouting at him too much, everyone did so but mine was excessive. I don’t yell any more. (6.bel)

- When we went shopping, he wanted to buy everything. We didn’t want him to eat sweets so when he wanted chocolate, I would force him to give up and he would shout, I would shout. After the meetings, I talked to him at home. “We are going shopping, but you can get only one thing for yourself. If you don’t obey, we will come back without buying anything.” We made an agreement and he learned it. (16.bah)

- For example, instead of getting angry at the kids, I tried to calm down and later tried to communicate using the “I language.” I tried to educate them using the “I language” all the time. I have seen the results. I used to be strict, saying them “Do this, do that,” but now I don’t. I wouldn’t talk to them, I wouldn’t pay attention, I would say “I am watching television, I am busy, or I am cooking.” Now, we try to talk and solve things together when there is a problem. I take care of them more at the moment. (18.sar)
The mothers also reported being more tolerant and understanding as a result of the Program. Their statements also indicated that they spent more time with the child and became more consistent in their behavior toward their children.

**Was more tolerant, patient and understanding**

- I have become more understanding, more patient. Before the Program, I didn’t let him, for example, play with scissors or do painting thinking that he would make a mess. But now I allow him as I learned that these help the child develop his hand muscles and that these are vital for the improvement of his hand skills. (4.tur)

- Before the Program, how should I put it, I was more impatient toward the children. I think I learned how to be more patient. He is also more understanding and patient. (12.sw)

- We learned to play with the child, to let her go so that she could be a child. As I said, I have become a very flexible mother. I started tolerating things that I wouldn’t before. I was blocking her, I just removed them. (12.bel)

- I love them. I don’t neglect them, I am only nervous. Not much has changed in my temperament, I am still nervous. Just as I am about to get angry, I remember the things we talked about and sit down. I let her do whatever she wants. If she was to dirty her clothes, I let her. If she wants to do painting, I let her play. In fact, my children used to be afraid of me. Now, I don’t express it even if I get angry. I try to calm myself down. (14.bah)

- I have become more patient. I learned to be more patient and not to burst in anger. You actually realize that it’s not something to be mad about when you think about it for some time. (2.sar)

**Was aware that her child was an individual**

- I still regarded my son as a baby, as if he was in need of me, but I learned that children can take care of themselves after 3 years of age. I learned that he should eat and get dressed by himself, that he should do most of the things by himself. For example, my elder son wants to take his own bath and he likes it. I used to do everything for them, from putting on their shoes to their coats. I used to carry their bags, but now it has changed. I am trying to bring up a more responsible and more sensitive child. (15.tur)

- I used to shout at my kids when they were playing, “Don’t dirty your clothes, you’ll get cold.” Now I let them play. I dress them with appropriate clothes and they play the way they like. They know how to get dressed for cold or warm weather, in fact. (19.sw)

- I bought him an apron because our teacher said, “Do it, buy and teach them.” He asked me whether he could wash the dishes. He can’t actually, but I don’t want to put him down. I didn’t use to share anything with him. He said, “You didn’t let me do anything, Mom.” (6.bel)

- For example, when I am working, I let him come and work with me. When I make dough, I tell him to wash his hands and come. I show him how to do it. Now, they are all with me in
the kitchen whereas before the program I didn’t let them thinking that they would make a mess of it and make me tired. (13.bah)

- I wasn’t prioritizing his wishes; I was giving more importance to mine. He was choosy of friends, wanted it to be less crowded. Now, I invite the friends he wants so that he can have his say. For example, I take care not to hurt him when we are with my friends. I definitely avoid behaviors that might belittle or humiliate him. We decide upon certain things together. (8.sar)

**Spent more time with her child**

- I spend more time with her; I don’t give that much importance to housework anymore. Housework can be done any time, but these days with my child are irreplaceable. I believe that the more I can be with her, the more I can spend time together, the more useful I will be to her. We experience the joy of being a family. We realized that we should share things within the family. If it had been before the Program, I would have come directly home, but yesterday we didn’t, we spent some time together. She was very happy about it yesterday. (20.tur)

- I try to spend more time with the kids, try to be together with them. This didn’t exist. We were only trying to get rid of our children. Now I am aware of my child, aware of motherhood. We are so happy. (11.sw)

- For example, we go to the covered pool in winter in the afternoons. I want him to see that I want to spend time with him, that I value him. (10.sw)

- I wasn’t paying attention. Every Sunday, for example, when I finished my work, I did something for a couple of hours with my son. I then realized that he has changed. For example, on Sunday that week I bought plastic dough. The following week, I did painting. The next week, I took cotton balls and made a Santa Claus. In fact, I did certain things. (6.bel)

- My way of behaving toward my children has changed since the Program started. I didn’t use to spare special time for my children, but now I do. For example, I read them stories. I would come home very tired and I wanted to sleep. But now there are certain things that I need to do at certain times. I set aside a special time for them and we do something, we read stories. On Fridays, we always go out. Even when their father is at work or absent, we always go out. That’s what has changed, we absolutely go out. (12.bah)

- We spend more time together; we jump rope, we play with the ball and I take her around. Now we spend some quality time, we think about it, plan it and do it. (15.sar)

**Was more consistent**

- When I was talking on the phone, she would ask me whether she could do something that I absolutely didn’t allow her to do. As I was on the phone and wanted to continue talking, I would say yes. However, when I wasn’t busy and when she wanted to do the same thing, I would absolutely say no. She was taking advantage of my weak point as I was on the phone. Actually, it was my mistake and I later corrected it. Even if I was on the phone, I told the other person that I needed to take care of my child at that moment and that we could talk later...
and I hung up. Then, I explained the child that what she did was inappropriate, that she shouldn’t do like that when I was on the phone. So the child doesn’t feel contradiction now; giving permission when you are busy and saying no when you are not. (16.tur)

- I keep my promise so that he will learn to keep his. That’s different. (10.sw)

- I decided to be consistent in the punishment I give. I wouldn’t execute the punishment, I would say something and take it back immediately and soften and so he takes advantage of that and repeats the same thing. Now, he knows that I am behind my decisions so he is more careful. For example, with my husband, when one of us got angry, the other one behaved in the opposite way. There was inconsistency between us. I was always the bad mother, and he was always good. For example, when one of us rewarded the child or showed attention, we did that both, but we decided to act the same way in our punishments as well. (4.bel)

- I would forbid him from playing his favorite game, but when he cried, I would say yes. In the Program, they said, “Do whatever you said. If it’s a no, then stick to it.” (20.bah)

- I am trying to be consistent. (6.sar)

In addition, it was seen from the mothers’ self reports that as a result of their awareness about child development, they were able to actualize behavior change in children not through negative discipline methods, but by presenting choices, by using methods where the rules and limits were observed and by preparing the appropriate environment. The mothers also realized the importance of play in the child’s development and therefore, became more flexible in that respect.

*Was more knowledgeable about child development and behaved accordingly

- I’m not cutting them off. I try not to demotivate the children. I don’t make comparisons between them; I don’t compare the two siblings. I used to compare them a lot. These didn’t exist for me before the Program. (10.tur)

- Before it was like, “Go to you room and play there. Don’t you know how to play alone?” Then, he wouldn’t do what I told him to do, like tidying up his room. He would throw his toys around and wouldn’t pick them up, but I taught him to tidy up through play. He was biting his nails because of lack of attention. Or he behaved childishly; I learned that it was also because of lack of attention. I used to hit his hands if he bit his nails before the Program, but now I try to distract his attention as we learned in the Program. (10.sw)

- The biggest change is with my daughter. I have become more tolerant toward her, thinking that her actions are appropriate for her age. For example, I didn’t let her stand on the couch, but I learned that it was something children of this age needed to do. It seemed logical, so I let her and she was jumping on the bed. I realized that she had great joy and that was important as she didn’t know how to laugh. She had been doing things with me all the time, she wasn’t like a kid. (1.bel)
- My behavior toward him changed and improved quite a lot. I have started paying more attention to how he played so that his development won’t be affected. (3.bah)

- She used to want to paint the sun red, but I used to say it should be yellow. I used to insist a lot. For example, I have started not to interfere with her imagination, with her colors. I told her to use her imagination and use the colors she wanted; I told her she could even use grey. I also gave permission to her to do whatever she wished for. Before the Program, I used to say “Tidy up, don’t make a mess, don’t…,” but later it was different. (18.sar)

Presented choices

- When she wanted something, I was presenting her with alternatives. When you present choices, she forgets easily whatever she first wanted. She knows and understands that it is something impossible. (16.tur)

- I would force him to eat vegetables that he didn’t like, but now I sometimes let him choose. For example, I tell him that he can have the soup that day instead of the vegetables. He chooses the soup and something else along with it. I tell him to make his choice, when he has the vegetable, I don’t force the soup. (8.bel)

Prepared the right kind of environment

- When we were going to the hospital to visit a patient, we took the CDs with us and set the stage for our children. The children watched that CD and they were silent throughout the visit as we had prepared the environment. Otherwise, we could have suffered. Before going to the hospital, I asked them which CDs to take and told them that we were going to the hospital to visit their uncle, who had had an operation. I had the comfort of preparing the right kind of environment. (15. tur)

- I give her time. For example, I used to say, “Hurry up, hurry up!” while she was trying to tie her shoe laces. Now I tell her to take her time and that we have enough time and she can do it with her own pace. I give her some time to play as well. I set the stage for her to play. (19.sw)

- As a mother, after the children come home from school, my job was not letting anyone in the house, taking care of their homework, getting them into their room, preparing a snack for them and helping with their homework, these sorts of things. When children came from school, I would send them to their room to study or they would study here. I learned not to let them study in front of television or in the living room and that it was important to instill work habits in them, or not accepting guests at home during that time. (13.bel)

- Now they are freer and I have given them this freedom. I made a special room for them where they can play. This idea was strange to me, but when they said it at the meeting, I did it. Set a place for the toys and for the child to play; there is a place reserved for guests, why shouldn’t you do it for your child? (20.bah)

- He was having difficulty brushing his teeth so his father had a small stool built so that he
could reach the sink. After that, he was running to brush his teeth after meals and wash his hands without my warning. He liked it. (12.sar)

**Stated and observed the rules**

- He wasn’t listening to me as we lived in a family apartment, with relatives. I couldn’t establish much authority, but during the Program, I learned to do that. (4.tur)

- There were no limits, either for watching television or playing computer, but with education, our daily life with the children started to have an order. It had not existed before the Program, but we learned that it was harmful at our meetings and tried and set limits. (8.sw)

- The formulas I saw in the Program, for example, the most basic thing was that if a child wants everything, don’t buy it. You may have the means, but it’s not good. Buying everything whenever the child asks for it, if he doesn’t need it, why buy it? (5.bel)

- Before the Program, I wouldn’t let them repeat what they wanted. It has always been like that but now, not always. I used to do whatever they wanted the minute they asked for it, but now if I am busy, I finish my work first or I tell them that we can go out only after they have finished their homework. (12.bah)

- I used to tell her to come to the table for dinner and she would say, “I want to play, I’ll eat when I am finished playing.” I said, “No, let’s give you a time period and you play during that time, but you have to be at the table at this time.” She showed reluctance at first, but then she got used to it. Thanks to the Program, I learned how to solve problems with children. For example, homework time passes more smoothly, there is absolutely no television. She can’t watch a serial before finishing his homework. We have rules like that. (18.sar)

**Change in the Mother-Child Relationship**

The changes in the mother toward the child were not limited to her behavior only. Mothers stated having a closer and more harmonious relationship with better communication.

Some mothers reported that their relationship with their children had already been good before the Program and that there had not been much change, while few mothers expressed no positive change in their relationship.

**A calmer and more harmonious relationship**

- The children listen to me better now. They didn’t take me seriously then. I was angry and that’s why she was annoyed. She felt rage when I beat her. This was more effective; she started to obey more. Before the Program, she was rebellious, she wouldn’t listen to me but now when I talk and explain to her, she is easily convinced. I actually educated myself because children are still in the process of formation. Mothers are educated here more, we adapt normal behaviors, and in return children normalize. (18.tur)
- I used to say “Tidy up your room,” but she wouldn’t. When you put things differently, it is done differently. For example, when I told her to tidy up her room, she wouldn’t. But now with the help of what I have learned from the Program, the CEP, she does it easily. For example, I would say, “You tidy up a little, then get some rest, do as much as you wish and I’ll help you with the rest.” Then, she would do it all by herself. It was nice. (9.sw)

- She had a bad temper, she was aggressive but she learned to listen. She would be offended and leave; she had affectation, now it’s over. (19.bel)

- He wouldn’t listen to what I said at all and he wouldn’t obey; he would do whatever he wanted. Now, he is so gentle with me, I feel that he cares about me. (1.bah)

- When she makes a mistake and when I explain it to her in a positive way, she answers back positively as well. (3.sar)

- He used to be very aggressive; he would get angry immediately and cry. He would tell everything by crying, he would cry over very minor things. Now, he never cries; he can express himself. He can tell me about anything and he doesn’t lie. (11.sar)

**A relationship with better communication**

- He can express himself much better in all aspects. For example, when he doesn’t like my attitude, he says, “Mom, I wish you didn’t do that” or “I’m glad you are doing that.” Even when I get dressed up, he tells me that I am very beautiful that way. (19.tur)

- He can share things with me at the moment whereas he used to keep it all to himself. He wouldn’t talk about anything but express himself with a nervous attitude and aggressiveness. Now that I am trying to talk to him gently, trying to reach him, with his words and by showing empathy, he starts telling about it himself. (20.sw)

- I listen so they come and tell me about anything, their sorrow and happiness. We have stronger communication. I guess he was telling me but I wasn’t listening, I wasn’t paying attention. Now I know about his problems, about whom he likes or dislikes. (4.bel)

- When I treat the children well, they come closer. They used to hesitate to talk to me when I was angry, but I don’t feel like that at the moment. They talk to me now, they tell me about the least important things. I feel the change in the relationship, I really do. They come and hug me. (9.bah)

- She wouldn’t talk about her emotions, about whether she was happy or unhappy but now she does. For example, she said, “I am cross with my friend” and when I asked her why, she said, “Because she did this and I don’t like what she did. Also today, the teacher made me very happy because she said that I was the cleverest. She gave me a star.” (4.bah)

- He can communicate now, always has a dialogue, he doesn’t talk in a shout. He is talking and that’s quite a change. (11.sar)
- She talks to me better, she tells about herself such as what she can do and how. I didn’t use to talk to her much, but now we are like friends. Even when I get angry, she comes and talks to me, trying to understand me by asking questions. She talks more; she talks about everything with me and expresses everything. (9.sar)

A closer relationship

- We spend our time more happily by spending it with my child. He plays with me and is happy with me, he is satisfied. He learns new things with me. He shares everything with me and I can observe him. I get to know him better, so I treat him better and we get along well. I spend more time with my child and we share more and have come closer. I spend my time differently with my child and I spend more time with him. (11.tur)

- I felt our relationship got stronger as I started feeling differently about him after MOCEP. We do more things together so I felt that we shared more. We talk and probably I can say that we are more attached. Maybe it had already been like that, but after the Program I could say that our relationship changed, I understood that our relationship could actually change. (12.sw)

- He knows my value, and I know his. Before the Program, we didn’t have a dialogue. I have always loved my son, but may be one chain tied us together, whereas now we are tied with perhaps fifteen or twenty chains to each other. (6.bel)

- Now I am getting closer to her, I have started giving her love. I caress her head and she accepts this love. She didn’t want me to take her to bed, but now she loves me a lot whereas before she didn’t, she didn’t want to sleep with me. When I went out, she didn’t want to come with me. After the Program, I got closer to her and she got even closer. Now she wants to sleep with me. They love me more now, but I didn’t feel that before. After implementing this Program, I saw that she is closer. She wouldn’t kiss me before, but she does now, to my surprise. She wouldn’t want me to kiss her also, but now she comes naturally and gives me a hug. (7.bah)

- She has become closer to me since the Program, as she also knows that I attended the Program for her. She was saying her friends: “My mom takes care of me, she goes to school for me. She couldn’t send me to school but she teaches me the necessary things by learning them from MOCEP.” Generally, all of her friends had been to preschool. (19.sar)

Already had a good relationship, so no change

- It’s the same, not much has changed because my son has always seen me as his friend and he still does. There hasn’t been much change as he has always seen me as a friend. (4.sw)

- We have always had a good relationship. There was no change. (13.bel)

- Our relationship was like that before the Program and it still is. After the Program, we had more conversation with him as I continued to spend special time with him. Before the Program it was the same as we were alone in the house and I could spend a lot of my time with him. (7.sar)
No change, nothing positive has happened

- Actually it hasn’t affected me much because I wasn’t really into the Program. For example, there were weekly lessons there, I couldn’t do them. There were things that we had to do in a week but I couldn’t concentrate on them. My younger child prevented me quite a lot. It was not 100% efficient. (1.sw)

- I don’t think that there has been any change. (17.bel)

How Did the Change in the Mother Lead to a Change in Mother-Child Relationship?

The mothers stated that they have changed first, and that children changed only after they had changed. This again confirmed the fact that they were responsible for the change in their children.

- I understand him better and he understands me better. Maybe because of my understanding him better…. I treat him well and he pays me back. (19.tur)

- Mothers are educated here, in fact. We adapt normal behaviors, so the children normalize. (18.tur)

- I talk and understandably, he talks as well. If I don’t talk to him, he won’t tell me back. (12.sw)

- When I got rid of my authoritarian attitude and adopted a more tolerant one, he stopped behaving in extremes. (8.bel)

- When I behave toward the kids nicely, they come closer to me. They used to be afraid to tell me anything when I was angry, but I don’t feel like that at the moment. (9.bah)

- The mother has a friendly look, so does the child and this is obviously reflected onto the father. It has really affected the people around me. It has affected our relationship very positively. (8.sar)

Change in the Mother’s Perspective on Different Aspects of Life and Self-Perception

The mothers mentioned a change in their understanding of motherhood, realizing the importance of family in education, feeling more conscious as a mother, more valuable as a woman, and feeling useful and having more self-confidence. Regarding their future plans, they considered working and continuing their education. Table 14 summarizes these statements.

The understanding of motherhood changed

- The thing that was strongly emphasized in this Program was to behave calmly, that what I say will not be true all the time. I learned that I have mistakes, too, even though I am the mother. It helped me to learn and criticize myself. (11.tur)
I would like to raise my kid with more self-confidence; I try my best for her to become someone with personality, someone who knows what she wants. You learn that the child is a separate being and learn about how she feels so you try to be more helpful. (9.sw)

I have been home for years doing housework only, but haven’t done anything. I will go out to see others with my son so that he has a social milieu, even if that means doing no housework that day. Life is not simply about going to and coming from school. I don’t want him to think that he could be on social welfare if he doesn’t graduate. His quality of life will change; I will change it in time as I planted the seeds. I want him to talk to people of quality, not with anyone he meets. (6.bel)

When I do something now, I think about my children. I think about their perceptions, not about my feelings. (12.bah)

I actually want them to have a better education so that I can give them a better life. The only thing I want is a good life for them, a good education. I have known motherhood only as giving birth and feeding, but beyond that, education is very important for a child. (16.sar)

The mothers reported that they started to understand the importance of families in education and to consider themselves to be more conscious mothers. They reported feeling more valuable and more self-confident as a woman, as well as feeling useful as they were able to contribute to their child’s development.

**Realized the importance of family in education**

I learned that education starts in the family in the first place. I have always known that but now it is better as we implemented and experienced it. Education first starts in the family. We are now trying to do that. (15.tur)

I want my children to model me. I believe that they will behave tomorrow toward their spouses the same way I treat them today. I am a mother and if they see a good mother, they will act the same way with their spouses, and the children toward their mothers. They are very young now so they learn what they see. (14.sar)

**Felt more conscious as a mother**

I now know what to do. I can now make a decision when I am stuck instead of asking for my mother’s advice about what to do with my child. (18.tur)

I have realized that I am a good mother. I regarded myself as inadequate and unskilled before the Program, but I am not like that, I am a good mother and I can bring up a good child. I believe that I am raising very good people. This Program enabled me to realize this. I wasn’t aware of this. (14.tur)

Having received our certificate, we were really proud, we, among friends, said that we were trained mothers. I feel more conscious, I believe I’m a conscious mother. You feel the pride of both attending the Program and raising your child well. I can say that I feel myself equipped in this matter. (8.sw)
- I received education, even if that was for a short time. I learned about my mistakes. I learned to read books actually. The Program taught me to be a mother, to be a knowledgeable and intellectual mother. It taught me that I could give confidence to my son. First, the Program helped build my confidence, and then I could help my son have confidence. (6.bel)

- I did not feel like a mother, I didn’t care, but my life changed completely in three months. I felt that I am a mother, I felt love toward my child and I can do anything for her. I didn’t like to learn before the Program but now I want to learn everything, everything that would have a place in my daughter’s life. (4.bah)

- I can now define myself as more conscious. I am knowledgeable, I know what is right and I know about some good things. (9.sar)

**Felt more valuable as a woman**

- At least, I learned to take time for myself. I learned to be a woman, to be the housewife, not the maid. I learned to be “I”; you discover yourself. (20.tur)

- I learned that I am an individual, I have a place in this life and that I am not just the slave of my husband and my children. MOCEP thought me that I should have my place as a mother at home and it taught me about my value. (18.tur)

- I think that I’m equal with my husband. I am a woman and I have freedom. I can do whatever I want. (19.sw)

- I was very nervous and didn’t have any self-confidence. My self-confidence increased, I remembered that I’m also an individual, that I’m me. I can say that I am present. I have learned to value myself. (1.bel)

- My walk has changed; I started to be proud of myself. I was going to school flying. Going somewhere, it wasn’t only me, a whole group of people going there. I’ve met new people and talked to them. I felt I have a lot of friends. I saw myself different in every aspect. (15.bah)

**Felt she can be beneficial**

- We are good for something. When you are home all day, you look like a robot, wash the dishes, clean the house, but I am useful. You feel like a teacher while working with the CEPs. (11.tur)

- It’s best to see that your child has learned new things or that you feel you are raising your child well. (9.sw)

- I have felt that I’m useful, that I’m good for something while working with the CEPs. Taking care of my children, working with them, I have improved their intelligence. That’s what I can do. I’ve got some errands to do all the time, I feel like a robot. Thanks to this Program, I’ve felt that I was useful, that I did something good. (17.bel)
Had more self-confidence

- I believe in myself, believe that I can do it. I believe that I can do anything as a woman after participating in MOCEP. (9.tur)

- For example, I wouldn’t dare to go to the doctor’s at first, fearing about what I would do if something happened, but now I’m more courageous in that matter. (17.sw)

- I have confidence in myself. I am a primary school graduate and I had wanted to continue my education and now I believe that I can be successful and do things thanks to MOCEP. (16.bel)

- I’ve earned my self-confidence. (5.bah)

- Most important of all, I had confidence in myself. When I came here, I lacked confidence. I couldn’t go anywhere the first year. Then, it was always with husbands, they were taking us around. Coming here I lost my confidence. My psychology was totally upset. I used to drive in Turkey, but here it is absolutely forbidden. You can’t even go to the grocer, you are like a prisoner. Attending the Program helped increase my confidence. Now I can say that nothing is impossible. We also benefit from what we would like to give to the kids. (15.sar)

They also voiced their intentions to continue their education or to start working. However, there were mothers who reported no change in that respect after attending the Program.

Wanted to work

- I used to say that I couldn’t do it at this age, but I have had the courage to start work. My child will start primary school and I will be able to start working, I’m now researching it. (11.tur)

- I hope to succeed, after succeeding I might even consider starting up a business. (5.bel)

- I’ve wanted to found a preschool for a long time but I haven’t. In fact, I have realized that I can do it after the Program. (19.bah)

- I told my husband that I wanted to work, to do something, whereas I used to say I wouldn’t work. But now I told him that I would like to, that I could start working if he finds something convenient. I liked the Program a lot. I have been to this school, MOCEF. They gave me a certificate. I told my husband that I could go and help the preschool teacher if there was a need and said that it was better than sitting at home, doing nothing. (5.sar)

Wanted to continue her education

- I sometimes think about continuing my education. I have heard that the high school diploma is given at the adult education center. I am thinking about attending, so it looks as if I will be going there again. (7.tur)
- I would like to get my middle school and high school diplomas and want to attend classes for that purpose. (6.bel)

- I wanted to educate myself after this Program. I want something related with handicapped people or something that would help me improve myself. (1.bah)

- Regarding education for example, I didn’t want to learn new things, but now I do. I want to learn English, start from the first level, the alphabet. I love learning. When I told my husband, he encouraged me. (4.bah)

- I want to graduate from middle and high school. Actually, I would have graduated from long distance high school; my husband had wanted it so much. I was timid so I couldn’t take the exams out of fear. Now that I participated in MOCEF last year, I would like to try again. My husband wants me to continue my education, to have a diploma. They ask the kids at school about my education and my kids suffer from this question. I want to continue my education. (20.sar)

**No change**

- Nothing actually as a woman, I have always been the same. I am still the same. (16.tur)

- I don’t see any difference. (13.sar)

**Change in the Mother’s own Behavior**

The mothers also reported being more social, giving more importance to themselves, acting with more courage and confidence and trying to improve themselves as a result of their participation in the Program.

**Was more social**

- I have become more social. We learned what is where in the Program. (3.tur)

- We went to fairs and exhibitions during the Program. I grew up in a village so I wasn’t used to those places. We had quite a change in things like that. We blossomed. (13.bel)

- My personality as a woman changed. I met many women in the Program; I’m still seeing them in different ways. You improve; the social circle enlarges with the Program. I feel those as a woman. (12.bah)

- I was closed within these four walls. I wouldn’t go out, but now I do whenever I wish to. I see these friends of mine. I have become more social. (18.sar)

**Acted with courage and confidence**

- I used to be shy and couldn’t talk comfortably with the people around me. Now I think that I am a human being and so they are. I can express my mistakes as well as my good side. I couldn’t express myself, I would be silent in response to whatever others said and listened, but now I’ve come out of my shell. (12.tur)
- My husband would drive me around before the Program, but now I have the courage to go and do it myself. We started language courses. I believe in myself. My husband would take me around because I didn’t know the underground much. I have learned quite a lot now, I’m not ignorant, but I looked ignorant then. (18.bel)

- When I go somewhere with a group, I feel cultured. I can now communicate and exchange information whereas I used to listen only. I wish strongly to take a part in the conversation. Thanks to this Program, I attended a computer class and learned to use a computer. I would be staying at home if I hadn’t participated in this Program. (15.bah)

- I couldn’t talk about my complaint when I went to the gynecologist. Now, I can talk about my problem, about my pain. I couldn’t talk in front of the elders, even if I wasn’t guilty. I couldn’t express myself, but now I can. I used to be timid thinking that they were older, but I realized that when people talk to each other, everything can be solved. (4.sar)

**Started giving more importance to herself**

They also mentioned that they paid more importance to their looks even when they were home, as well as spending more time on their needs and wishes. There were mothers who had started working and who were trying to improve themselves.

- I started to have more time for myself. I didn’t use to shape my eyebrows, for example. I spend more time in front of the mirror. I’m now filing my nails, have nail polish and put on my earrings. In short, I spend more time for myself; I pay more attention to myself. (20.tur)

- I didn’t use to think about my health, I wasn’t paying attention. For example, after the Program I went to have my checkup. It was a trigger that reminded me to take care of myself. (13.sw)

- At least, I have learned to take time for myself. When I compare it with former times, now when friends get together for breakfast or for a walk, I tell my husband that I will have that time for myself and that he should take care of the kids as I am going out. I am not doing this just at any time, of course; I make plans with him so as not to threaten the peace and harm the family life. (18.bel)

- I loved myself to tell you the truth. I love painting. I started to take time for myself for painting. I read and improve my intellectual capacity. I dream and paint. I definitely have time for myself. I have learned that I shouldn’t spend all my time on housework and that I should have time for my hobbies as well, like sewing. I’ve refreshed myself after the Program. (17.bah)

- I gave importance to myself. I didn’t limit my life, but I used to restrain myself, paid a lot of attention to my life and my expenditure. I would spend all my money, but wouldn’t buy anything for myself. I would always be the last one, but now it’s not like that. I choose for myself first, I am now taking care of myself. I have been thinking various things about myself. (14.sar)

** Tried to improve herself**

- I didn’t use to do anything to earn money; my husband was the sole provider. Then, I decid-
ed to start my business to do whatever I did best. I worked at home and earned my money. I had decided on that. The best thing I did was to cook, so I started earning money by cooking. I have plans for the future. Cakes and cookies, they are my life. I want to have a place of my own if we move to Turkey one day. (14.sar)

- I don’t want to stop my education here. I am on the Internet and read a lot about child psychology. I research books from the Internet. I used to read novels, but now I read more psychology and education books; not just about children, about women as well. I will improve and I want my children to take me and my husband as good models. Then, they can be good parents to their children as well. (14.sar)

However, one mother from Switzerland reported no change in this matter.

- Nothing much has changed in my opinion, because a woman sets her womanhood aside after becoming a mother and a spouse. Children come first, then follow the duties to the spouse and that leaves no time for you. (6.sw)

**How Did the Mother’s Experiences during Implementation Contribute to the Change?**

This section will shed light on the process of change experienced by mothers during their attendance in the Program. The mothers reported that although they had difficulties in implementing what they had learned at first, things got easier later. They stressed that the old methods and habits needed time to change and effort was required to implement new methods. Especially establishing a positive relationship with the child and decreasing the use of negative discipline methods constituted hardships for the mothers. However, they reported that they were eager and patient throughout that period and as a result they were successful.

- I had difficulty in implementing it at first. Talking and explaining were tiring. (18.tur)

- Yes, I had difficulty. Six years had passed and changing those behaviors learned during that time wasn’t easy. I made a lot of effort and I tried to be patient because I knew that change wouldn’t happen fast. It wasn’t easy, it happened with time. But I knew that it was my fault so patience was the only way out. (20.sw)

- I had difficulty in implementation at first. I believed that it was the right thing to do, but thinking about how I should do it was difficult. I kept talking myself into it. If the child didn’t do something, I tried to stay calm, think that it was normal and tried to breathe deeply. I talked to myself in order not to get angry. (18.bel)

- People can’t change all of a sudden. There is no magic. At first, I shouted a bit at times, for example, but it got better in time and became a habit. It was a question of changing our habits. I believe it becomes a habit with practice. (3.sar)

Mothers’ self reports indicated clearly that they underwent a change over time.

- Of course I felt happy. I said “Thank God I attended this Program and I was aware.” What if
I hadn’t? What would have happened? How would my children have turned out? (8.tur)

- I am very happy at the moment. I try to be more mature toward my child, just like a mother should, affectionate, loving and merciful. I am so happy to be like that. (11.sw)

- You become happy because you aren’t angry any more and you get a similar reaction in return. Both you and your child benefit. (9.bel)

- I am very happy because I attended a course that I can use throughout my entire life. I feel relaxed and that I have given much more to my children. (10.bah)

- We live in difficult conditions here, so attending the Program and changing made us really very happy. I will always feel that happiness inside. (1.sar)

The mothers were also asked whether these reported changes continued after the Program ended and most of them gave affirmative answers. They stated that these changes had become a habit and a life style. However, some of the mothers mentioned that the effects of the Program were more intense while the Program was in session.

- Of course, it continues. My behavior is still the same, but I wish something like that took place every year. I believe it would be very beneficial. (19.tur)

- Positive changes continue. You implement something and when you get positive things in return, you want to do it all the time. And it gains ground gradually and it has to, in a way. (15.sw)

- When a person makes a habit, it’s difficult to break it. Such behaviors become a habit and you practice them all the time. (3.bel)

- I haven’t gone back to how I was. Thank God, the changes continue. (2.bah)

- It isn’t enough just to learn it here and go do it at home. It has to become a life philosophy; you have to place it in your life. (10.sar)
**Indirect Effects**

There were reported effects of the Program on both the mothers and the fathers that were not among the aims of the Program. Therefore, these changes were considered indirect effects.

Changes in the Mother

The indirect effects were the changes in the behavior of the mother toward her husband, toward other children in the family and toward the people around her. Table 15 summarizes the indirect effects on the mother.
Table 15
Changes in Mother’s Behavior toward her Husband, Other Children and the People around Her

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change in Behavior</th>
<th>Toward Husband</th>
<th>Toward Other Children</th>
<th>Toward the people around</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Could better use the communication skills</td>
<td>- Implemented what she had learned</td>
<td>- Was calmer and more tolerant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Could express herself better</td>
<td>- A closer relationship</td>
<td>- Could express herself better</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Was more patient, understanding and calmer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- No change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward Her Husband

The mothers reported better communication with their husbands as well as better self expression than before. In addition, they talked about being calmer, more patient and understanding both during and after the Program. However, some mothers stated that there was no change in their behavior toward the husband.

Could better use the communication skills

- I used to be cross with him. When we had a problem, I wouldn’t talk to him. I would pull myself back and prefer to be silent, but it is different now. I talk to him when I am right. (18.tur)

- I would always bring up other topics and my husband would get angry. Now, I am only talking about that topic and get angry on that if I have to. For example, I directly talk about that problem. Before the Program, I used to nag him and get angry. (1.sw)

- I never knew how to ask for something from my husband. We learned how to talk to our children, how to ask something from them and how to listen to them. For example, now I pay attention to my tone of voice and have eye contact when I want something. I have got good results. (10.sw)

- My way of talking has changed. It is more intimate. I didn’t use to care much about him but now I care and I ask him about his whereabouts. I didn’t even bother to ask. (7.bah)

Could express herself better

- I can now say “no” to my husband about things I couldn’t say before. I don’t have to bear people I don’t like. (19.tur)

- Expressing myself. It didn’t exist, but now when my husband tells me something, for example, I can talk about my discomfort. That is relaxing. For example, I couldn’t tell him...
that I was unhappy, I couldn’t talk about myself. Now, I can talk about how I feel and it is better to communicate through talking. (11.sw)

- Positive from my aspect. I have started to express my ideas more easily. When I don’t like something, I can suggest an alternative, of course, without hurting anyone. (5.bel)

- I used to hesitate to talk, to express myself. But now I feel comfortable telling what I like and what I don’t like. It is like a routine. You could be working, but I am tired as well. I have my own responsibilities as much as you. So, I tell him that he is responsible for that. (15.sar)

**Was more patient, understanding and calmer**

- I have become more patient as a spouse. For example, I would quarrel a lot with my husband because of the children’s stress, we used to dispute all the time. He was nervous, I was nervous, but it has changed. For example, I am more relaxed toward him. (12.tur)

- We were very impulsive at times, there was over reaction. We talked about those in the Program; I can pull myself back when I think about them. (18.sw)

- I was more furious toward my husband. I believe that daughter-in-laws have a lot of problems with their parent-in-laws. I believe that deteriorates the psychology. Now, I am better. (6.bel)

- After the Program, I would shut up when he was angry. I told him that we needed to solve this problem and it was different. My nervousness decreased, I have become more emotional. (5. bah)

- It has changed. For example, I am more patient. I don’t have outbursts; I don’t react immediately or get into a dispute. I don’t exaggerate as I used to. I think about it calmly, about how it was in the Program, how I can be more effective, how I can make them listen to me. I can implement it all after revising in my head what we talked about in the Program. (9.sar)

**No change**

- I think I am a normal spouse so I don’t see a difference. There was a change in my behavior toward my children as I received education about children, so that’s the only change in me as a woman. (2.tur)

- We didn’t talk much about spouses, I don’t remember. I guess it is still the same, there is no change. (6.sw)

- I accept that I have changed toward my children, but nothing had changed toward my husband. (3.bel)

- Actually, we talked about marriage as well, but because of my lack of communication with my husband, I couldn’t benefit. My wish was to be happy in general. (18.sar)
Change in the Mother’s Relationship with Her Husband

These reported changes in the mothers’ behavior toward the husband caused a difference in their relationships as well. The mothers mentioned better communication and fewer arguments. They spent more time with each other. The mothers in Saudi Arabia, in particular, started acting more independently after becoming aware of their own rights.

However, there were some mothers who reported no change in the positive direction in their relationship with their husbands.

**Better communication**

- I started to talk and my husband started to listen. When I explain the situations with the reasons, he listens to it better now. He thinks more rationally and answers. Now, it is better, we couldn’t share certain things before the Program. (1.tur)

- Listening is really important, turning off the television. For example, we wouldn’t turn off the television and chat. Turning off the television and chatting, these all resulted from MOCEP, we knew about them, but didn’t implement them. When the television is turned off for ten minutes or half an hour, when it is out of your life, there are lots of things to talk about. (5.tur)

- I am sure that the love and respect between me and my husband increased. The more you explain things to the other person, the more he respects you. (9.sw)

- Our way of talking with my husband, for example, his way of asking for something, to say the least, has changed. He used to say, “I am very thirsty, bring me some water,” or “Bring me some water,” but now he says “Darling, could you bring me some water.” It has turned into a more respectful relationship. When I cook, he says, “It tastes very nice, thank you.” He had never told me this and this has been very important to me. Before attending MOCEP, he would eat and drink, but wouldn’t thank me. (18.bel)

- I feel that we are talking and arguing more. We had time for us both. I talk about the kids, what they did, what has happened, what our daughter did and how he should react. We used to talk, but not that often. He used to just listen to me when I talked. Now I convince him, I teach him by explaining about how he behaved and what happened as a result. He listens to me and pays more attention. (16.bah)

- My dialogue with my husband. Problems have decreased. I can talk more, I can talk about what I feel and he tries to act accordingly. (3.sar)

**Fewer arguments**

- When I said no and the father said yes, there was an argument. I told him not to do that. He understands me now and so do I. It is better this way and we have a better relationship. Talks are nicer and we listen to each other more. (13.tur)
- He used to start arguments in front of the child, but after attending MOCEP, we pay attention to that. We are trying to be more harmonious parents. For example, when the father says no to something, the mother should say no as well, even if that’s wrong, for the child not to be a liar. The other spouse respects another’s decision even if that is wrong. Such a change took place. I can say that we have turned into more understanding spouses. (20.sw)

- I used to be more rigid toward my husband. I have become in favor of talking. “Don’t get mad at me and I won’t get mad at you and we can get along talking.” Now we first sit down and talk about what should be done regarding our daughter and about what we want. (1.bel)

- We used to have more arguments, I would push him more. Then, I thought that it was useless and our arguments have been decreasing since. I have realized that I was pushing him too far and that was a mistake. Attending MOCEP was like therapy for me. I sort of reversed. After attending MOCEP, I became a better person; I became more aware of the world. I try to do my best in sharing my husband’s work stress. We have become more peaceful. I am calmer and when he saw that I wasn’t fretful, he also acted differently. (7.sar)

- When our voices rise during an argument, we stop there and I remind him a few hours later because I learned in MOCEP that a matter should be settled when it is hot. Otherwise it keeps coming up. I am doing that. I used to keep the topic hot and have an argument, for example, after a week, the same topic came up, this time more intense. Now, it is different. I believe I am a more understanding wife and mother. I don’t like arguments and now it is over. We get along well in that matter. For example, when I say that our child will not go there, then it is over. We never talk about it. (14.sar)

Spent more time with each other

- We spend more time together. For example, my son used to go to bed very late so we couldn’t find the time. Now they both sleep at 9 o’clock and then we can sit down and talk. (19.tur)

- We try to spend more time with the kids. I try to spend more time with my husband; I am more involved with him. (4.sw)

- We share everything. We go out together quite a lot. We didn’t do that before. This is my 8th year in Saudi Arabia and I guess I was alone in the five years of my marriage. I used to go to the friends’ houses alone, my husband wouldn’t come. Now we spend more time together with my husband and with the children, although I live with my family. I can have a world for my husband and myself in this house. (14.sar)

In some countries, mothers reported acting more independently in their relationship with their husbands.
Mother acted more independently as she was aware of her rights

- My husband comes from a specific cultural background and he believes that a woman’s place is at home, next to her husband. She must obey her husband and I used to do that in the first years. I would tell him before I went out. I didn’t want any arguments so I was doing it, but it has changed; I have become more confident. I have started to defend my rights, started telling him that I am an individual. I used to be afraid of him. I don’t oppose him, but I can defend my rights. I have gained my confidence as a spouse. (14.tur)

- I have started to defend my rights and this has resulted in better communication between us. He is also very happy about it. He is my spouse, not my father; I shouldn’t ask for his permission, he should respect me. I don’t actually believe that he has a say in what I wear, what I do and who my friends are. I share the same opinion as my husband about this. In fact, he didn’t use to interfere, that was how I thought of him. We are not continuously arguing and intervening. It used to be different, but I believe I was causing it. (14.sar)

- I would keep quiet when he was fretful; I believed that I had to as he was my husband. However, after attending MOCEP I realized that I have my own rights and that I can defend them. I would stay silent as a wife when my husband hurt me. I was thinking that there was no use in answering. But then I am a human being as well. If he loves me, he shouldn’t do things that would hurt me. If I do something that could affect him negatively, he could tell me, but when I don’t do anything…. I started not to accept when he behaved this way. (19.sar)

No change

- We don’t actually have the time to talk because he doesn’t spare any time for us or he doesn’t listen or he is tired. Something always comes up. (1.sw)

- Nothing positive has happened because he didn’t meet my expectations. As long as he doesn’t respond, no positive change is possible. But now, I have no expectations. (2.bel)

- No, I don’t believe it has affected my relationship with my husband. We are the same. Even if I have changed, he is still the same. He hasn’t changed. (14.bah)

- Nothing has changed with my husband because I have no communication with him. (18.sar)

Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward Other Children in the Family

The statements of the mothers reflected a change in their behavior toward other children in the family. This result is the same regardless of the other child’s age, and whether s/he is older or younger than the target child. They stated that they had implemented what they had learned from the Program and had a closer relationship with children other than the target child as well.
The mother implemented what she had learned

- I participated in the Program for my elder son actually, but I am applying my experiences to both of them. In other words, I participated for my elder son, but he is not the only one benefiting, I do the same things with my younger son as well. (15.tur)

- My eldest son was not problematic like the others so I did not pay much attention to him as he was mature. He did everything but I wasn’t aware that he needed love, attention and knowledge. I was spending all my time with the other two. But now it has changed, I am more affectionate and attentive toward him. I try to share his problems. (12.tur)

- I am trying to implement the same things with the other children. I am trying to spare time for them. We sit together now, my elder daughter comes to the kitchen while I am cooking and we chat. So, you get closer. It is as if you get to know your children. We had been living together but I had never regarded this child from this perspective; you see the child from another perspective. I couldn’t see that before, maybe because I was busy with other things. After attending the course, hearing the topics, I started to pay more attention at home to see whether it was the same in our house. Then, seeing similar things at home, I realized that I hadn’t paid attention and that I had avoided certain things at times. (14.sw)

- I had never listened to my elder son, but now I really listened to him by sitting down and having eye contact. This way I am trying to correct certain things with him. For example, he would come home from school and he would talk, but I did not listen to him and share. When I realized my mistakes and corrected them, my relationship with my elder son got better. I might have lost my son if I had continued in that way. I have learned how to behave toward my son and I am trying to use it. (10.sw)

- I was already implementing what I had learned with the three of them, except for the lessons. For example, reading a book together, turning off the television and having a conversation. There were also small colorful shapes; circle and triangle, not Legos, and we were drawing using those shapes. (9.bel)

- I learned not to hurt him when there were people around and talk to him later. When there were complaints about him, I was pushing him hard, telling him not to do that behavior again, but later I started to act more prudently, I was calmer. (13.bel)

- Before the Program, I used to beat them all, yell at them and beat them when they argued. But now I talk to them. I used to beat them before the Program when they made me angry, but my behavior is now very different toward them. (11.bah)

- My son would come to me to ask for help and I used to say, “I have a headache so do it yourself,” or “I am cleaning the house now and I have a lot to do.” But now I stop what I am doing and take care of his lessons. I don’t pay much attention to housework any more. First, we do his lessons and whatever he wants, and then I do my work. So, showing attention to the child comes first now, and then comes the work. (5.sar)
- I taught my daughter how to clean up in the bathroom, the way a woman should. Then, my other daughter wasn’t paying enough attention to washing her hands, so I taught her that she might catch an illness because of that. I felt a difference in that as well. Especially as my daughter is entering puberty and she is about to have her period, I talked with her about these. I used to say that I wouldn’t teach her or talk to her about this topic until she had her period. Later I learned from my friends in the Program that I needed to be more tolerant toward teenagers as they were talking about it during the meetings. I used to shut her up by saying that she could learn about these when she gets older. But now, I have started giving more appropriate and correct answers. (19.sar)

A closer relationship

A closer relationship also was reported between the mother and the other child. The mothers stated being closer and more attentive toward the other children, as well as spending more time with them. This change in behavior was of significant importance in the establishment of close relationships.

- My elder son was very aggressive at that time. Then, I started to behave more positively toward him after having learned new things. I can say that we are now more like friends than mother and son. He shares everything with me, even when he does something wrong. We can talk and chat like friends. This was all because I was understanding. Having learned about this, I never quit. When he took a step back, I tried to get closer. I can say that we are now perfect, he is also well. (16.tur)

- After the Program, I started to get closer to them, started to hug and kiss them. It had been like that with my sons but with my daughter it had been different. It has become better and I have seen that she is very happy. Then, I regretted not having done this before. I have experienced her cuddling. (2.sw)

- It has helped my elder daughter a lot. We were both harsh and pushing each other too far. My daughter couldn’t open up to me. She was afraid to talk to me, but now she can disclose anything. (13.bel)

- I was aggressive toward my other child; I wouldn’t listen to him or show affection. I used to be angry with him all the time. One day I hugged him and he was surprised and took incredible pleasure out of the hug. He calmed down and the day I hugged him, I saw how pleased and calm he was. He used to yell a lot, he wouldn’t want to come back home, but now before leaving the house we talk and come to an agreement. He changed after this hug, he feels closer to me now. (11.bah)

- She was a bit chilly toward me, but after my attendance in MOCEP, she continues to talk to me and she has become closer. I think this changed because after MOCEP, I tried to work things out with her by talking and sharing. I used to do that before the Program, but it was rare. For example, I used to do it once a week or once in 10 days, but I have started doing it more often. This resulted in my daughter being closer to me. I believe it has helped her talk to me more comfortably. (3.sar)
Change in the Mother’s Behavior toward the People around Her

The mothers reported a change in their relationships with the people around them as well. Their statements indicated that their behavior toward their relatives and friends changed and that they have become calmer and more tolerant. They were able to express themselves better.

Was calmer and more tolerant

- I was very anxious. My reaction to people was very different. I have become an easy going person. I can express myself. When something is wrong, I can tell it in a nice way, not by being harsh. (7.tur)

- I am talking about patience, your attitude toward people change; it can be your child, your spouse or others around. (12.sw)

- When I first started the program, we were two families in the same house. Then I pulled myself back and we started having dinners separately. Now we don’t interfere with each other. It was all easy, just talking nicely and implementing it. Talking nicely to the kids and to the husband, that isn’t something very difficult. (15.bah)

Could expresses herself better

- I wouldn’t tell a friend or a relative when she had a bad habit that I didn’t like, thinking that she might be hurt, but I was hurting myself. I was usually swallowing it and worrying. Now, when there is something that I don’t like or when I don’t want to do something, I tell them straight out. I used to think that it was disrespectful to tell that, to hurt the elder people. But I have learned that actually it had nothing to do with it, that you should be able to express yourself. I didn’t know that. (18.tur)

- When you have an idea, you should tell it. After participating in the group, I learned that you should talk about it, wrong or right. Now, with friends, when I have an idea, even when it is in conflict with someone else’s, I tell it. After attending that group, you learn more about sharing, about telling your ideas. (12.sw)

- I am trying to implement what I have learned in the Program with my mother-in-law. For example, if I was aggressive toward her, I listen to her. I try to explain the consequences. (9.sw)

- You can, of course, express yourself better to friends. For example, I am against smoking in my house, I don’t like it. They would come to my house and start smoking. Now I can tell them directly that I don’t want them to smoke when there are children around as smoking is harmful for the children. Before the Program, I would get angry, but couldn’t express it. Now, I can tell even the guests that it is harmful to smoke in front of children. (2.sar)

- When my friends wanted to come over and when my child had to study, I couldn’t tell
them that I wasn’t available, thinking that they might be hurt. Now, I tell them that my child has an exam or has to study so I am not available that day. (9.sar)

- I asked for my family’s support. I wouldn’t generally do that when I had a problem but now I call them immediately and wait for their support. I want them to help me and I even wanted the help of my husband’s family. I wanted them to be included in the process. This was one of the lessons that I always remember: supportive environment. When I had a problem, I called my family, other people around, the family of my husband and asked for their support. (18.sar)

The change in the mother’s relationship toward the other people around her was not limited to the above-mentioned statements. Mothers reported that they talked about what they had learned in the Program with the people around them. They made photocopies of the handouts and distributed them to friends, neighbors and relatives.

- I have a friend. She used to beat her child a lot; she used to yell at him. I asked her why she was behaving that way, I talked to her. Then, she was convinced and told me that I was right. (13.tur)

- Sometimes I share what I know with my neighbors and friends. When we get together, for example, I witness her attitude toward her child and I interfere. I tell her not to behave that way and that she should talk or present choices, things like that. (8.bel)

- I talk to the mothers who are mad at their kids, I tell them about what I know. (5.bah)

Mothers mentioned finding solutions to the problems of their friends by using their knowledge.

- For example, one of my friends really suffered from bed wetting. I told her about the things she should do. (18.bah)

- A friend of mine had a problem with her child, who was in the second grade. She called me, thinking that I might know about it. She consulted me and benefited. (9.sar)

- I have a neighbor upstairs. Her daughter had come to visit her and her grandson swallowed a marble. They asked me what to do. I still had my papers, the handouts; I go over them sometimes to remember them better. We managed to get it out. (4.sar)

As can be understood from the mothers’ statements, change was evident in the mother’s behavior toward her other children, toward her spouse and toward the other people around her.

Changes in the Father

The indirect effects contain changes in the fathers’ behavior and attitude, as stated by the mothers. These were the changes in the father’s behavior toward the target child,
toward their other children and toward his wife. These changes in behavior brought about changes in the relationship with the target child and the spouse. Table 16 summarizes the changes observed in the fathers’ behavior.

**Change in the Father’s Behavior toward the Target Child**

The fathers were reported to have closer relationships both with the target child and with other children in the family. The mothers stated that the fathers had started spending more time with the target child, as well as behaving more consciously. However, there were some mothers who reported that the father-child relationship had already been good or that no change had been observed. Table 16 summarizes the change in the father’s behavior.

**Table 16**

*Change in the Father’s Behavior*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change in the Father’s Behavior</th>
<th>Toward the Target Child</th>
<th>Toward Other Children</th>
<th>Toward Wife</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acted with more awareness</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Spent more time with and took care of the child</td>
<td>- Was more understanding and closer</td>
<td>- Was more attentive and closer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No change</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Was more understanding, had better communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Was proud of his wife and attached importance to her ideas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Acted with more awareness**

- *He used to yell and sometimes beat him. Since MOCEP, it is over. They get along very well. It has been wonderful for both of them (S.tur)*

- *My husband would enter the children’s room without knocking on the door. I told him that we should behave the same way if we wanted them to knock on our door before entering. Then, my husband started knocking on the door before entering if the door was closed. (4.sw)*

- *He would hit our son easily and he would be angry. There has been quite a difference. For example, when he got angry, I would make him read the handouts about punishment and the harm caused by beating. It has changed a lot. The beating is now over. He is now doing everything through talking. It has been terrific. (11.sw)*

- *I could say that before the Program he wouldn’t give a choice to the child or ask for his opinion. I proposed talking to him more and asking whether he wants it or not. I am sure my son was very happy that his father didn’t drag him by force. (8.bel)*
- Before, all his life was about work. He would come home and yell at the kids. Then, one
day I told him that he had no right to beat the children. He didn’t care about them, think-
ing that they were just kids. I wanted him to accept my point of view. He has started to
give and take recently. He has been behaving toward them the way he would to an adult.
I have been taking care of the children completely, but lately I have seen that he is also
helping me. When he does something wrong toward them, he feels bad and feels respon-
sible. (20.bah)

- “You shouldn’t talk like this here, you should talk and do this to the child,” I would say,
of course not in front of the child. This has been the effect; there wasn’t much of a prob-
lem as I was also informing my husband. Since then it has changed a lot. After the
Program my husband and kids have changed a lot. He still loves them, but I believe he
has learned how to talk and where to talk. (17.sar)

**Spent more time with and took care of the child**

- It has been very good for my husband; he sits down and talks to them, has a chat and
takes care of each of them. He wouldn’t do that before. He believed that taking care was
just buying toys and taking them to the park. He didn’t know how to talk to them indi-
vidually, but thank God, he has learned that. Now, they play together although it is not
for hours, but they still have some quality time. They paint together. He wouldn’t answer
their questions, he would tell them to ask me, but now he explains to them and tells them
about anything; he reads them books. That’s the most important thing. He doesn’t like
reading, but he puts on his glasses and reads slowly and they understand well. He has a
child on each side and they read stories. Then, after my husband, the kids read the same
story. That’s a huge step. (18.tur)

- We read about it together and I also told him that we should take care of our child more,
that he had to be interested in them more when I was busy. So, he started to be more
involved with our son. He used to say that he was tired and wanted to go to bed when he
came home from work, but then he stopped that. When my son said, “Daddy, will you
come out with me? Shall we play together?” he did so. They played inside or outside,
played cards and backgammon. (2.sw)

- The truth is that I had the burden of the children, but now he helps them with their
homework, he helps our daughter with her homework. My husband would take the kids
out once a week and I learned that being a father wasn’t just that, that he had more
duties. Now, he helps our daughter with her homework, gives the children their baths. For
example, you need to let the child’s energy out. I was telling him about it so he is taking
them out more often now. The child is bored with always being at home. (4.bel)

- It has really affected a lot and his behavior changed. Now, he spends time with the chil-
dren. He buys books and notebooks for them and shows that he is taking care of them.
After my participation in the Program, he started to spend more time with them, telling
them stories. (15.bah)
- He didn’t use to share much with the kids. When he came from work, he used to watch television, a football match or a program he liked and didn’t spend much time with the children. But now he can turn off the television when necessary and take care of them. (2.sar)

No change

- There has been actually no change between the father and the children because I was not able to tell my husband about the Program. I tried once, he read the handouts and said, “It says here that we shouldn’t do this, we shouldn’t do that. They had better write the things we should do.” He wasn’t really much interested. (1.sw)

- My husband is still the same. I have learned giving, sacrificing and being softer, but he is still the same. He doesn’t learn anything by watching me. (16.bel)

Change in the Father’s Relationship with the Target Child

Closer relationship

- He is more like friends with the kids. He is not strict with the children like a typical father, but talks to them with love, his attitude while talking has changed. For example, the kids also have noticed the difference and have said that their father has changed and I told them that they had changed toward him and so he changed. He chats with them and they listen to him calmly. The setting in the family has changed. (9.tur)

- He has started showing more of what he has done to his father, the pictures, his writings. He has been sharing more with his father. Now he can show whatever he has done easily to his father, talk to him about his problems. The Program has a part in that. (4.sw)

- I told him after the Program that he shouldn’t do like that or talk that way to our daughter. My husband and my daughter have invented names like ‘little lion’ and ‘big lion’ and they play and jump together. There is a warm dialogue between the two. It is nice; they have built themselves a nest. (1.bel)

- The relationship of the children with their father is quite good. They often ask for their father when he is at work. He sometimes takes them to a restaurant, to the park or out shopping. It changed after the Program. I used to tell him not to go out alone and that children kept asking for him. In fact, I took advantage of it. He would go out 2-3 nights and then he would take us out. But he has adopted a routine and started going out rarely. (18.bah)

- He can talk about his demands to his father at the moment. That changed as we sat down and talked with my daughters. I told them to go and talk to their father themselves and ask whatever they wanted. That was the change and now they can express themselves. (20.sar)
**Had already been good, no change**

- No, no change took place because I can say that he was a good father. (15.tur)

- They get along well. When he comes home from school, he talks about what happened that day with his father. Their relationship is good, same as before. There is no change in their relationship. (3.sw)

- My husband is a concerned father so the Program didn’t have much of an effect. He was already doing the same things as the Program suggested when my son was going to school. (19.bel)

- Their relationship with their father was already good so nothing has changed. Everything got better. (2.bah)

- I don’t think so; their relationship with their father has always been good. (13.sar)

**No change**

- Nothing has changed. It is the same. (10.tur)

- There has been no change. He doesn’t have much time for the kids. (5.sw)

- I think it is still the same with the kids because my husband didn’t attend the Program. I did. (10.bel)

- My husband doesn’t spend much time with us or take us out. When he is home he is indifferent to the kids, he doesn’t talk to them. They don’t share much. (14.bah)

**Change in the Father’s Behavior toward Other Children**

Another reported change in the fathers’ behavior was that they had become more understanding of and closer to their other children.

**Was more understanding and closer**

- We have a teenager and he was passing through a difficult period at the time. I made sure that he was more understanding toward him. (16.tur)

- My daughter, being older, used to talk to her father in a formal way, she wouldn’t ask for his ideas. Now she is more sincere. When she asks me something, I tell her that this might also interest her father and that she should ask him as well. So, she asks him and understands that she has to ask us both and that she should be close to him. (5.bel)

- He used to beat our daughter, too, but thank God, it’s over. When he got nervous, I would say “MOCEP” and he would understand immediately. He has become more understanding. He used to slap for very minor things. He also used to say, “Bring this, do that” to our daughter. Now, he says, “Will you bring it? Can you help your mother” or “I am leaving.” (19.sar)
Change in the Father’s Behavior toward His Wife (Mother)

Similar to those changes toward the children, the fathers were more attentive and closer to their wives and had better communication with them. In addition, the mothers reported that the husbands were proud of their wives and attached importance to their ideas.

**Was more attentive and closer**

- He didn’t like going out as a family. We used to go out with the kids, but after the Program he proposed that we go out together, both of us probably because he has seen me relaxed. He wanted the two of us to go out, to go shopping and talk. The children even complained about it. (17.bah)

- He sometimes gets me a gift. There is change, but they are not very obvious things. He gets me a present on special occasions. (2.bah)

- He is still the same after the Program, but he has been trying to change. He bought me a car, the best model. He thinks about me a lot. (20.bah)

**Was more understanding, had better communication**

- My husband started to understand me better. He started to talk about his feelings although it is not much. He was the kind of a person who wouldn’t talk much about his feelings, especially about some problems, but now he does. (4.tur)

- My husband has changed. He used to call me just by my name. Now, he calls me umhuseyin (it means “the mother of Huseyin”) because he has seen my behavior toward my children. (7.bah)

**Was proud of his spouse and attached importance to her ideas**

- He says that the Program was good for me. “You attended the Program and you are bringing them up, and not just them, you have started to educate the ones in the street as well,” he said. He is also proud. I have become more valuable in his eyes. (13.tur)

- He used to have confidence in how I raised my children but now it’s different. This time, he is also helping me and pays attention to the problems of the children. (16.bah)

**Mother’s Role in the Indirect Effects Observed in Fathers**

The statements of the mothers revealed the fact that the change in the fathers was possible through their sharing and applying what they had learned with their husbands. The handouts distributed during the Program also seem to contribute to this change.

- I am imposing on him a lot. I keep telling him that he should spend some time with the kids, even for 10 minutes, that he should listen to them and show this by reacting like
“aha, yes”. He is now doing it like that, whereas he didn’t care much beforehand. He used to say, “I didn’t hear; I was watching television,” but now it is different. (20.tur)

- I kept talking to my husband in the “I” language, I kept talking and telling him about what we did at the meetings. He also read the handouts and was influenced by them. (13.tur)

- I believe my husband doesn’t know how to share anything with the kids, that’s why he can’t. But he has changed somewhat as I changed. Now, for example, he asks him about his feelings, about what has happened at school, about his problems with his friends and how he feels about it. There has been an improvement in this. (20.sw)

- Every week, I would come and read what I learned at MOCEF to my husband. I would share about the things that influenced me, saying we should do this or that. We were taking decisions together and later implementing them together. (15.sw)

- I started to reflect and tell more about what I learned at MOCEF to my husband. I had reactions like “Let’s do like that,” “Look, we were doing that wrong.” (8.bel)

- We now go out together. He didn’t mind taking us out to have dinner, but I used to tell him that we don’t need just food, but his love and attention and that we needed to talk to each other. Now, he spends time with the kids, buys books and notebooks for them and makes them feel his attention. He wouldn’t read books, but after I attended the Program, he started sitting down with them and reading them books. He is trying to change things fast. (15.bah)

- I have always shared with my husband whatever we talked about at the meetings, saying what we worked on and what we wrote. I used to write down most of the things we were talking and telling my husband about it as he was aggressive toward the kids. I was bringing the handouts home and writing as much as I could during the meetings to bring them to my husband. (5.sar)
Various quantitative studies that have evaluated the Program have revealed that the Program created changes in mothers and in children, and even in other people in the family. This research indicated similar results, as can be seen from the previous section. The following question is to find out what brought about this change. The mothers’ statements indicated that many factors helped create the change after the Program started. The experiences of the mother during her participation in the Program and during the implementations headed the list. These experiences were seen to be effective in the change of the mother and the people around her. The group process that mothers experienced while participating in MSP and the feelings and experiences while doing the CEPs with the child contributed to the change separately. One of the most important factors during implementation was the teacher. The mother’s interaction and communication with the teacher added considerably to the change. The mother’s feelings and ideas about what she had learned and about the positive results she got after implementation contributed to the process of change as well. The feedback received from other people and the support provided to ease her participation in the Program facilitated the process. During the Program, the mother compared how she had been brought up with the child rearing practices mentioned in the Program. The similarities and differences contributed greatly to her applications, and therefore, to the change experienced.
How Does the Group Process Contribute to Change?

During the group process, the mother felt a sense of belonging to the group, felt relieved through sharing, learned from what other people have shared, and tried to find the right way in child rearing methods. The woman felt that she was not alone when she listened to other mothers and realized that she was not the only one experiencing these problems. In addition, she felt valuable as she was listened to by all the other mothers in the group. These all helped the mother enjoy the group process.

By creating a sense of belonging and team spirit

As the mothers attended the meetings regularly, they developed a sense of belonging to the group. The mother felt that the group was like a team and that she was a “MOCEF mother.” The feeling of togetherness the mothers experienced in the group motivated their attendance and helped the implementation. Forming friendships in the group and having common points with all the mothers, helped create this feeling of togetherness. The mothers in the group had children who were close in age and all the mothers participated in the Program to support the development of their children. These two factors constituted the common points that enabled the mothers to share more easily in the group and get closer to each other.

- We became like a family, like friends, as I said. We were asking our questions, talking, chatting and sharing with each other. We learned to share, whether it was about our children or ourselves. We saw our rights and wrongs. (3.tur)

- What made us a group was the fact that we shared the same things, our topics were the same. There was no difference between us. We were very much alike. Our talks, our being together, common points and when you see that you are getting along well, there emerges a group. (18.sw)

- Everyone was talking about the same thing, about children, so everyone could express herself easily. When someone had made a mistake, she would tell about it, others would talk about what they did right and comments were made accordingly. It was nice. The problem of all the women living here was being trapped between their husbands and their in-laws and they directed their anger toward their children. We were talking about the same things in the group; the problems were all the same. These problems brought us closer. The common problem was the child, not giving enough attention to the child, not knowing what to do and how to behave toward the child. (1.bel)

- There develops a sense of belonging in the group. They know about you and you know everything about them. For example, when I see someone 2-3 times, I can’t trust her and open up, but in the group we were very comfortable after the second week. There was trust and we could open up. It was like women’s solidarity. I need at least a year of friendship to trust someone, but here that bond was formed after the second week. (19.bel)
- My greatest wish was to attend this group and to be in the same environment with many other people, mothers, and I was able to realize this wish. There were a lot of mothers in the group and we all had the same problems and goals. We understood how to behave toward each other as our problems were the same. Attending this Program and experiencing this was great. We were supporting and missing each other. (3.bah)

- We really understood each other very well upon sharing. Most of them had children who were the same age. I felt like I was the one experiencing it when someone told about her problem and so, I felt myself close. People also were very sincere. Their experiences were very similar to mine and we understood each other very well. There was really no difficulty in understanding. Yes, I believe we were a good group. (14.sar)

**By providing relief and psychological support**

The mother said that she felt relieved by sharing her problems in the group. Sharing her problems provided her psychological support and helped her relax by getting away from her problems at home.

- I felt comfortable when I went there, it was like therapy. I learned about myself there; I come from a very social family and the way I was brought up was very different. That’s why coming here was a change and I was relieved when I attended the meetings. We used to talk with the friends; I had friends coming from different backgrounds. I had a wonderful time with them. The most important thing for me was that it was like therapy. (20.tur)

- If affected me a lot. I don’t know how to put it but it was like a therapy. I used to be very nervous and very intolerant toward my children. Coming here relaxes me. I am telling about it to my husband as well and he also noticed it. I have benefited a lot, thank God. The talks relieved me. When there is holiday for 2-3 weeks, my impatience toward my child’s behavior starts again. I feel happy that the meetings begin. I feel at ease when I attend the meetings, I go home with joy, feeling relieved. (11.sw)

- We used to talk about children, everything about ourselves as women, even sexuality. We started talking about things that we couldn’t with others because there was no shame here. You can’t go and tell a psychologist you don’t know about everything; they wouldn’t understand because they are foreigners. This Program has been such a relief for me. (18.bel)

- I felt relieved after I had participated in this Program as I felt less pressure. I used to be home all day and I had to leave the house for the Program. Going out and seeing other people helps you relax psychologically. You talk to different people. The meetings affected me a lot and made me comfortable. I noted down everything the teacher said and I am still reading them. You come back home feeling at ease, not like returning home from a program because we weren’t bored there. (17.bah)

- The group meetings were very effective. The talks of the mothers were useful and very
psychological in my opinion, they contributed to good communication because you can’t talk to anyone here, and there is no communication, no social activity. That’s why it was very good. You talk to all the families and get to know the people you don’t know. The meetings are like a therapy for us, you talk to mothers, mothers talk about their problems. They say, “My son did this, my daughter did that.” I believe it is very effective. (17.sar)

By sharing and by providing the right environment to get at the truth

The mothers had the opportunity to hear about other mothers’ experiences and about the solutions they had come up with in the group process. The topics that they could not talk or ask about were voiced by other mothers in the group. They realized what they had done wrong and evaluated what they had done right. Mothers reported that the group process had provided them with a chance to undertake the solutions and methods they heard and liked.

- When a friend had a problem, she voiced it, we talked about it and the teacher answered. That way we could reach something through sharing our problems, through mutual support. The environment was comfortable; we could ask and answer questions; there was better expression of ourselves in such an environment. For example, sometimes a friend asked my question before I did as she was experiencing the same problem. She would ask it even if I couldn’t, that way I could benefit. (19.tur)

- Everyone has an idea and you can get a very good idea from someone you wouldn’t expect. For example, when she talks about her problems, it might be something that I don’t have at that moment, but it doesn’t mean that I will never experience it. When they talked about a problem I hadn’t experienced yet, they were also talking about the solution. I recorded it at that moment. That’s why I was able to solve that problem when I later had it. I liked it for this reason. Other mothers had problems that I wouldn’t have thought of, but listening to others’ problems and finding solutions, we actually answered a lot of questions. For example, they had older children and we benefited from what they did with their teenagers. (17.tur)

- Some mothers shared their experiences after the implementations during the meetings and that helped me. I was aware of the reactions I would get when I implemented the same thing to my child and knew how to behave. Other mothers’ talking about what they had gone through was helpful to me. (20. sw)

- I gained a lot from the mothers’ examples, apart from what I learned in the Program. “Yes, I can do it like that,” I said sometimes. There were some things that I implemented at home. It really contributed a lot to me in that respect. Not just the topics we learned, but other mothers’ comments really helped me. When they said, “I experienced this in my house, with my son, daughter or husband, but we reached some decisions,” I thought that we were having the same experiences so I could do something similar as well. (15.sw)

- For example, when I was telling about something, one mother was talking about what
she did and another was giving her own opinion and I was impressed. I was sometimes yelling at my son but what was the use? A friend had 3 children and she said that she didn’t shout at her kids. I was judging myself thinking that I had only one child, but still shouting like a crazy woman. I realized my mistakes by thinking about her and her three children. I didn’t want my child to suffer more. (6.bel)

- For example, when a friend said that she had never beaten her child, it affected me. I questioned why I was beating my child when she didn’t. I felt awkward for behaving like that with my kids. She probably was not perfect, she probably had problems at home as well, but she could control herself and I couldn’t. I questioned myself for this. That was a good example. I thought that I shouldn’t be doing that. I had a lot of problems, but that didn’t give me the right to behave like that toward my children. (17.bel)

- During the meetings, everyone had experiences, they coped with stubborn children, and that affected me. I heard and benefited from their comments and point of views. I tried to implement what I had learned. We were sitting and talking about our problems. Solutions came up; everyone implemented those and commented on them. We benefitted; it had a positive effect on us. (10.bah)

- We talked about certain things every week and we all learned from the group, from other friends. Mothers were telling about what they had done the following week, and I was telling about what I did. That was the advantage of being in a group; we were hearing about different opinions when mothers talked. That was sort of a support. When everyone talked about what he did, everyone learned something from someone. There were things that I took as an example. There were things that I envied. Some women were studying to get middle school or high school diplomas. I liked that very much, it affected and motivated me. I told myself that I could do it as well, she had so many children and I had so many children, we had similar job opportunities. (14.sar)

- Questions to each other, when someone was talking, another question came out from the things she said or someone asked a question that another hesitated to pose. I was getting information from her questions; I was taking lessons from her experiences. For example, she was telling about her experience with her child saying that her child didn’t like or accept something. So, I was trying the same thing in a different way with my daughter. We motivated each other. You hear that other mothers did this or that so you ask yourself why you couldn’t do the same thing. In a way, you compete with other mothers. If we hadn’t been in a group, I could have renounced thinking that nobody was seeing me, so why bother? (18.sar)

By making her feel that she was not the only one

During this process of change, when mothers heard about each other’s lives during the meetings, they realized that they were not the only one, and that others also had similar problems.
- When you talk about various problems with those friends, you are relieved after seeing that another mother has the same problem. It gave me the opportunity to talk about these problems. You feel relieved seeing that you are not the only one experiencing that problem. (11.tur)

- Seeing that I wasn’t alone made me feel good. There were a lot of mothers like me, making the same mistakes that I did; I wasn’t the only one and that was something nice. It sort of relieved my feelings of guilt. It was so nice experiencing those feelings; it feels as if I have always been accused, humiliated and suffered, but seeing other people around, you tell yourself that you aren’t the only one. (14.tur)

- You can be more tolerant toward the other person who talks about a subject that you fear and hesitate to bring up. Upon hearing him, you become more courageous. For example, a person only knows about his own ideas and actions, but when you hear about the same behavior from another person and when you realize that he is also disturbed by that and tries to change it, you think differently. (17.sw)

- You see that the problem is not only between you and your child; you are not alone in that. There are others and they try out different methods to solve a problem. As I said before, you find a new way to solve a problem in the group and so you return home more satisfied. This becomes a new reason to attend the Program. (8.sw)

- It affects you as you say, “This is not only my problem and this is actually not a problem.” This is not a problem, I have been considering it a problem, but these are normal things. (12.bel)

- The fact that the mothers had the same problems during the meetings relieved me. We all had the same problems and that was a motivation for me; I thought that they would probably be solved. (1.bah)

- The talks about the problems related with children were nice. I am not the only one who experienced these problems. There are other people; hearing that was a relief. When you are home alone, you think that only your child has that problem, but when you listen to other people, you understand that it’s normal. There was relief in that respect. (6.sar)

By making her feel valuable as she was listened to by other mothers

There has been a change in the mothers’ feelings and ideas about themselves during the group process. Mothers started to consider themselves valuable as they were treated equally, as their ideas were listened to and valued in the group.

- It taught me that I was valued, that my feelings and ideas were valuable. When I was speaking during the meetings, everyone listened to me. That was important to me. It was as if they told me that I existed, that I was an individual who could talk about her rights. “Everyone does and should respect you and you should respect the others.” This feeling was given to me. (14.tur)
Everybody was listening when a mother talked. There was no problem. If she knew anything about that subject, she would talk about it because everyone had similar problems. I enjoyed all the mothers coming together and sharing. Everyone was talking, our teacher was telling about things. (1.sw)

Sometimes you talk about something and the other person makes you feel whether s/he takes you seriously or not by giving an answer or s/he gets bored while you are talking and doesn’t want to listen to you. It wasn’t like that; we were all listening to each other. (12.bel)

Our teacher was letting all of us talk, we were all telling our opinions and you feel that you are valued there. (4.bel)

Our teacher was listening to us; pleasant chatting, qualified time. There were people there who didn’t gossip and who tried to find solutions to their problems so they didn’t waste their time. If there hadn’t been such an environment, if it had been like a seminar where the teacher comes, gives a speech and leaves, this wouldn’t have been meaningful for me. If I can talk about a topic, I can internalize it. I should be talking, generating ideas, and thinking. (15.sar)

**By the experiences at the group**

You get to know other people, friends. Everyone shares something during those meetings; you share your feelings from the past. You learn about everything there, from children to environmental influences, to women’s health. You make friends there and share things. We didn’t see each other outside the Program, but it was as if we had known each other for years; we were sharing, talking and laughing. We felt close to each other as we were all there for our children and talking about the things happening in the family. (1.tur)

My mood changed there, you are out of your usual home mood. You go to a place where you talk to your friends and have fun. You get information on certain topics. There is joy and you are motivated because it is a different setting. It was better for me to go to the meetings than sitting at home. That was important. (13.sw)

When a person meets others, she learns new things, becomes more active and social. When she is at home, she lives with the knowledge she has, but when she meets new people, it is different; you can talk about your ideas. In the Program, you are among people and learn the things you don’t know. When a person comes to this country, she wants a close friend, and when she can’t find one, she can be stressed. But when you start MOCEP, when you go to a school and get to know some friends, you start seeing the country as your homeland. You don’t notice it any more. (14.bel)

I don’t go out much and the first day when I went there, I didn’t know many people. I didn’t even know how to sit, how to go there, but I introduced myself and it was fun. I liked it. I did not think of being absent for even a day. I tried very hard not to be late. It was actually like staying home because it was all about what was happening at home. I felt at ease
in the group and could express my ideas freely. (16.bah)

- For example, I came here and I didn’t know many people, I wasn’t seeing many people. I was busy with 4 kids. It is better in a group of friends; we sympathized with each other and with our teacher. It was a warm environment like a warm family environment. It was nice. The environment was warm and we were like a family. It was pleasant and we had a nice time. We didn’t get bored during the meetings. (2.sar)

Furthermore, the group process provided them with a social environment. Especially the mothers living abroad found an opportunity to go out and meet new people and talk to them. They shared things in the group, formed friendships and learned appropriate behaviors.

- When we heard about the Program, everyone rushed to participate. We were all very happy about it, everyone needed it. It is a social event for us as we have nothing to do, just the house, cleaning and children. If you work, that isn’t very different but when you attend something like that, we do something and learn both for us and for our children. (1.sw)

- The Turks didn’t do anything here; there weren’t any activities for Turkish women. They go to work, come home, feed the child and that was all. I wasn’t doing anything other than that. I was very happy when I first heard about this Program. I said, “How nice, there are people thinking about the women here.” (9.bel)

- I was waiting impatiently to go to school that day, I would get dressed and put on some make-up; I even prepared a bag in which to put the CEPs. It was such a desire, such an excitement to leave the house and see friends. It wasn’t just seeing friends though; you would learn and teach new things; that was also important. There were ideas you got from other mothers. There were different opinions, “How did your child work, could s/he do that, understand that” were the things we shared. It was an excitement. I really liked it. (20.bel)

- I just wanted to get away from the house, I wanted to rest a bit, and I wanted my soul to be peaceful. That’s why I attended the Program. (15.sar)

- I had no friends; I was home between four walls, so I came. You come here, you have friends and a teacher and you get out of that mood. (2.sar)

During the Program, the mothers also mentioned the importance of reaching decisions through group discussion and not being dependent on the teacher.

- Our teacher listened to us. We gave examples from ourselves at times; we expressed our ideas and talked. We were both studying and chatting. It wasn’t a boring lesson. Pleasant conversation, quality time. If we hadn’t had that environment, if it had been like a seminar where the teacher did all the talking, it wouldn’t have meant anything for me. When
I talk and share about a topic, I can internalize it. That’s how I believe. I should talk, I should generate ideas, I should think as well. Just talking and letting people go without thinking .... (15.sar)

- How Does the Teacher Contribute to Change?

Besides the group process, it was seen that the teacher was an important agent in this process of change. The teacher’s mastery in implementing the Program, her personality, her communication style and her being a role model for the mothers led to an effective group process and motivated the mothers to use their knowledge.

Through her mastery in implementing the content

- She was a person who had had a thorough life, she had experience. She was knowledgeable. She wasn’t just reading from the book during the meetings. She would always talk, give examples, and make good connections between topics. (15.tur)

- She could answer our every question, she was knowledgeable. (3.tur)

- When I didn’t agree with what she was telling about she would explain it again and again .. At the end I was able to get her point. (10.sw)

- She had education and more experience. She tried to do something for us and she was successful; you could understand it from her talks, from what she taught us. She didn’t just read her notes, she was explaining them and giving many examples about the topic. She would tell us again and again, give us information. (7.bel)

- She explained with confidence. She was older than us and her education was better as well. She was not explaining something she didn’t know about, of course she knew about that topic. She was assuring. (16.bel)

- She was always well-prepared; her experience and her manners were excellent. She managed well; when there was something she didn’t want to talk about, she could sum it up and return to the topic she wanted to talk about. (1.bah)

- She described things well; her explanations were clear. I could really understand her explanations. There is one thing I am certain, she was very knowledgeable. She was sincere. (14.sar)

- She was supportive, transferring information as best as she could. She would even give herself as an example. She was trying to contribute from her life, her behavior. She was first of all, a mother, and then she was educated and she always gave examples from her life, so I believe she was knowledgeable. She told us about her experiences with her child. (1.sar)

Through her personality and her personal relationships

- She would help us in everything. When we had a problem, she would certainly call us
and spare us the time. I never heard her say that she didn’t have the time or that she couldn’t get involved. She wanted to get to know our children; she told us to bring along our children to do CEP together so that they could both get to know each other. (15.tur)

- It wasn’t just the lesson; she would inquire after our health and give us information. She was very friendly; we could talk to her about anything. When we felt bored, when we had a problem, we could go and talk to her and she would listen. She bore with us like a mother. She listened to us and helped those who needed it. When she couldn’t help us herself, she found other resources. She was a teacher as valuable as a mother to me. (13.tur)

- Her way of attracting our attention to the topic and gathering us; she would sit on the stool, she wouldn’t stand up or stand back. She would look into our eyes while talking. When I was daydreaming, I would see the way she was looking at and if she was looking at me, I would pull myself together. (10.sw)

- She did not act like a teacher; she was more like a sincere, true friend. She gave confidence at first because she gave examples of herself and she criticized herself. She listened to you and tried to find a solution accordingly. You felt that she wanted the best for you and that you could trust her. (17.sw)

- Our relationship was very close; she was very warm and friendly. She didn’t act like a teacher, making us feel, “I am more knowledgeable than you are.” It was as if we have known her for a long time, not someone we had met recently. She was so warm and tender. She would talk about anything in detail when you asked her. She wasn’t trying to get rid of you. She was so good. She acted warmly. (18.sw)

- Our teacher behaved toward us like a friend. She gave examples from her own life and talked fluently. She also listened to us all. She was directing us taking into consideration our cultural level and character. She listened to us, which I really liked. (4.bel)

- Just like a friend. We considered her as a friend, not as a teacher. She was genuine and we would tell her anything. She was the same with everyone. For example, when you wanted to ask about something other than school, when there was paperwork to be done, she was helpful. She would help people who didn’t know the language. She was very helpful. (19.bel)

- When our teacher talked, it was as if she felt us, she lived with us. She used to ask “What did you do, did you use it, was it effective?” to see whether we had implemented what we had learned, benefited from it or changed as a result. She would listen to our ideas. (7.bah)

- We had a very good dialogue with our teacher, like a sister, a mother. They behaved the same, equal to us all. There was no difference between us. They acted nicely. (20.sar)

Through setting a good example

- She was a real example to me. She was a very different kind of person and I met such a
person the first time in my life. She stood on her own feet, she knew that what she did know was right and she could stand by her ideas, and she could express herself perfectly. She was perfect; I had not seen such a person in my life. She set a good example and I was very glad that I attended her course, I was very lucky for that. She reminded us who we were, that we were women, human beings and individuals and that we had our rights. I was very lucky in that respect. (14.tur)

- She showed us how to talk like a friend and what we could do with our child, asking him/her questions and sharing our worries. We learned those, I didn’t believe I could do that. We saw that she was a mother; she was a mother raising her children although she was a teacher for us. She was a role model for us. (8.sw)

- I learned how to be friendly and patient from her. I tried to behave the same way to my son. I considered her to be an example to me with her sincere manners. For example, I witnessed how to tell a person that he was wrong, or that he had a fault without breaking his heart through her behavior. There aren’t probably so many people on earth who are as patient and as modest as she was. I consider her like that. (9.bel)

- Her patience and punctuality affected me considerably. She was my role model. (1.bah)

On the other hand, especially two mothers in Switzerland made negative statements about the teacher. They reported that the teacher lacked mastery over the topics and did not have enough experience. The mothers stated that they could not get answers to their questions. One mother complained about the teacher coming to the class with inadequate preparation.

- When there was a question about the topic, when someone said, “We have such a problem. What can we do about it?” she should have contributed more as she was the one presenting the material. She would, for example, ask the same question to the mothers in general, not just to me, but when there was no answer from the group it was left up in the air. If there had been someone more knowledgeable about these topics, the questions would have been answered. I would have preferred a more knowledgeable and experienced teacher, who really had this as a profession. It wasn’t her field, she was the teacher of the course, but some questions were left up in the air. She couldn’t answer them, it wasn’t satisfactory. In fact, she mostly followed the material. (14.sw)

- There were times when the discussions got off-topic, our attention was sometimes lost. Classroom management is very important in these courses; the teachers know this much better. Sticking to the topic at hand is very important because it’s very difficult to refocus. (15.sw)

- She would make us do her work, for example, she would make us do the things she was supposed to do. For example, she had to make photocopies, but came to class without the material. She should have been prepared. She should have taken care of the photocopies of CEP, the missing material. She was the teacher and she should have done her job better. (14.sw)
How Does the Implementation of the Cognitive Education Program Contribute to Change?

Although the activities of the CEP directly aim at the child’s development, the mothers’ statements indicated that implementing the CEP together with the child was influential on the change reported in the mothers.

Proud and happy as she contributed to her child’s development

The mothers felt that they had contributed to their child’s development by doing these activities and this made them proud and happy.

- We learn everything about life in school and so does my child. I was also aware that the real education starts at home, that a child can be successful in the future by what he gets from his parents. It makes you proud. I know that I teach my child. If I had passed on to my child wrong things, he would have learned wrong things and he wouldn’t have been successful at school. I have taught good things so I now see its benefits. (14.bel)

- It is a feeling that gives you responsibility and I was happy to be able to do that and I did that. I can provide my child with certain things. (16.bel)

- Isn’t this something that would make everyone happy? Giving the child something, being beneficial to the child, makes you happy. I help my child to stand on her two feet. Even if I am not around her, she can handle these things successfully. Her self-confidence increases. She knows what to talk about and how to behave at school even if I am not with her. (13.sar)

- I felt very positive things. I had great pleasure while studying the CEPs with him because I was teaching him something. I did it myself; we did it together with my husband. There was a lot of effort and the more the effort, the more the love. (8.sar)

Got to know her child better, guided her about her child

The mothers also expressed getting to know their child better while doing the activities of CEP such as finding out what s/he knows and what s/he does not know while being beneficial to the child. The implementation of these activities also taught them new methods that they could use with their children. The mother had more confidence in herself as the CEP activities worked as a guide about how to be helpful to her child in the future as well.

- I was very happy to see that she was learning and getting along. It feels good to know what she can accomplish or what she will do at school. (1.sw)

- The CEPs guided me, if I may talk on my behalf; they showed me how I should behave. You should certainly know about a method and we learned about it after studying the CEP’s. It provided me with a method; it taught me how to give education. I have found the key to that. (8.sw)
- Helping the child with the lessons, learning where to start from; I wouldn’t have known about these if I hadn’t attended the Program. I have learned how to behave. (14.bel)

- After attending the Program, I learned about what was given and what could be taught to the child and how they were taught actually, so that I should teach it the same way. (13.sar)

Believed and felt that her place in her child’s eye has changed

The child, on the other hand, was reported to be very happy and excited that her mother was going to school. Through studying the CEPs, the child realized that his/her mother was knowledgeable and that she could teach him/her as well.

- She regarded me as a teacher while we were studying the CEPs, but right after that, I was changing into my mother role again. When she made a mistake, she would hesitate and worry. I didn’t want to be too intimate with her while studying as she saw me as her teacher and that was better. (3.tur)

- She has more confidence in me, her perspective has changed. She thinks “My mom can do it.” It has been so nice, we have come closer. (14.tur)

- The child is aware that although her mother doesn’t go to school at the moment, she knows as much as she does and that she could learn some things from her. For example, she comes and asks me how she can do something. She considers me knowledgeable because when needed I give her my opinion. She might not like my idea at that very moment, but when the teacher states the same thing at school, she becomes certain that I am knowledgeable. (14.bel)

- They are happy because their mother is receiving some education. (1.bah)

- For example, my children were proud of me on the day of the certificate ceremony. It was really good for them especially and I believe it will leave a good imprint on them. It has been a good example for them to understand that nothing can be gained without studying, working or earning. (17.sar)

- My son was really very happy that I was going to a school. (6.sar)

• How do the Content and the Implementations Contribute to Change?

The mothers mentioned that they had received information that was both practical and that met their needs. They added that the more information they received, the more they realized what they need to do. The mothers also stated that they had implemented the information received and experienced that it proved useful. They also reported that when they received information similar to what they had already known, they were able to implement things more easily.
Received new information

The mothers reported that they had received new information from the Program that was practicable and that met their needs. This was important in adopting and implementing the Program.

- I learned to study with my child before he started school. I learned how to make my child study, how to set the environment, how to ask and answer questions. He would start the first year and I would be blank and would be trying to figure out how to do that. I learned them all before he started school. I got to know both myself and my child. (15.tur)

- After attending that course, I learned more about how a mother should behave and what happens if the child behaves in a certain way. No matter how much I inquired, it wasn’t enough. I learned more things there. No matter how much I searched and read from some sources, it was different there. (12.sw)

- I realized that my behavior was wrong. When you get information like that, you come to your senses and realize what you have done. We were not aware of that until that time; I became aware thanks to the Program. We did not know about these. (11.sw)

- It taught me how to be helpful to my child and was beneficial to my child as well. Of course, I improved in the first place because even if you are the mother, you are stuck at some point, you don’t know how to talk about and explain certain things. Our mothers brought us up, but we aren’t the same any more, times are changing, conditions for raising a child are changing and this Program has helped me a lot. (20.bel)

- I already knew deep down that some things were wrong. I didn’t know what to do or how to fix things. I was ready for the Program from the first day, I was comfortable. I was ready to be confronted with lots of new information. (8.bah)

- I realized that a lot of things were wrong in my behavior and I tried to change it. I believe what I saw and learned from the Program are the most important reasons for this. It was told that the child should be satisfied at home and should be loved; that you will get back as much love as you give to the child. That information was new to me. (9.bah)

- Every day there was a different topic. When you try to implement them, you realize your mistakes and you try to change them. You become knowledgeable. (6.sar)

Received practical information

The mothers reported that they had found the implementation of the Program easy and that it had provided them with a change to put new things into practice.

- Every topic, whether it was about the child, about our husbands or about us, everything that the teacher talked about attracted our attention. I wanted to attend to learn new things, not to continue being ignorant. (10.tur)
- You learn about your mistakes there, about your incorrect behavior. You learn about health and child care starting from infant care until s/he reaches 20 years of age. You learn what you are supposed to do with the child. I was surprised to have experienced this all and that’s why it was good. (7.tur)

- For example, you get new information and learn that what you already know is wrong and then you think about it and try to change it once you are convinced. After that, when you see the benefits and positive effects after this change, it is enough, you feel satisfied. (17.sw)

- Actually it was like a sailor sailing his ship alone, like the old people say, because I was able to do something with everyone after the Program. Now, everybody doesn’t rely on one person only, there is a distribution in our responsibilities. I could guide my husband and my children. (3.bah)

- The things that the teacher and our friends talked about influenced me. I became more ambitious after my experiences and after studying CEP books with my child. I didn’t expect the teacher to tell us about child nutrition and education. I didn’t know that they would talk about what was right and what was wrong. (11.sar)

Realized their strengths and weaknesses

When the mothers applied the information which they had acquired from the Program, they realized their strengths and weaknesses.

- I saw my mistakes and found myself. The Program helped me see my mistakes and I am happy for this reason. Otherwise, it could have come back to me negatively. (10.sw)

- I saw many deficiencies. First of all, I realized that we weren’t showing enough attention to our children, we weren’t sparing time for them but that they needed to talk. (2.sw)

- I understood that I needed to be milder and more tolerant instead of being a very strict mother. I saw my mistakes about that. If I hadn’t attended this Program, if I hadn’t corrected my mistakes, I would have educated my children in the wrong way. Fortunately, I participated in the Program. (3.bel)

- That I certainly had to change myself; in every meeting, I wanted to change everything about myself. Every meeting motivated and supported me toward change because this Program was very different and our behavior was so wrong. (11.bah)

- I felt a deficiency in me after attending MOCEP, after having received new information there and I thought that I had to change. (19.sar)

Experienced the positive outcomes of the implementations

The mothers found solutions to their problems and as they applied this information, they understood that the Program worked.

- When you hear about them in class and when you implement them, you see the difference in outcome. (2.tur)
- During the meetings, whenever my behavior was wrong according to what the teacher had said, I tried to correct it immediately and applied it. I saw the positive effects. (11.sw)

- About having difficulty, when you think about certain things and understand what is more useful and what is useless, and when you experience the benefits, you don’t feel any difficulty in changing it. (17.sw)

- When you apply the things in the Program, when everything goes smoothly, you like it. When everything moves forward, you continue in the same way because it appeals to you. (5.bel)

- I witnessed how my child changed during my attendance in the Program. When I realized this change, I wanted to continue this with my children. (12.bah)

- When we implemented the things we learned in the Program and witnessed its effects on the child, it was so different. I really believed then that it was right. When I applied it to the child, and saw its benefits, I then said, “What they say is really true.” This has happened often, I mean there were things that at first I didn’t believe in much, but later, I changed my mind. (14.sar)

**Provided an opportunity for application**

Some mothers reported that they had already known some of the things mentioned in the Program, but that they had not been able to put them into use. However, being exposed to this information in the Program seems to have helped the mothers in their application.

- It wasn’t the settling of an issue, it was the fact that the solutions were very easy. They tell you that the problems actually aren’t that important and that there is no need to exaggerate, that it is possible to solve things easily. (5.tur)

- They weren’t things that we didn’t know, we normally know how to behave and what to do, we are aware of that. The Program provided us with an opportunity to practice that. (2.sw)

- There are times when you didn’t know how to settle things, for example, at home you have a problem that you can’t solve with your child. Then, at an unexpected moment you remember something that was talked about in the Program and that becomes a means for solution. (2.sar)

**Enabled implementation of what she has already known**

- We knew these things, but they weren’t in use, we weren’t implementing them. It helped us start implementing. (17.tur)

- I experienced definitely a major change, not a minor one. The topics I heard there weren’t new, I had heard them before but had not been able to apply them. After attending the Program, we learned how to do it, how to behave and apply our knowledge. (3.bah)
- Most of the things that the teacher talked about were the things we had already known. We believed they were right but wouldn’t apply them. But after attending this Program, we forced ourselves to implement the Program as much as we could. (17.sar)

- I have books myself and I had already been reading about nutrition, for example, but talking about it with others in the class environment was like getting approval, you were more certain. You had to because the next time you went to the meeting, you would have to talk about your experiences in the group. In addition, I needed to implement them to make what I have learned last. (9.sar)

**Felt positive thoughts and feelings during implementation**

While the mothers were going through all these experiences, they had various feelings that helped the implementation and that supported this change in themselves. When they practiced what they had learned and experienced its benefits and effectiveness, they talked about “having a clear conscience” as they believed they were doing the right thing. They “felt lucky and privileged” as they were supported and as they learned new information. They also talked about an “increased self-confidence” as a result of all they had learned and accomplished.

**Had a clear conscience**

- I had not given him anything until today other than just feeding him and changing his diaper. I am very sorry for that, I have a guilty conscience. After he is 6, after participating in MOCEP and listening to those, I understood that I’m a mother, I understand my feelings. I have made many mistakes. (9.tur)

- Beating was very common in my town, I was beaten a lot as well. Both my son and my daughter were also beaten. I’ve learned that beating is very wrong and when I first started the Program, I had a guilty conscience. I had always been interested in my problems, I hadn’t talked to them or I hadn’t seen them as an individual and showed attention. These still disturb me. (14.tur)

- What I did was really wrong, very bad. If I had known it before, I wouldn’t have done it. I wish I hadn’t done it to both of my children, I regret it now. I regret very much for what I did to my son because the children tell me all the time that I made them suffer a lot. They wouldn’t study, I would beat them, they wouldn’t do something and so I would beat them. I wasn’t able to control myself or I needed to see a psychologist and talk about these. (13.bel)

- I was regretful during the meetings. At that time, I realized that I was the one who was wrong, that my child was actually right. Later, when I felt that I was unjust toward him, I would try to be kind and I would apologize, saying that it was a mistake and that I was nervous and couldn’t help it. (8.bel)

- It was a pity, she didn’t have a normal childhood, and I used to forbid her to play. I was incredibly nervous and I beat her a lot, but thank God, she has order now. (4.bah)
- I used to feel sorry thinking that I have behaved like this toward my other children until that day and it was wrong so I shouldn’t continue doing it, that I should do things in another way. You start to have this idea in mind. (2.sar)

**Felt lucky and privileged**

- I feel very lucky to have attended this Program. It was like a dream for me, it didn’t occur to me that such a thing could take place here. As I said, tests are made on children here in preschools and especially foreigners don’t know about these tests, they don’t know what is applied. We have seen about those in the Program and this made me very happy. I was really happy that such a program was carried out here in Turkish. (7.sw)

- Lucky. I feel myself a lucky woman. It was a good coincidence that I went there. I wouldn’t have known about these things if I hadn’t attended the Program. Some of my ideas might have been different then. (9.bel)

- I feel myself very well, lucky. If this Program had been in Turkey, I wouldn’t have attended. Maybe, my turn wouldn’t have come because I would have chosen another school if that didn’t work. I don’t think I would have needed such a thing in Turkey; I couldn’t possibly have the free time. Of course I feel lucky; it is a chance for a child and a mother living abroad. We did CEPs together; we did a lot of things. (15.sar)

**Had more confidence, felt supported**

- Our knowledge increased. I feel good when I get new information, even for a few hours. I have confidence because I know how to raise my daughter. You relax because your self-confidence increases when you become conscious. (1.sw)

- I felt like I was in Turkey as we were brought up there. I found my former personality. I felt as if I was in a school in Turkey. (3.bel)

- At the end of the Program, I felt a very different type of relief and I’ll definitely attend programs of this sort. I need to be open to new things as long as I have a child. I have felt great benefit. I was trying to tell everyone about what I had heard in the Program, I was trying to implement them all. That’s why I felt an incredible relief. (3.bah)

- I now have different ideas about the future. My confidence increased. I liked getting education. I felt as if I was born to get an education. I felt very much at ease. I realized that every kind of education is good. I want a high school diploma first. I’ll try if I can get the support of my family and my husband. (14.sar)

- They taught me the kinds of rights I had. Laws change continuously so we can’t follow. I didn’t know about the women’s associations, for example or I learned that my personal goods, goods that are under my name are mine. (18.sar)
How Does the Comparison of Practices in Child Upbringing Contribute to Change?

The mothers reported that they had compared how they had been brought up with the child rearing practices covered in the Program. The mothers were either “happy” or “unhappy” about how they had been brought up. It was concluded that this happiness or unhappiness had contributed to the change in the mothers.

Different and not content

- I didn’t want to raise my child like my family did. I have always wanted to be a supportive family. I have wanted to raise my child by providing him with good conditions and opportunities and by supporting him. (19.tur)

- I experienced violence. I lived through it; I won’t allow my child to experience it. I don’t want to do that, I didn’t do that and I won’t do that. My mother used to wait and then she would burst out angrily. Then we would cry and I would be very much influenced by that. I thought about those things when we talked about these topics in MOCEF. My childhood was so much different from what was mentioned there, the things that shouldn’t be done, that were wrong. You think that you won’t do it the same way as your mother did. (7.tur)

- In my family, you couldn’t tell anything to the father or the mother, there was a huge gap in between. But now I have the awareness to share everything with my child. Generally, we couldn’t sit down together at the table with the elder people, first they would eat and then the children. In fact, those tables, those times are very important to be together, to reach joint decisions. In my first family, the parents ate first and then the children, so there were many problems and a gap. But now, we sit together at the dinner table, you watch how your child holds the spoon, how he eats, you watch everything and talk and he changes. We have breakfast for about 2-3 hours especially on Saturdays and Sundays. (11.tur)

- I want to do the things to my child that my parents didn’t do to me. For example, they didn’t give us their love; I now give my children my love. We were a crowded family so I didn’t grow up with love but now I do the opposite to my children. Thanks to the Program, we behave with our children the way we are supposed to. (3.tur)

- We were raised under pressure, without any confidence. I realized the difference between the environments in which I grew up and where my children are growing up at the moment. I was raised with an authoritarian attitude, where you weren’t treated like an individual and where you weren’t given any right of speech. I understood that this attitude was wrong. (14.tur)

- You try not to implement most of the things you experienced with your parents because you perceived them as wrong. You try to implement different child rearing methods so that your children won’t feel the same way as you did. I have believed that this different atti-
tude was the right one, and that methods used in the past such as beating, shouting couldn’t be beneficial. (14.sw)

- I don’t recall a time when my opinion was asked in my family. Generally, my mother and my father would do something totally in line with their taste and opinion. They wouldn’t ask my opinion even if that was about me. But, I do just the opposite and take my children’s opinion on every subject, even if it is not directly related to them. I have always dreamt that my child should see me as a friend, rather than a mother; I have wanted to raise my child that way. I didn’t like my parents’ attitudes and behaviors while raising me up, I knew that they were wrong. I want to do what I couldn’t do with my family to my children. (4.sw)

- When my child wants to do something, wants to buy something, I first try to put myself in his shoes. That wasn’t done for me. (8.sw)

- I wanted to become conscious. For example, my first thought when I held my child the first time in my arms was that I wouldn’t do the things that my parents did to me and that I didn’t like to my child. (18.bel)

- When you see the wrong things in your family while growing up, you tell yourself that you won’t repeat them with your child. For example, I couldn’t continue my education so I give importance to my children’s education. I try to do what hasn’t been done for me in my family. I am content with my way of raising them up, although I wish I could be better, but I definitely wouldn’t want them to be brought up like me. (11.bel)

- My father was very nervous and was very oppressive toward us, the girls and wouldn’t agree with anything. Everything was limited. I had always dreamt of a diploma, but I don’t have one so I always tell and support people to continue their education and have a diploma. I only wish my children to get education. When I see them not studying I get angry because that’s my weak point and I want them to have a good education. I like changing myself. I don’t want to continue the same way. I like people saying, “Yes, you have changed.” I have changed. (13.bah)

- When we wanted to talk, they wouldn’t allow us talk freely, we couldn’t talk freely even with our mother. Our mother wouldn’t respond in any way, but now we have to reply to our children when they ask something because if I don’t, it will come back to me with different behaviors. (3.bah)

- Of course, there are differences. I had a pleasant childhood but they weren’t educational; we are trying to be more educational toward our children. We haven’t seen any of what we had learned at MOCEF in our family, treating the way they had told us in MOCEF. For example, a mother teaching her daughter about having periods, nobody taught us about it. But now we talk about them in front of our children, we teach them what to do. They even teach it at school. I used to hesitate and thought I couldn’t teach it to my daughter and wanted the aunts to talk to her. Then, I thought about it and said, “I am the mother and we are now more like friends and we are closer, so why shouldn’t I teach her?” (7.sar)
- When I was single, I didn’t have much communication with my mother. My mother wouldn’t express her love so as not to spoil the child. For example, I pay attention to that all the time, after what I have learned at MOCEF. I tell my daughter that I love her, I tell my son that I love him and that he should express his love to other people as people always want to hear that they are loved. I try to make him get the habit so that he can say so to his wife. For example, when they come home from school, I call them one by one, first my daughter. We talk and chat and I kiss her. Then, we do the same things with my son. I give importance to those so that in the future they could express themselves to their spouses or to other people. My mother loved me without showing it so I had believed that she didn’t love me. I was very much influenced by that and I don’t want my child to feel the same way. It might have affected my self-confidence. This has influenced me negatively so it would influence my child the same way. When something is tried, there is no need to try it again. (6.sar)

- My family wasn’t interested in each of us. My parents were both working and they couldn’t take much care. I don’t want to repeat their mistakes. I take care of my children more; I try to have plans, for example, about not having too many children. My parents never helped me with my homework; they never asked me whether I needed something. My father used to work all the time and he would sleep. I don’t remember my father or my mother caressing my head, I try not to do this to my children. Especially beating, we were 9 siblings and my mother’s method was beating us, we were beaten a lot. I try not to do that to my children as well. Everyone says that when they grow up, they won’t be like their parents but just the opposite; they bring up their children the way they were raised. However, after MOCEF, I haven’t even slapped my kids; it has always been different for me. I felt sorry that I wasn’t brought up that way. There was continuous lack of communication in my family, I was made to marry at an early age; I would never let my daughter marry at such a young age, I am a more conscious mother and I believe that my mother wasn’t conscious. I wouldn’t want my children to have those experiences at that age. I feel happy because my children don’t have a childhood like mine, their childhood is happier, and that makes me happy. (18.sar)

Similar and content

- I thought that the Program overlaps one to one with how I was raised. That’s why the Program content wasn’t foreign to me; it just reminded me of some unforgotten values and information. I have thought that I was brought up in the correct way, which means that I will raise my child the correct way. I believed I would raise a good child. I felt how special the family is. (20.tur)

- There are similarities between my family and this Program. That’s why I am implementing this Program more. (18.sw)

- Maybe, because I was brought up in such a family, I wanted my child to have the same experience and grow up in such a family. I want this cycle to continue. My family used to
do that, so that was the right thing. When you encounter such training in an educational institution, you trust both the institution and your family when there are similarities. My family used to do like that, this institution is also supporting it, so there are no problems; both of them are doing right. That makes it more reliable, causes you to believe in it. (8.bel)

- My father was close to us, he wanted to give us certain things. I try to do the same things with my children. I try to approach them and be close to them. (16.bah)

- Our mother was closer to us than our father. I used to share everything with my mother; we had a very good dialogue. I definitely shared everything that happened in my life with my family. There are similarities like that. My child, although he is a boy, he can share everything with me. (11.sar)

• How Do the Feedback and Support Received during the Program Contribute to Change?

The mothers had various experiences once they had started the Program. These experiences included the feedback received from the spouse, the people around the mother and the child. The self reports of the mothers indicated that the feedback received during the Program contributed to the change the mothers experienced. Especially the positive feedback played a substantial role in the mother’s decisiveness in implementing the Program.

Positive Feedback Received from the Spouse

Mothers reported that the spouses noticed the positive changes in the mothers and said that they were more conscious and behaved differently toward themselves and the child.

Feedback reflecting that the mother’s was more conscious

- He told me that I shouldn’t stop, and that I should continue to attend the Program if I could. He thought that he didn’t participate in the meetings, but said that I was able to reflect them all onto him. He told me that he was able to feel all those changes in me. That statement was very valuable to me. (9.tur)

- Sometimes, he tells me that I act more consciously about certain things and of course I like it. As I said, I learned to be patient, whereas I used to behave more impulsively. I can now control myself more and give answers appropriate to her age. My husband observes and appreciates this change. I might have become a more conscious mother in his eyes. (15.sw)

- Even my husband said, “You weren’t like that, what has happened? You are very sure of yourself.” He talks about the change in me in general. Husbands can oppose at first but later they understand and talk about the change. (5.bel)
- He always thanks me for my behavior toward our children. He tells me that I spend time with them and I study with them and thanks me for all the things that I do. He says, “You have become very conscious.” (18.bah)

- I believe he has more confidence in me. Actually, he relies on me for everything, and that is evident. He thinks that I am knowledgeable. (17.sar)

**Feedback reflecting that the mother’s behavior toward the child has changed**

- He actually saw that my behavior toward my child had changed and that we had learned certain things. He told me that I had started to change. I was joking and replied, “Why, how was I?” and he said that I wasn’t aggressive and nervous any more, and that I had really changed. (2.tur)

- He was surprised to see that I was reading books with my child and mentioned it. When he saw us cutting and gluing things, for example, he used to say to the children “Your mother is like a peer, you have tempted her as well, and she is reading with you, she is doing the things that you are supposed to do.” (12.sw)

- Probably he understood that my tolerance was different. He gave me feedback after my reactions to certain things and said “You used to get angry at the kids when they did this, but you aren’t now.” (9.bel)

- He said, “You aren’t nervous any more. You talk more and shout less.” (8.bah)

- He is happy both for himself and for the kids. He tells me that I have more patience and that I behave toward them with more tolerance. He says that it is better in every aspect. He wanted this training to be longer as he said, “I wish this training had lasted longer so that you could learn various other things.” (14.sar)

**Feedback reflecting that the mother’s behavior toward the spouse has changed**

- My husband was always happier as I spent more time with him. He was also happy that I used “I language” with him. (15.tur)

- I am more tolerant and calmer about the things to which I had reacted earlier. He appreciates that. (15.sw)

- He said, “My wife’s eyes used to be shut; she used to say yes to whatever I said. Now that she has attended MOCEF meetings, she has learned to say no as well because she has learned to stand on her two feet.” He knows that I have more self-confidence now and that even if I stay alone here, I can manage many things, whereas before he would tell me that I couldn’t do this or that. (18.bel)

- Even my husband noticed it. When I was attending the Program, he said that he had really liked the Program as it had changed me quite a lot. I changed a lot. He said that I was like another person. He didn’t like me shouting and he’s very happy about it. He praises me, not only because of my change toward him, but because I have changed...
toward my children as well, or even my whole personality changed. I wasn’t suffocating him any more, I was keeping silent. I learned these all at the meetings. When he comes home, I smile. (17.bah)

- He tells me that I am calmer. (1.bah)

- For example, when we go over to a friend’s house, he is so proud of me as I know how to behave. He sometimes tells our friends that he wouldn’t change me for the world and that I am very different. He has made such remarks. (11.sar)

Positive Feedback Received from the People around Her

The feedback the mothers received from the people around them was not much different in content from that of the spouses. The friends and relatives reported that the mother was more conscious and behaved differently toward the child. There was also feedback indicating that the behavior of the child had changed.

Feedback reflecting that the mother’s behavior toward her child has changed

- They tell me that I have changed quite a lot this year. They say that I am different in many ways, in talking, in relationship to others. I told them that miracles happen in life, and that this was a miracle. (9.tur)

- When we got together with our relatives, my mother-in-law would say “Let’s be quiet and listen to what she has learned.” She used to say that I had learned many things and implemented them with the child and that I wasn’t getting angry and that I was patient. She liked it. Again she tells me that I am very patient about not beating my child. (18.tur)

- Many people told me how patient I was and that I was talking and explaining to my child. (12.sw)

- My friends told me that I was very patient with my daughter. Then, they realized that I wasn’t hitting her any more. They said that I used to hit her but that I wasn’t doing that anymore. They believed I was more sensitive and patient toward her. (2.bel)

- Yes, they tell me that I am better. In fact, my sister once told me that I wasn’t beating my daughter any more and that I was listening to her. (11.bah)

- My family told me that I really changed after attending the Program and that I started to pay more attention to my kids, to their food and that I was spending more time with them. They also said that my children had become calmer and that they had changed and were very different from other children. (17.bah)

- Even my friend’s husband realized the change in me and said that I had changed a lot after attending MOCEF. (11.sar)

- They mentioned that I was different. They knew that I had been a bit nervous and anxious and they realized that I had changed a bit, although not much. They told me that
my behavior was better and that I used to be unjust, but I am calmer, more patient and understanding, and that I have changed a lot. That was someone who didn’t know that I was attending MOCEF. (14.sar)

Feedback reflecting that the mother was more conscious

- When I told other people that I had read and learned about it, they would say, “She is right, she attended the Program, so let her do it her way.” I was happy then because I had proof, I had a document. I had made an effort, spent some time there. That helps increase your self-confidence, and then you can share things comfortably. (11.tur)

- They told me that I was more conscious. When my children had made mistakes before the Program, I had gotten angry. Then, later they witnessed that I was trying to explain to my children that my behavior was wrong. They told me that I had changed, had become more conscious. (20.sw)

- We went to a friend’s mother’s house and my friend didn’t talk to her child but beat him while I was talking to my daughter. Her mother saw that and warned her daughter by saying that I was also living abroad like her but that I didn’t hit my child but talked to her. She asked her daughter why she was beating her child. (1.bel)

- For example, my mother-in-law was very proud of me while talking to her friends and said, “My daughter-in-law was already knowledgeable, but now she has learned about it all.” (5.bel)

- They wouldn’t say, “You used to be like that, but now you are like that,” but when there is a problem, they immediately come to me and ask for advice. (16.bah)

- They tell me that I am more knowledgeable. (7.sar)

Feedback reflecting that there have been positive changes in the child

- When they saw the difference and the success in my daughter, they wished they had gone, too. Before the Program started, they had not wanted to attend but then they understood that it was necessary. Some started later as the teachers and the friends of the child in class told the mothers to participate in the Program. (14.bel)

- My sister-in-law told me that her children couldn’t talk like mine. That made me really happy. They told me that they wished they had attended the Program when they understood the difference between the children. (18.bel)

- Both my family and other people like my children’s education, which is a sign that the Program was useful. (6.sar)

- I have a friend who wanted to attend the Program, but her husband wasn’t in favor because of his work. They have young children and they don’t accept young children there. For example, this year her son completed the year barely, but my son got very high grades. We really had the benefits. That friend told her husband, “You didn’t let me go, but she did and look at how successful her son is now.” (12.sar)
Positive Feedback Received from the Child

The mothers reported that they had received feedback from their children as well about their behavior. The children stated that there had been a change in the mother in general and that she had done something for her child. There also were remarks about the mother spending more time with the child, being calmer, more understanding and knowledgeable.

Feedback reflecting the general change in the mother

- He tells me to participate in MOCEF all the time and that I have changed a lot. Sometimes even I can’t believe in myself. I ask myself whether I have changed that much. When I show them love and respect, they give it back to me. The more I give them, the more they reflect back. He tells me that as long as I show them love and respect, they will do the same and that they won’t bother me. I hear that from my children whereas I had never heard them before the Program. (9.tur)

- He says, “My mother has confidence in me.” (5.sw)

- She thinks I listen and talk to them as well as being more understanding. (16.sw)

- Sometimes when I behaved positively, they were astonished and asked me whether I felt all right, for example, when I didn’t hit them any more. (13.bel)

- They used to tell me that I had succeeded in changing their father thanks to MOCEF. There are also times when they, the three of them, tell me that I behave toward them much better and they are very happy about my participation in the Program. (3.bel)

- He has told me that I have changed a few times although I can’t remember what he said exactly. I have asked him whether he is happy and he tells me that he is very happy. It is actually evident in his behavior. (8.sar)

Feedback reflecting that the mother spent more time with the child

- My 6 year old child says, “My mother spared time for me, she does the CEPs for me, she reads stories to me, but she didn’t do that before.” He told me that he felt very happy and lucky about my attendance in MOCEF and that was quite important to me. He says, “If you hadn’t attended the meetings, we wouldn’t have come here, you wouldn’t have taken us out and around and we would have had to stay at home.” (9.tur)

- She also liked my being more attentive toward her. (1.sw)

- They say, “Mom helps us, she wasn’t doing it before, maybe she didn’t have the time but she now spares more of her time for us.” They think that I am a more attentive and knowledgeable mother. They realize your knowledge as well. (9.bel)

- When I spend more time with him, he becomes very happy and is motivated as I am
more attentive. Sometimes he would be bored, but now he says “You used to take care of your girls all the time, I was the only boy, but you didn’t pay me enough attention; but now you take care of me all the time.” (20.sar)

Feedback reflecting that the mother was calmer and more understanding

- He expressed that I was more understanding, more patient and a different person. He said, “You are more tolerant when you return from MOCEF. My mom is a perfect mom, she goes to school.” (4.tur)

- For example, my son tells me that I was more nervous before the Program and that I used to yell more. He also talks about the difference by saying that now I am different and try to deal with things calmly and that I listen to him. (12.tur)

- The kids also realized the change and said, “Mom, you used to shout, why don’t you any more?” (7.bel)

- They told me that I was calmer and that I loved them more. (10.bah)

- They used to tell me that I had changed a lot and that they were thankful for that change to the Program. They remembered how I was before and told me that it was as if I turned into a new mother. They said that I had a more positive perspective and that I didn’t get mad often. (2.sar)

Feedback reflecting that the mother was more knowledgeable

- She says, “Mom knows about it, Mom knows about everything.” She makes me feel it. When we talk, she tells her father to ask me because I would know the right answer. When she plays with her friends, when they want to start a game she says “Let’s ask mom, let’s ask for her help.” When the friend wonders whether I would get angry, she says, “No, she won’t mind, she will help us.” I even like that. (18.tur)

- She told me that I was making her study better than before. They paid attention to that. (9.bah)

Mother’s Opinions about the Positive Feedback Received

All this positive feedback motivated the mother and in the end she was more open and convinced for implementation. Mothers reported that the positive feedback motivated them, made them happy, helped increase their self-confidence, and made them proud. Finally, it enabled them to think that they were on the right track.

Motivated her

- It helped me continue attending the Program with more eagerness. When my friends had a problem about children, they would say, “She attended MOCEF, she should know, let’s go ask her,” and I liked it a lot and took pride in that. I was happier and when others made positive remarks, I told myself that I have learned good things. (18.tur)
- I liked my child saying that it was very nice. I continued the Program because of him actually, otherwise I couldn’t have. When I get positive reactions, I want to do more. If my son had given me a negative reaction, I would have stopped. (5.sw)

- You want to continue. You get support and realize that this is something good and that’s why you feel the need to continue. (12.bah)

- Of course, I try to do the right thing better. For example, when I get positive feedback from my husband, I try to be better, to be more cautious. (1.sar)

**Made her happy**

- Of course, you feel happier when you are supported. It means that I can achieve certain things. You try to hang on more to life. You value your children more and want to provide them with good things, want to teach them. You want them to experience everything. (1.tur)

- It gives happiness and you have more confidence. You feel like treating the kids better. You don’t feel anything negative. When they do so, I feel happier. When they say so, I become more eager in taking care of the children, in spending more time with them. (10.tur)

- It made me happy and motivated me to attend regularly. (20.sw)

- You become happy and more self confident. (10.bel)

- The children told me that I had changed. I am happy because they are proud of their mother. I have felt that I have a special place in their hearts. They sense the change in me and they are proud; that’s how I feel. (15.bah)

- Nice, I’m happy. You feel good things and you become happy. You were beneficial both to yourself and to the people around thanks to the information taught. (9.sar)

- I like it and tell myself that I can get the outcome of my effort. Everyone likes hearing about it. I feel happy. (6.sar)

**Increased her self-confidence**

- My husband told me that he was sending me to the Program as he was sure that it was something very useful. He was relying on me and believed that I would accomplish those things and teach children; that was very important to me and increased my self-confidence. At first, he made jokes about it but I was impressed when he later took it seriously. (9.tur)

- When the people around me gave feedback about the changes in me, my self-confidence increased; that made me happy. (20.sw)

- Hearing from other people that I had learned new things increased my self-confidence. (9.sw)
- I am glad I attended the Program. I have more courage and more self-confidence. (16.bel)

- I felt that they loved me, they supported me. I definitely enjoy it and am happy. I am more sure of myself, more self-confident. (16.bah)

- I felt pleasant feelings, felt self-confidence. I do and accomplish things. (8.sar)

Made her proud of herself

- You felt that you were doing something good. Getting support and knowing that you are doing the right thing gives you more energy to participate. You feel good about it; you feel that you are equipped for this matter. When you get education about something, you feel good and you feel proud of yourself. (8.sw)

- My husband, when he witnessed my behavior toward my children after the Program, told me that he was very happy that he had married me and that I was his wife. How would you feel if someone told you this sentence? I felt pride. (18.bel)

- I thought I had reflected it onto my life and I was proud. What I had learned was not in vain. They noticed these differences, which meant that I could actually implement them and use them in my life and that they could see that. (8.bel)

- I had great pleasure and pride. I feel more self-confident. (11.bah)

- I really liked when people appreciated me for attending the meetings with patience for a long time without getting bored and for learning things. I felt pride. (14.sar)

Thought she was on the right track

- It motivated me and I continued the Program being more certain that I was doing something good. I told myself that I was doing something good and it motivated me. Transferring the information I learned to other people gave me satisfaction. I learned new things and then I was transferring it to other people. For example, when I see people on the street behaving in a wrong way, I am more aware. Seeing all that motivated me. (14.tur)

- When I received positive feedback both from the people around and from our doctor, I thought that I was on the right track and that I was doing something good. I got positive energy from my husband and my children. These all make you think that you are on the right track and you start thinking that you need to do certain things. (13.sw)

- I thought that I did something good, something useful for my child. I thought I served something. (17.bel)

- Of course, it contributed to me. I need to get certain things to be able to give. I need to learn life and benefit from everyone’s experience. The positive reactions I got were only a support to realize these. I got a positive result. Every week, I was leaving my house and going somewhere, but I got positive results, not negative ones. (10.bah)
- The greatest support was from my husband. I was very happy and enjoyed it. Getting positive feedback, especially from your spouse and from your children, was very nice, it felt good. At least, you think that what you did was right, that I should have behaved that way before and that I should always behave that way. (3.sar)

Negative Feedback Received from the Spouse

Alongside the positive feedback, some mothers reported that they had received negative feedback from their spouses while participating in the Program. Some mothers, on the other hand, mentioned that they did not receive any feedback. The feedback from the spouses indicated disapproval of the mother’s attendance in the Program, with statements that the mother’s participation was not necessary.

Reaction about the mother’s attendance in the program

- At first, he didn’t regard my participation highly as the children were not allowed; we didn’t have a place to leave the kids. My mother has sometimes work to do or they travel with my father. He actually said, “What’s the use?” (16.tur)

- For example, when he behaved badly toward the kids, when he did something wrong, I would warn him and would tell him what should be done and what shouldn’t be done. Then, he would make fun of me by telling me that I was talking too much and that I had learned a lot. (10.sar)

- I am not aware of it, but my husband sometimes tells me that he is disturbed by my being too social. Even on the way here, he told me that I had become bold and free. He doesn’t want it actually, he is not happy about it. He tells me that I don’t accept everything anymore. He is uncomfortable as my objections have increased. He says that I have changed a lot, although I tell him that I haven’t. But he says, “You are talking as if you know it all, you shouldn’t question your husband.” (6.sar)

No feedback

- I don’t remember him saying anything. He didn’t comment. I wish he had. (18.sw)

- No, I have always been, and still am, a mother who is spoiling the kids in his eyes. (6.bel)

- My husband doesn’t even notice them; he is not that careful, he doesn’t think enough to be able to notice the details. The people here, especially the ones born and raised here, are very inattentive. (2.bel)

- They don’t talk like that. Even if he sees differences, if the family is happy, he adapts and doesn’t comment. If it is for the sake of the family, he doesn’t say anything. (3.bah)

- I believe he hasn’t noticed anything or even if he did, he hasn’t talked about it. He is not someone who can easily express his feelings. He is private. Maybe that’s why I haven’t seen anything. (10.sar)
Negative Feedback Received from the People around Her

Negative feedback received from the people around was very similar to the negative feedback received from the spouse. Their statements also reflected disapproval of mother’s attendance in the Program.

No need to participate

- The elder people were making jokes, saying “Are you going to school again? Will you be a professor or what?” They thought it was useless and said that I wouldn’t get any benefit. They said, “We neither went to school nor sent our children, but nothing has happened.” (20.tur)

- Most people refused it at first. The people around us asked me whether I didn’t know how to raise a child, whether I needed to go there and there was mostly opposition. There wasn’t anyone who approved. They even made fun of me and said, “You are attending a course to learn how to raise a child. Don’t you know how to? Your child is 6 years old. Haven’t you learned about raising a child yet?” (1.5.tur)

- They thought it was useless and said, “What’s the use of going there? Are you an insufficient mother? Why are you attending the Program? What is CEP? Your child doesn’t have any mental retardation, does he?” (8.tur)

No feedback

- The people here are not supportive, but try to hinder. The environment here is not motivating or supporting. (1.sw)

- No reactions, their approach is still the same. (12.bel)

- I haven’t received any feedback. (18.bah)

Negative Feedback Received from the Child

Mothers reported that some children were not very happy about the change in their mothers, while few gave no feedback.

Feedback reflecting discontentment about the change in the mother

- She says that she suffers a lot because of my teacher. She doesn’t like the rules at all and asks me whether she can’t live without rules. (20.tur)

- Both my son and my daughter told me that they wished I hadn’t attended the Program as I presented them with rules at home and gave them responsibilities. They said they liked it much more the way it had been before the Program as they had been able to eat or get dressed wherever they wanted. (13.tur)

No feedback

- No, he didn’t say anything. He hasn’t said much until today. (18.sw)
They didn’t voice it directly. They don’t say anything like you mentioned, they don’t say that I have changed after attending MOCEF. They might have noticed, though. (4.bel)

Mother’s Opinions about the Negative Feedback Received

The mothers reported that they were not influenced by the negative feedback received, similar to what they mentioned about the negative reactions they had received before the Program started. The same reasons apply here as they stated that they would not change their opinion because they knew they were doing something good for their child.

*Did not change her opinion, her own decision was important*

- The negative ones didn’t affect me actually because I need to do what I believe is right. When I do the right thing, I am not very much interested or care about what others think, even my husband’s reaction. You become pessimistic a bit but as time goes by there is no return, you can’t leave it half way. Then, everything settles down. (16.tur)

- It was my decision and if I am on the right track, nobody has a say in it. Everything was perfect so I didn’t care about what others said. (5.bel)

- I don’t care about anybody, but about my feelings and ideas the most. I attended the Program because I had to, because I felt like it, not because of other people. My feelings and raising my children are of utmost importance to me. (16.sar)

*Did something good for the child, got information*

- No, I never thought of leaving the Program because the information we got was very good. What the teacher told us was really effective, but that of my neighbors and my friends’ wasn’t. (13.tur)

- Especially the first year when I attended the Program, I decided to attend every meeting because even if I missed one, I would have thought of it as a year. I believed I would miss a lot of information. The people around me, my peers, all said negative things. They said that my child was young and that he needed love and care. I dealt with them all. I felt relief myself as well. (3.bah)

- A person should benefit from every opportunity. Some people told me not to attend and thought it was a waste of time, but I told them that I had experienced its benefits and so I didn’t miss even one meeting. It was so good. (2.bah)

The Support the Mother Received

The instrumental and emotional support the mother received from her spouse and from the people around her affected the implementation of the Program, as well as the feedback received.
The Support from the People around Her

The mothers reported that the people around them supported their attendance in the Program by taking care of the child or by helping with the transportation. The mothers also received emotional support while implementing the Program with the child.

By providing child care

- Mostly my mother and my mother-in-law provided support. My mother-in-law looked after my child when my mother was absent. (19.tur)

- I left her at my mother’s house because it was a huge support for me. She even slept there through the night as I didn’t want to wake her up when I left early in the morning. (16.tur)

- I left my younger son at my mother-in-law’s. (4.sw)

- When my daughter was sick, I couldn’t go and had to stay with her, but my mother-in-law said she could take care of her and didn’t want me to miss class. For example, when they called from school and said that my daughter was sick and needed to be taken home, I would call my sister-in-laws and they would go and take care of her. They would even take her to the doctor’s if needed until I arrived. (19.bel)

- My sister’s daughter told me that she could look after my child any time, and I thought she was family; it was her uncle’s house, so there was no problem. (4.bah)

- My greatest support was my aunt. Actually, she was my grandmother and said she could look after my child any time. She supported me a lot although my children are hard to take care of. They were the ones that helped me the most, rather than my mother-in-law or my sister-in-laws. (3.bah)

- I received the greatest support from my sister-in-law. I would leave my two kids at her house or she would come over to our house. For example, I would leave the house while the kids were still in bed. (16.sar)

- My friends offered to look after my child. Two or three friends were really helpful. I left her at my sister’s house the most. (6.sar)

By helping with the transportation

- There were people who supported me by giving a ride. On rainy days my friends came to pick me up and they dropped me back home. (8.sw)

- My house and my friends were close and they used to tell me to drop by after the meetings. It was the same neighborhood and they offered to take me to the meeting and to have breakfast together afterwards. (1.bel)

- Sometimes I didn’t have my car and would call my mom to take me to the meeting. She would. (6.bah)
- My brother-in-law drove me there. (7.sar)

- My friend’s husband drove us. We had support from everyone and with support everything was better. It helped. (8.sar)

**By supporting the mother’s implementations**

- I used to tell the kids that they were supposed to be home at 8:30 and my neighbor knew about it. When my child was at their house, she would warn my child to come home by telling him that he had to do whatever I said. They tried to be helpful in that way. (4.tur)

- For example, when the children did something wrong, I would get angry and punish them, but my aunt would take their side. I used to talk and explain to her and then she also liked it and stopped protecting them. She used to tell them that whatever I said was right and final. She also told their grandfather not to protect the children when I shouted at them as they would get spoiled. Actually, he told them to listen to me and do whatever I said. (19.bel)

- I was supported from the beginning to the end. Sometimes I was puzzled and couldn’t do certain things. My mother would warn me about what to do. (14.sar)

**By supporting the mother’s participation in the Program**

- I told my neighbor that I was attending the mother education program at the Adult Education Center and that MOCEF was very good. She congratulated me on making such an effort and said that I was bringing up my children in a good way. She didn’t know me well, but I believe I gave the impression, either through my behavior or my way of talking. She said that I was educating my child well and that I was very enthusiastic. I really liked her comment. (5.tur)

- I didn’t have many people around me here, but the teachers congratulated us when they heard that there was such a program. I brought them the CEPs, everything we did and they really liked what we did with the kids. (13.sw)

- It was a support for my child at school and the teachers were astonished because she was the first one in reading. They were amazed when I showed them the papers and the books we received. They told other mothers who didn’t know about the Program. (14.bel)

- My parent-in-laws make good comments about whatever I do and implement. That relieves me. They always ask about what we did and what happened. That makes me happy. (10.bah)

- I shared about it all with my sister and my parents on the phone and they supported me. They supported me as there are many educated people in the family. (20.sar)
Did not receive any support

There were mothers who reported that they had not received any sort of support during the Program. These mothers continued the Program nevertheless, proving that the Program could be implemented without any support. If the mother was willing and determined to change, then she could continue the Program despite all hindrance experienced.

- *My mother lives with us and we have conflicts about every topic. For example, I say one thing; my mother says just the opposite and the child is left in between. So, the child is influenced badly. For example, we need to study CEP and she starts saying “What is the use of studying it? What is this about? Is this appropriate for her age? Don’t study here.” The child doesn’t want to study after hearing that. I try hard to find a time to do the CEP, the same time every day when there is no one around. Then, they say “Oh, give it up,” so I lose the discipline.* (8.tur)

- *We don’t have such a chance here as there are no friends and relatives around or no one living with us at home. I haven’t received any support, I did it all by myself.* (2.sw)

- *No, no support. They used to criticize me for attending the Program, saying that I had nothing to do and go there.* (6.bel)

- *We live in the same house with my brother and his wife, and sometimes my father comes from Turkey. We live two families together. They were making fun of me really because I used to be tired when I came home in the evening. My husband would join them as well. They were laughing at me. But, in the end, nice things happened.* (15.sar)

The Support from the Spouse

The mothers reported that their husbands supported them throughout the Program by providing transportation and child care. They also listened to what the mother has learned, which helped them get information. By using this information, they applied things similar to those of the mother and supported the mother’s implementations as well.

By helping with the transportation

- *We are alone here so there is only my husband who can help me. He took me to the meetings when he was available.* (20.sw)

- *He drove me when I missed the bus.* (15.bah)

- *Every week, he came from work and took me to the meetings. He also wanted me to attend the Program so that our child could learn new things. He likes his child. Every week, he would say, “Are you ready to go? I’ll take you there; it is for our child and for us.”* (11.sar)
By taking care of the child

- When I am late in putting the children to bed, he warns me that it is bed time. When I am busy, he takes care of them. I don’t need to remind him. Even if I forget, he knows about the bed time and puts them to bed. I make them drink milk before bedtime, for example, so he tells me that we should prepare their milk or that they should sleep after that cartoon. He motivates me and reminds me of it when I forget. Or he helps me when I am busy. He puts them to bed then. He wants us to continue to implement the same things. (15.tur)

- My husband took care of my younger one; he even played with him while we were studying the CEPs. He was trying his best so that my younger one wouldn’t disturb us. He would tell him that I had to study with his brother and that they could play together. He supported me. Sometimes I made him do the CEPs with my son. (3.sw)

- My husband took care of the kids. The meetings were generally during school hours but when I was late, he would go to the school to pick them up. (7.bel)

- My husband took care of them but sometimes we made plans for them to go to my father’s house. My husband would pick them up and I would go afterwards. But, it was always my husband who took care. (10.bah)

- My younger son would go to school in the mornings and after school, he would go to my husband’s place. He took care of our boy. Sometimes, I couldn’t cook, for example, when I had guests, I had difficulty preparing and my husband would arrange things. (7.sar)

By being interested in what the mother has learned

- I was telling him about what we did and learned that day. He was also reading and learning. We were taking joint decisions about how to behave. He also joined me and said that we should do together whatever is right. (15.sw)

- For example, when I came from the meeting, he was curious and he would ask me about what we had learned that day. For example, he wanted to know whether I had learned something about how a father should behave toward his child. He was ready to stay home and do whatever he had to do. He was aware that all that information could be used while raising a child and that help could be useful. (14.bel)

- We would talk when he came home from work and after dinner. He wanted to know what I had learned that day so that he could behave accordingly toward our child. He wanted to see my papers. I taught him what I had learned so he knew to stop me when I shouted. He supported my behavior toward the kids. (18.bel)

- My husband was always positive. He would wait to hear about the Program of that week. He would read the handouts. The topics were presented as main headlines in the handouts and we used to discuss the topic from various aspects. I used to tell him as much as I could. He would read the handouts and then we would have discussions about it. We used to talk and tell each other about what we didn’t like. (19.bel)
- He was constantly curious and would ask what we talked about. He asked about it even if he came home tired. He had not done that before. (20.bah)

- I used to tell him about our lessons on the day of the meeting. For example, he would turn off the television and listen, whereas he hadn’t before the Program. He would listen to me. (2.sar)

- I would read him the papers on my return from MOCEP. We had such information; I would tell about it and share with him. He would listen to me. He would agree that it was good information and he supported me by saying that we could try to implement them both. We both tried to apply the things written in the handouts. When I reacted differently toward my son, my husband made me feel that I was wrong, without saying it obviously. Then, when I realized that I was wrong, I could stop and change my behavior. (1.sar)

**By implementing what he has learned**

- When I shared with him the things he didn’t know, he would say that we had to act that way from then on. He definitely didn’t intervene. I was warning him as well and telling him how he should behave. He tried to behave that way. (20.tur)

- For example, when I told him that he should spend time with the kids, that he should paint or talk to his son, he thought they were useless. I told him about what had been taught in the Program and he learned during the Program that he needed to do those things. That’s why he changed and there was no need for me to intervene. (4.tur)

- I punished my child and when we were alone, he asked me why I didn’t let him talk. I said that we had learned in the Program that only one person, not both the mother and the father, should punish the child. I said that one person talks, explains and punishes, but that we shouldn’t beat the child. He agreed and didn’t intervene. (20.bel)

- At first, he would get nervous at the kids, because of their problems. I told him that he shouldn’t act angrily and that the child might be influenced, especially as he gets older. He listened to me and tried to do other things so as not to get angry. He tries to change things. (15.bah)

- He used to read the handouts for the fathers every night and I liked that. I liked his taking it seriously and supporting the education I received. He was trying to do the things written in the handouts. The greatest support was from my husband. (3.sar)

**By supporting the mother’s implementations**

- At first my husband didn’t want me to participate, but later I believe he had realized that it was useful for me because he said two or three times that he wished this Program had started earlier so that I could have attended the Program sooner. When he saw the effects, he told me that I shouldn’t be bothered by his mother and that I could attend the meeting by making up reasons for my absence. (10.tur)
- He could postpone his wishes while I was talking, studying or taking care of my child, as he realized that it was useful for the child. If I studied with the child, he could give up his wish to watch television. He would leave the room to us and prepare the environment. Even when I had things to do at home, he would let me attend the Program. This is support in the family, though minor. He was surprised when I told him about what I had learned. If that was a method that we had already known about or defended, he would accept the truth of it. But if it wasn’t, he would say that he had never thought of it from that point of view and that it was actually right. He was happier to learn what was right. (8.sw)

- He was very helpful in doing CEPs. I couldn’t manage the three of them but my husband tried to teach them through play when they didn’t understand; he told them stories. He is more knowledgeable so he had substantial support in that regard. (13.sw)

- In order to spare more time for each other, I told him not to watch television. He was very positive and agreed to give it a try. (15.sw)

- It was very good; he tried to change himself accordingly. He tried to help with social development in the book or with the drawings; he tried to do them as well. (1.bel)

- I first told him that he shouldn’t intervene in front of the children when I implemented something with them and that this was essential for respect to develop. If the father said no while I implemented something, the child would lose his respect for me. I would agree with him at the beginning, agreed that he shouldn’t react in front of the children while I was implementing something, even if he was against it. And he never did. (3.bah)

- He was very happy; he took great pleasure in certain things. There were things that he didn’t know, things that I didn’t know. We did certain things to our children without knowing about them. I realized that that was a mistake. Actually some people say, “We do it like that, that’s how we learned it.” My husband didn’t say so. He used to say, “We must have learned it wrong, we have mistakes in life and we have to correct them.” He supported me in that respect. (14.sar)

The mothers reported that they received support in various forms during the Program both from their spouses and from the people around them. This support evidently motivated them in implementing the Program. The people around them supported the women’s attendance in the Program and prepared the necessary environment for their applications.

Some mothers reported that they had not received any form of support from their spouses. The self reports of the mothers indicated that these spouses considered raising a child to be the responsibility of a woman so they preferred to stay away from the things related to the child.
Did not show any reactions

- Since the beginning of our marriage, my husband has only said “yes” or “no” to whatever I shared with him. Now, he has decided to remain completely silent. My husband doesn’t talk much. In fact, he doesn’t say no, doesn’t try to prevent me. (16.bel)

- I used to read the handouts to my husband, I used to read them again when he didn’t understand. He wasn’t listening actually. So, I was reading them again and again. At first, he didn’t take it seriously, but later he understood its importance because of what we went through. I believe I started and attended the Program by showing effort myself. When I told him to do something or to act in some way, he would say “She’s started again!” (3.bel)

Did not support the mother

- I wish he spoke with the kids and told them not to be naughty and not to make me sad, but he doesn’t. I suffer a lot. For example, I set up a program time for the child; after coming from school, she should eat and rest a bit and then she should study. When I set these rules, my husband gets angry at me and tells me to leave the child alone, without setting any rules so that she can be free. He says that I am obstructing her. I tell him that the teacher suggests us to do those things and he can call the teacher if he wants to. He neither calls her nor talks. Our teacher sent a letter, which he hasn’t cared to read. (10.tur)

- My husband is furious; he has outbursts for no reason. You can’t chat with or talk to him. When I try to implement what I learned in the Program at home, he doesn’t help me. That’s why I am all alone regarding the issues about the child. (11.sw)

- When my husband comes home, if he wants to listen to the news on television, he can say “Why didn’t you study before? Why are you doing it now?” (9.bel)

- When I shout at my child once in a while, he tells me that even though I attended the mother-child education, I haven’t gained much. When I do something, he immediately taunts me for it. (6.bel)

- Everything is my responsibility, I do everything and he doesn’t do anything. He doesn’t know whether I benefited from the Program. I do certain things by remembering what we talked about in the Program. But he doesn’t know about those. He only cares about resting at home. (14.bah)

- He didn’t talk much about this topic. As I said, men come home from work tired and they should have time for themselves, I respect that. When he comes home, he can’t spare all his hours for us, he needs to rest. He can’t pay attention to me or his kids 24 hours a day. (13.sar)
**International Implementations of the Program**

Analyses were made to find out whether the Program made contributions specific to the mothers living abroad. The data for this section were collected from Belgium, Switzerland and Saudi Arabia.

The results did not display considerable variation among countries. The differences mainly resulted from the environment in which the Program was implemented, and in the household and living conditions of the mothers. The group meetings in Switzerland were carried out in a place open to the public and this might have affected the group process negatively because of the violation of the boundaries and mothers’ loss of concentration. The majority of the mothers in Belgium reported that they lived with extended families and that they had difficulties in implementations as a result.

*The Program’s being in Turkish facilitated participation*

The mothers reported that their participation was possible as the Program was in Turkish. Most of them mentioned that they could not attend similar programs in their countries of residence as they did not know the language. Therefore, the language was an important factor for participation. On the other hand, these women wished to attend the Program as it would contribute to their children’s Turkish. In line with their expectations, they mentioned that their children’s knowledge of Turkish also had improved and the Program was beneficial to the overall development of the child. They stated that the child’s vocabulary had improved through the exercises in CEP.

- *Of course, there are similar programs here. A list is given by the school each year. They deal with many topics like child upbringing and sibling rivalry. There are such programs and I actually attended a few of them, but this one was in Turkish and it was much better for us. It facilitated my participation.* (7.sw)

- *Probably there are similar education programs and seminars in this country about child development, but I can understand only half of it as my French isn’t very fluent. It was an incredible opportunity for me. This education program in Turkish is an improvement for the mother as well so I decided to participate immediately. This program is in Turkish, in a language that I am good at, so I can understand it all and I can ask questions. That’s why it will be reflected on my life and way of living.* (8.bel)

- *I wouldn’t have attended if it were in a foreign language. It influenced me as it was in Turkish because that’s a language I can express myself with.* (15.sar)

- *In short, I don’t speak this country’s language.* (13.sar)

*It was beneficial for the child’s Turkish and development*

- *Most important of all, I saw how good my child’s cognitive development was. I also real-
ized that the activities in this Program matched those in the preschool and I understood about my child’s capacity, about what he can do, how successful he could be at school. It contributed a lot to his Turkish. We both learned words that we didn’t know and that we didn’t use in our daily lives. (2.sw)

-I believe it was good for children, for their Turkish. I personally believe that it was very effective in improving their Turkish. (5.bel)

Facilitated mother’s adaptation to the child rearing practices of the country

Some of the mothers living in Europe, namely Switzerland and Belgium, stated that the Program provided them with vital methods to enable their adaptation to the country in which they lived. They reported that their way of child rearing was different from that of their county of residence. However, they added that the child rearing methods stated in the Program helped them adapt to the expectations of that country about child training.

- The mothers here are generally knowledgeable and they bring up their children with discipline. We can now raise our children in a similar way thanks to the information provided by MOCEF and so they won’t be very different than the others and they won’t face problems in school. That’s good for us. (20.sw)

- I saw that it was very useful and that the perspective in this country and that of MOCEF, regarding the child and the mother were quite similar. Maybe it is one-to-one, I don’t know. But I understood that they were very similar so I believed that it was right and I participated without any hesitation. (15.sw)

- I am far-sighted, I mean I am very active and try to do my best all the time and try to learn as much as I can. Of course, it helps. It opens up new frontiers for us, our way of seeing, our self-confidence increases. We really adapt more easily to Europe. (5.bel)

Met the socialization needs of the mother

The group meetings seem to have been an important means of socialization, but this need was even more pronounced for those mothers living abroad. The Program provided social support especially for the mothers in Belgium and Saudi Arabia because they reported that they could not speak the language of the country and they lived either alone or too close to extended families. For the women in Saudi Arabia, the Program made a difference in their lives. In addition to the positive effects of socialization, attending the Program meant leaving the house and meeting new people. The Program was reported to meet an important need because they had difficulty going out alone.

- It’s a social activity. We are alone and we have no one to turn to. Bringing up a child is more difficult here. The foreigners, being in a different country and people from different
There are Turkish people who live here, but they are from different regions and their opinions are all different. You say something, but they understand it as something else. We have difficulties in communication even as Turkish people, so imagine communicating with strangers. (1.sw)

- I have become more social. I participate more and I am more energetic, not shy as I used to be. This was thanks to MOCEF and we want it to continue. It helps us in a foreign country. (20.sw)

- I have opened up. I have seen places that I didn’t know. Our teacher told us about life; she took us to the theatre, museums and sculpture exhibition openings; we haven’t seen things like that before. We haven’t known our surroundings much here but our teacher helped us see those nice places. (13.bel)

- We have had a different year. We were looking forward to Tuesdays, to getting together and talking. We had trips on some Tuesdays. We visited museums and exhibitions, there were sculptors from Turkey. We would do our class first, work as a group and talk, and then in the afternoon we would go. Sometimes, we would meet on Mondays at some place and we would go altogether. (19.bel)

- My participation in MOCEF was very useful for me as I had recently come here and I believe it helped me a lot in adaptation. At least, I am not bored here any more. In the beginning, I was shocked and kept asking myself why I had come to this country. But you adapt as time passes. I can definitely say that the MOCEF period made it easier. I didn’t feel that I was in a different place at first, it was like in Turkey. (3.sar)

- We both saw them benefit and spent time there. We met with new people. We were glad. I guess I was unhappy, I became sad easily. I believe I got over that a bit. I didn’t have many friends here; I was new and living between four walls. For example, with the Program you come to school as a group, you have friends and a group. I think I got over some of the distress. I used to be very bored when I first came. (12.sar)

- It’s a nice feeling. You make new friends. You belong to a group. You are different than all the others. Socializing is pleasant. When you stay at home, you become introverted and think about your problems all the time. If I were in Turkey, I could walk to a neighbor’s or go shopping. Here it’s a secluded environment and that’s why it’s better and more beneficial. It’s like an opportunity. (6.sar)

Was more self-confident in her daily life and believed she was more knowledgeable

- I am more self-confident in general. Not knowing the language of the country is terrible because you have to live there. I can say that it has facilitated my life here. I was a very social person in Turkey, but after coming here, I retreated into myself as I didn’t know the language. Since this Program, however, I have started doing everything on my own. I still can’t speak the language, but I don’t ask other people’s help. I used to hesitate to speak
in German, thinking that I might say something wrong and appear funny. Now, I don’t feel that way. People can talk or laugh as they like. I have had more confidence after this Program. I have learned many things there; I am more conscious. Learning, at whatever age you might be, is very valuable. I think learning made it possible. (10.sw)

- We came here and we didn’t know about anything. I didn’t have confidence, no courage and I was depressed. I couldn’t think about anything, I couldn’t take care of my child. At first I was like that. After starting MOCEP, my self-confidence was restored. I felt more courageous about going somewhere or doing something. (18.bel)

- Children here have different problems. It is useful to support them. Most of the families don’t know what to do so as not to lose their children. This is because of our deficiencies in education, in the infrastructure. (3.bel)

- There was a topic about woman’s rights. I used to say that we didn’t have any rights. We learned what a woman can do when she is beaten, how she can defend her rights. I told my husband that we had long been unaware of our rights, that women can defend their own rights as well. (11.sar)

- I am tougher and more knowledgeable. I used to say that this country wasn’t a good place for my children and that I couldn’t live here. But now I believe that I can do pleasant things here as well. Why? Because I can educate my child. (8.sar)

The origins of the Program affected participation

Some mothers stated that the Program’s origin facilitated their participation, while others said that it did not matter where the Program had been developed as the content would not change. Those in the first group believed that the Program would be in accordance with their customs and traditions and would teach children about their own culture. They assumed that the Program would be better understood as it had been developed in Turkey. Some mothers also stated that they had more confidence in a program originating from their homeland. On the other hand, the mothers in the latter group mentioned that child education and the needs of mothers were universal and therefore, the education should be similar in every country and in every language. These women reported that they could participate in any program of this sort.

- Of course, it affected me because people from my country understand me better, know my child better. They know what my child needs the most and what type of education suits him the most; that’s why I attended. I believed that a Program which has been prepared in Turkey could be better and more useful for my child. (8.sw)

- I can say that it’s easier to implement. The topics appeal to us in the cultural sense because they try to present us with our culture and then, there are no conflicts. If you can’t teach your culture to your child, there is no way back, you can’t hold the child back as they adapt to the culture here quite fast. (14.sw)
- It affected me in a good sense. It is better because more rational things are produced in Turkey. If it had been made by the people here, I wouldn’t have participated. I don’t think the people here can add much to me. I don’t find them adequate for me. The books are brought from Turkey; the child receives education from Turkey in Turkish; the language and the sentences in the books. I feel I have lost some of my Turkish here as time passes. I can’t make a good sentence. Of course it has affected. (12.bel)

- As I said before, it was assuring to know that these programs had been prepared by a trainer, by people who had higher education than we did, by professors in Turkey. I thought that it should be definitely right if they had prepared it. I think that the instructors in Turkey are more knowledgeable and in a better position in every aspect. (3.bel)

- I know that experts prepared these lessons and they have an aim. Who wouldn’t have confidence in his/her own country? Of course, it affects participation. There must be some difference; our people don’t do things without a reason. (15.sar)

- The fact that it originated from Turkey was different for me because knowledge and self-education there are very different. Education in Turkey, the ideas and knowledge are really very different than those here. The fact that the Program was developed in Turkey affected me a lot. (11.sar)

**The origins of the Program did not affect participation**

- I haven’t thought anything about it. Here or there, the important thing is the information given and that doesn’t change. What was important for me in the end was the information I received, what I learned. (10.sw)

- It is a child and a child’s language is universal. A stubborn child is stubborn everywhere; every child can tell lies. Dealing with all children is difficult. A Swiss mother can also benefit from this Program because a child is a child everywhere. (9.sw)

- I would have participated if that had been something organized by the Belgians, but I couldn’t have understood it because of language problems. Fortunately, people in Turkey thought about the mothers here. There are people who think about us. (6.bel)

- There is no age for education and self improvement. It doesn’t matter where you are, but it is good if you can learn certain things. It can be in Turkey, in England, France or United States, nothing changes. The important thing is the person’s wish to change something about herself. I am doing something wrong and I want to change it. As I said, it doesn’t matter. (13.sar)

Almost all the mothers were proud of the implementation of a program that had originated from their own country, while others voiced their pleasure at being remembered by their country. These women felt supported when they sensed that they were not alone or forgotten and that they had a source from which they could get support.
Pleased not to be forgotten

- It is a nice thing that such a good program was developed in my own country and brought to Europe. It’s pleasant that the people here aren’t forgotten and are thought of. (4.sw)

- At first it meant that I wasn’t forgotten. I was really happy that we weren’t forgotten here in Europe because being in Europe doesn’t mean that we have everything. We lack many things psychologically and I was very happy that this imperfection had been fixed by people thinking about us. (8.sw)

- First of all, we live abroad and this service was brought here for us. That’s a good thing. It was developed in Turkey and brought here, meaning that we aren’t alone. There are people behind us, supporting us. They have thought of us. People say all the time that we are forgotten here, that neither the government nor the nation does anything for us. I realized that we weren’t forgotten, even if it wasn’t something much and I participated with enthusiasm. (16.bel)

- It is a nice thing that the people in Turkey haven’t forgotten us. They know that we are here and they think of us. This program is carried out so that the people here can benefit. That’s why it’s worth all the energy because you think about us, our children and young generations. Your efforts are very valuable. (2.bel)

- They come here all the way from Turkey and take care of us. Those documents come from Turkey, especially for us. Fortunately, they don’t leave us. Feeling that you are alone here is very difficult. (15.sar)

- Knowing that you think and care about us as Turkish citizens is great. You are considered important as a human being, as a woman and a mother. Your children are cared for because they are Turkish citizens and in the end they will go to Turkey. Carrying out a program like this in a foreign country and caring for us are really wonderful. (9.sar)

Proud of her country

- Development of such a program in Turkey proves that we have become sensitive to many things and I feel happy. Education should start at earlier ages and I am happy to see this consciousness in people. (7.sw)

- I think that reaching the children who don’t attend a preschool through CEP is very beneficial. People spent a lot of effort to bring the Program to this country and they didn’t charge a fee. Switzerland is a country where no one gives you anything for free, but that CEP, those courses, were done for free. Our only duty was to attend the Program and it would have been shameful not to attend when other people put in so much effort for us. (6.sw)

- For example, the good thing was that we were able to see their opinions as well. For families like us who didn’t get any education in Turkey, for example, I didn’t attend any school
in Turkey and I liked it. I felt as if I was attending a school in Turkey, I experienced what it was like. That’s why I really liked it. When I was using the words and when I was learning new things, I felt like in school. (9.bel)

- I was proud. I wish people realized that Turkish people also cared for child education, that they gave importance to how a mother should behave toward her child. (1.bel)

- It could be useful as they made similar things at school. I brought them to the principal and she was very happy and realized that we were interested in our child; normally they aren’t much interested in Turkish children. I brought and showed her the CEP and told her about the lessons. She was happy and I was happy. (17.bel)

- I am happy, I like it. It is very nice that an education program, an institution like MOCEF, was brought here because the women in Arabia need it. It is nice to experience different things, to learn things and reflect them onto our children rather than just sitting between four walls. It is great experiencing that in Saudi Arabia. (7.sar)
DISCUSSION

The scope of intervention programs keeps expanding as a result of various theoretical evaluations (Weaver et al., 2004; Zigler et al., 1992). This expansion in scope highlights the responsibility of such programs in supporting both the family and the child. Discussions about the rationale and implementations of the intervention programs focus mainly on the relationship between the programs and the family. The current programs have gone beyond accelerating the child’s development and include the family as a partner (Bohon et al., 2005; Farran, 1990; Ramey & Ramey, 1998; St. Clair & Jackson, 2006; Wasik, Bryant, & Lyons, 1990). Therefore, the evaluation results of intervention programs contain data both about the family and the child. Parental attitudes towards child rearing and the nature of mother-father-child interaction have been considered significant indicators in addition to the data about the child (Colemon, 1990; Engle & Black 2008). All these changes in the scope of the intervention programs draw attention to the importance of the context, and therefore the immediate environment of the child.

The results of the present research revealed the effects of the program on children, on parents and on the relationship between the parents and the child, similar to other evaluation studies.

When the results are taken into consideration with regard to the main research goals, answers to the questions “Who participates in this Program?” and “For whom is this Program effective?” become important. The statements of the participant mothers indicated that they were open to change in order to raise their children better and to be more equipped in issues regarding child development and education. Some mothers, however, reported that they already had knowledge about the topics discussed in the Program, but that they were more open to implementation after they had attended the Program. The reactions mothers received upon their decision to participate in the Program were also influential in their decisions to attend, therefore the content of these reactions and mothers’ evaluations of them were included in the research. Mothers received both positive and negative reactions from their spouses and from the people around them.

The mothers’ ideas about the negative reactions they received contributed a great deal to the question “Who participates in this program?” They reported that they were not influenced by the negative reactions of others and did not think of dropping out. Some mothers mentioned that their decisions were above everything else, while some stated that they did not pay much attention to these reactions since they participated in the Program for their children. The positive reactions increased the mother’s wish to attend the Program.

All these results indicated that the participant mothers were willing, as well as deter-
mined to change so as to give their children a better upbringing and to be more equipped for parenting. The mothers found a way to convince their spouses in cases where their spouses were not in favor of their participation. Therefore, although the support of the spouse was important, the determining factor that affected attendance seems to have been the mother’s wish and intention.

When the mothers were asked about who had benefitted the most from the Program, the majority of the answers from all the countries were “themselves.” The mothers stated that they benefitted the most from the Program and since they applied all they had learned with their children, the children benefitted as well. Spouses were mentioned as having benefitted the least. Some mothers, on the other hand, reported that everyone in the family benefitted from the Program, no one being the least beneficiary. These indicate the fact that the Program can be effective on the whole family.

When the effects of the Program are taken into consideration, the statements of the mothers reveal that the expected changes took place. These were the direct effects that were in line with the aims of the Program. Mothers also mentioned some additional changes which were not explicitly among the aims of the Program. These were the indirect effects.

The direct effects comprised the changes in the child, in the mother and in the mother-child relationship. Regarding the changes in the children, the mothers stated that observable advances in cognitive development resulted from the CEP activities. The children were reported to be at ease when they started school and even for those who had not attended preschool, the gap had been closed. Therefore the activities were regarded by the mothers as a preparation for school.

The mothers, especially those in Switzerland and Belgium, talked about prejudice against their children at school and the CEP implementations were said to be helpful for school success by supporting children cognitively. The mothers also reported that the CEP activities helped support the children in the social and emotional domains as well as the physical.

The mothers reported that they continuously put into practice with their child what they had learned in the Program and prepared the environment in order to support the child’s development. This indicates that the mothers were able to use the information about child development received from the Program efficiently, and that they understood the importance of the stimulation provided by the family in the child’s development (Guralnick, 1997).

The mothers also reported a change in their behavior toward their children as a result of the Program. They reported a decrease in their use of negative discipline methods. They also mentioned being in more intense interaction with their child as well as being calmer and more patient. They spent more time with the child and were more
consistent in their child rearing practices. These changes in her behavior enabled the
mother to become closer to her child and to see the child as an individual and thus
value him/her. All these helped to improve the mother-child relationship and to make
it closer. These changes in the mother also paved the way to the changes in the
child’s socio-emotional development and in the relationships within the family.

It was seen that the mothers created a substantial change in their child’s development
by providing high quality interaction, improved health conditions and security, in
short, a developmentally supportive environment (Guralnick, 1997).

Especially during the CEP implementations, the mother supported the child “within
his/her zone of proximal development,” in Vygotsky’s terms. This also could be one
of the reasons that the mothers stated the child’s developmental level had changed
and risen to a higher level (Aksu-Koç, Örüng, & Cesur, 1999).

These changes illustrate and confirm the contribution of mother involvement to the
academic development of children (Bohon et al., 2005; Domina, 2005; Reutzal et al.,
2006; Senechal, 2006; St Clair & Jackson, 2006; Sy & Schulenberg, 2005; Yan & Lin,
2005;).

The mothers saw themselves as having a vital role in the changes that took place in
the children. They reported that the effects of the Program became evident in them-
selves first, and their children changed only after they changed.

Changes in the mothers were not limited to their behavior and attitude toward their
children, but were also observable in their perception of themselves and in their
behavior. An important area where the mother’s ideas and perspective changed was
her understanding of motherhood. The mothers became aware that motherhood
should be different than what they had been doing until that time. The mothers also
became aware that the family played an important part in education and that they
were more conscious. They also mentioned feeling more valuable as women and voiced
their wishes to work and continue their education. Regarding the changes in their
own behavior, the mothers reported being more social, more aware of own importance,
more courageous and self-confident and more open to change.

The above-discussed changes are good examples of the outcomes of the intervention
program on the mothers. Similar findings have been obtained by other researchers
(Asscher, et al., 2008; Benasich et al., 1992; Conners et al., 2006; Pehrson & Robinson,
1990). Such changes need more attention than they get since they indicate a change
in the immediate context of a child that has a crucial role in development.

The indirect effects were observed both on the mothers and the fathers. The mothers
stated that they could express themselves better and therefore communicate better
with their spouses, spared them more time and were more patient and at ease with
them. This change in the mothers’ behavior was reflected in their relationship with
their spouses. Another indirect effect was that the mothers implemented what they had learned in the program with the other children in the family and established closer relationships with them as well.

The mothers explained that they were calmer toward and more understanding of the people around them and that they could express themselves better. They emphasized that they shared what they had learned in the Program with the people around them and that they photocopied and gave out the handouts. They had been able to find solutions to the problems of people around them as well. It is clear that the mothers were able to assimilate and transfer what they had learned in the Program and implement them with different people in various situations.

The mothers reported changes in their spouses toward themselves, toward the target child and toward the other children in the household. The fathers were reported to have a closer relationship both with the target child and other children in the family. They were more involved with their wives, and developed closer relationships with them, and established better communication patterns. The mothers stated that their husbands were proud of them. These changes can be considered to be indirect effects as the Program does not aim at fathers directly.

The mothers’ role in the change the fathers experienced was clearly observed in the mothers’ statements. They brought about changes in their husband as they kept implementing what they had learned with them and as they kept telling about the things they had heard to them. The handouts distributed during the Program also contributed to this change.

The data clearly manifests that the mother was the key figure in the changes that took place both in the child and in the father. In the process of change, either the mother changes and then influences the child and the father, and/or the mother warrants the effects by effectuating the applications required in the Program. If the mother was the key figure in this process of change, how or why did the mother change?

The most important factor that provided the change in the mothers was the group process in which the mothers participated. The mothers felt a sense of belonging to the group that they attended regularly and thought of the participants as a team. There were many reasons for this sense of belonging. The mothers believed that they had a lot in common with the other mothers in the group. They also realized that they were not alone in experiencing certain problems and they collectively generated solutions. The act of sharing was quite important for the mothers. Yalom (2002) has reported that most people believe that they are the only ones with problems, but when they hear in a group that other people experience similar problems, they no longer feel lonely and start sharing more of their feelings. During the group process the mothers started to consider themselves worthy as they were treated equally and their ideas were listened to and deemed important. Group support and acceptance
are significant factors in securing change (Yalom, 2002). The mothers reported that the sense of belonging to a group and the feeling of being beneficial to the child made them feel that they were worthy. At the same time, through the group process they became part of a social milieu. They shared about their lives and made friends.

The mothers declared that they believed in the accuracy of the information given in the group and that was why they wanted to change. As Kağıtcibaşı (2008) has noted, when people accept what has been discussed in the group, they want to change.

It is evident that the way the Program was implemented in the group contributed to the change in the mothers. The mothers reported the importance of reaching decisions through group discussions and of not just relying on the teacher during the Program. Lewin (1958) and Bennett (1955) have indicated that an environment of debate in which all the members participated was effective in forming a group decision and this supported the change of attitude in the members.

The teacher in the group added to the effectiveness of the group process through her way of implementing the Program, her personality and by setting a good example. Therefore, she played an important role in the utilization of the information received by the mothers and in their change. As Kağıtcibaşı (2008) has noted, participants in a group display more acts of compliance to social influence coming from the people regarded as respectable and superior. As can be inferred from the mothers’ statements, the teacher played a vital role in diminishing or enhancing the impact of the group process, thus in the realization of the change in the mother.

The Cognitive Education Program seems to be influential on the mothers as well as the children. The mothers reported feeling a sense of responsibility while implementing the CEPs, feeling proud of being useful to the child by teaching him/her certain skills. The mothers also stated that they got to know their child better while working on the CEPs together and that the CEPs introduced them to new methods that would be effectively used with the child. The positive change in the child during this process and his/her regard of the mother as a “teacher” resulted in an increase in the mother’s confidence and created a feeling of “I can teach.” The similarities between the CEP topics and those topics that children attending a preschool learned reinforced the belief in the Program.

The mothers received new information in the Program and this was effective on the adoption and, therefore, on the implementation of the Program. As Yalom (2002) has noted, it is of great importance in a group to convey information and make explanations on the topics with which the mothers are not familiar. While using the new information, the mothers saw that the problems were solved and they realized those things that they had not done before with their children. This proved to them that the Program worked. They mentioned that it was easy to practice the Program and that it provided them with opportunities for implementation with their children and
with other people around them. It could therefore be assumed that the mothers would increase their practices as they experienced the positive effects. When the mothers experienced the efficiency of the Program while practicing, they reported having a clear conscience as they realized that they were doing the right thing. They also felt lucky and supported for having attended the Program.

Comparison of the practices with which the mothers had been raised with the methods of child rearing covered in the Program played an important role in the adoption of the Program by the mothers. The mothers wanted to change in cases where they were not happy with how they had been raised and they wanted to behave differently than their parents. The Program was perceived as an opportunity by these mothers and they were more prone to implementation. On the other hand, some mothers were content with how they had been brought up and stated that they could easily implement the Program as it was in line with their own way of upbringing.

The feedback received during the Program constituted an important place in the implementation process. The mothers received positive as well as negative feedback from their spouses, their children and from the people around them. The positive feedback was similar in content and was about the fact that the mother had changed, had become more conscious, behaved differently to her child and husband and that the child had changed in the positive sense. The feedback of the children confirmed the statements made by the spouses and the people around the mothers. The children gave feedback indicating that the mother had changed, had done something for them and that she was more knowledgeable. This positive feedback understandably encouraged and motivated the mother while implementing the Program. She was also proud of herself and most important of all, she felt she was on the right track.

The negative feedback received from the spouses and the people around the mother reflected disapproval of the mother’s attendance at the Program, thinking that it was unnecessary. Children were not content about the change in their mothers, as well. However, mothers stated that they were not affected by this negative feedback, similar to how they had felt about the negative reactions before the Program started. Their reasoning was exactly the same as their previous explanations. They said, “I would not change my decision as I know I am doing something good for my child.”

The instrumental and emotional support the mother received from her spouse and the people around her were as effective in the implementation as the feedback. The mothers received instrumental support from their spouses and the people around with transportation and child care. The spouses displayed their support by listening to and being interested in the mother’s descriptions about the Program and by sustaining the applications. The people around supported the mother’s participation in the Program and prepared the environment for her implementations. All this support made the mother’s attendance and implementations easier (Guralnick, 1997). However, there were mothers who reported that they did not receive any form of support.
The mothers’ ideas about the Program were considerably influential on their practices. Two factors, evaluation of the Program through various research studies and the provision of handouts, were important factors in making this Program a reliable one in the eyes of the mothers. In addition, the confidence in MOCEF as an institution brought about reliance on the Program. Furthermore, mothers had a firmer belief in the Program when they realized that information from various sources was similar to that presented in the Program. Especially in Belgium and Switzerland, the similarities between the CEP topics and what the children had been learning in preschool resulted in firmer conviction.

The mothers’ reports about their experiences during the implementation reveal important information regarding how change happened. They remarked that although implementation was difficult at first, it got easier later, but they needed time to change their behavior and attitudes. Especially, mothers had difficulties in establishing quality transactions with the child and in decreasing the use of negative discipline methods. However, the mothers reported that they were willing and patient.

The mothers were asked whether these changes continued after the termination of the Program and the majority of the mothers gave affirmative answers. They declared that these experienced changes had become like a habit and a life style. However, some mothers in countries other than Turkey mentioned that the effects of the Program were more intense during the Program.

The effects of the Program did not show much variation with regard to country. The differences seen among countries mainly originated from the environment where the Program was implemented and the housing and living conditions of the mothers. The group meetings in Switzerland were held in a place that was open to the public and this might have affected the group process negatively by violating the boundaries and by distracting the mothers’ attention. The majority of the mothers in Belgium and Bahrain said that they lived with extended families and therefore had difficulties in practicing the Program. The group meetings were a means of social support for the mothers in Belgium as they had a strenuous home life, and for those in Bahrain the meetings helped them alleviate stress.

The handouts distributed seem to be most important in Saudi Arabia. The mothers in this country stated that they still kept the handouts given and that they read them again from time to time. The mothers in other countries mentioned reading books about child development and education, but the limited access to these types of books in Saudi Arabia might have added to the importance of the handouts in this country.

When the effects of the Program specific to the emigrans were examined, the mothers said that their participation was made easier as the Program was in Turkish. They also stated that their children’s knowledge of Turkish improved. The mothers living in
Europe mentioned that the Program had taught them the parenting skills that were important for adaptation to that country. The group meetings were a means of socialization.

The fact that the Program was developed in Turkey was important for some mothers, while others said that it did not have any effect on their decision to participate. Those in the latter group stated that the content would not differ as to where the Program originated. The mothers were proud of the implementation of a program abroad, which originated from their home country, while some expressed their happiness at not being forgotten.
All the results discussed until now indicate that the Program affected both the mother and the child directly. The influence of the Program on the child was evident in the changes that took place in all the developmental areas of the child. The CEP activities and the mother played substantial roles in these changes. The mothers, on the other hand, were directly influenced by the group process and the topics of the MSP, which were discussed during the meetings. The mothers implemented both the information received in MSP and the CEP activities with the child while attending the Program. They started doing what they had not done until that time as well as changing their way of thinking. They experienced a process of change. They especially changed their behavior and ways of communication and then, they experienced the outcome. At the same time, they received positive feedback from the people around them. These all helped the mothers continue their applications. It was seen that the mothers changed the most toward their child, then toward their spouses, and they changed the least toward the people around them.

When the women changed their behavior and way of communication as a result of the information received in the Program, it was a thrust for the children and for the spouses to change as well. The children changed their behavior and way of communication upon experiencing the differences in the mothers. The spouses underwent a similar change. The spouses also became more knowledgeable about child development and communication as the women shared all the information they received. The results indicated that the mothers occupied a vital role, the role of a mediator, in order to ensure efficiency of the Mother-Child Education Program.

In sum, the effectiveness of the Program depended heavily on the mother. When the mother was decisive and when she wanted to change, she was able to overcome all the obstacles. The results indicated that MOCEP has met the needs of the groups reached and that there were not any considerable differences among different countries.


Alpöge, G. (1995). *Öykü dizisi (Şaşkin No:1; Şakacı Kaya No.2; Bütün çocuklar dondurma sever No.3; Ah şu su No.4; Uğraşlar No.5; Kozalı konak-kazalı konak No:6; Tembel Keloğlan No:7; Televizyoncu Ali No:8)*. İstanbul: AÇEV Publications.


This study is being conducted to learn the thoughts and feelings of the mothers who have participated in the Mother-Child Education Program in different countries. We are conducting interviews with the participant mothers, so today I would like to talk about the Mother-Child Education Program with you. I want you to share your thoughts, your experiences and the effects of the Program. There are no right or wrong answers to these questions. Your thoughts and impressions are what count. Sharing your thoughts and ideas with me is important. The information I receive will be used solely for research purposes. Your name will not be divulged or shared with other people.

I would like to get some information about you.

- Do you live with your spouse and children?
- How old are you?
- Where were you born?
- Where did you live before coming to this city/country?
- How many years did you live there?
- How long have you been living in this city/country?
- What is your educational background?
- Do you work?
- (If yes) What do you do for a living?
- (If she works) Did you start working before marriage?
- How old is your spouse?
- What is his educational background?
- Does your spouse work?
- (If yes) What does he do for a living?
- How many people live in your household, including you?
- Who are they?
- How many children do you have?
- Their ages?
- Sex of the child for whom you attended this Program?
- In what year did you participate in the Mother-Child Education Program (MOCEP)?
- How many of the meetings were you able to attend out of the 25?
- Did your child attend preschool?
- (If yes) How many years?

First of all, I would like to talk about the effects of the Program (MOCEP) on you.

1. Do you think that this Program (MOCEP) has affected your life? What has changed? Can you talk about it?
2. Now, I would like to talk about these differences in detail.
   • What sort of changes have you observed in yourself as a mother when you think about the period before the Program started and after the Program ended? What has changed?
   • What sort of changes have you observed in yourself as a spouse? What has changed?
   • What sort of changes have you observed in yourself as a woman? What has changed?
3. Are there any things that you thought/did that you could not think/do before, but that you now can?
   • (If yes) What are they? Can you talk about them?
   • Could the Program have brought about this change?
   • (If yes) What might have brought about this change in the Program?
4. Do you describe yourself differently now than you used to, as someone who has completed MOCEP? (If yes) How?
5. How do you feel about having attended such a Program when you consider all your experiences after participating in the Program?
6. You certainly had expectations/wishes in life before you started the Program (I wish I had a car, a house, I wish my child were …etc.). I bet you still have expectations and wishes. Have there been any differences in these expectations/wishes?
7. Now, I would like you to think about your relationship with your husband, how you understand each other, your behavior toward each other and the
harmony between you. Do you think that attendance in this Program affected your relationship? What has changed, positively or negatively. Can you talk about it? Are there any cases or behavior about which you can say, “It was like that before the Program, but it turned into this after the Program”?

8. When you think about your children’s (both the one in the Program and the others) relationship with their father and what they share, are there differences between the period before you started the Program and after it ended?
   • (If yes) What sort of changes took place? Can you talk about it?
   • (If she talked about a difference) Could this change have resulted from the Program? What do you think?

9. (Do not ask if she has only one child) Now, I want you to think about your relationship/communication and what you share with your other children. Has your participation in the Program affected your relationship with your other children? What do you think? Are there any cases or behavior about which you can say “My relationship with my children was like that before the Program and it turned into this after the Program”?

Now, I want to ask about your relationship/communication with the child who attended this Program with you.

10. How do you spend a typical day at home with your child? Could you tell me about what you do?
   • Before attending the Program, did you spend your day with your child like that? Have there been any differences after the Program?

11. Do you believe that your participation in the Program affected your relationship with your child? (If yes) How?

12. Have there been differences in your behavior towards your child since attending the Program?
   • (If yes) Can you talk about what has changed?
   • (If answered affirmatively) Why did you decide to change your behavior toward your child? What made you reach such a decision?
   • Do you think that the Program had an influence on this decision? Can you talk about how it was influential?

13. Have there been differences in your child’s behavior towards you?
   • (If yes) What sort of differences have emerged? How did your child behave toward you and how does s/he behave now?

14. Have all the changes you have mentioned (about yourself, your spouse and your children) continued since the Program ended?

15. You have talked about many differences in your life (in you, in your spouse and in your children) after having attended the Program. How do you feel
about having experienced these differences?

16. Do you think in the last year that you have done something to support your child’s development (cognitive, physical, social and emotional) apart from the CEP activities? (If yes) What have you done?

17. When you think about the effects of the Program, who do you think has benefitted the most from the Program in your family? Whose needs has the Program met the most?

18. Who has benefitted the least?

Let us go back to the time when you first heard about the Program and decided to participate. Let us talk about your experiences then.

19. How did you decide to participate in this Program? Could you tell me how you attended?

20. How did the people around you (people other than your family members) react to your participation in such a Program? What did they do or say, positively or negatively? Can you tell me about it? (Try to include everyone such as elders, neighbors, friends)

21. The people in your family are as important as those around you. How did your spouse react to your participation? What did he say? Positive or negative?

22. How did your children react? What did they say that was positive or negative?

23. You received positive and negative reactions. Let us start from the positive ones. Can you tell me how these positive reactions influenced you?
   • How did you feel upon receiving these positive reactions? (Such as being indecisive about participation, but being more determined later.)

24. (If she received negative reactions) What did you think about the negative reactions you received, how did they influence you? How did you feel?
   • (If she received negative reactions) Were there any changes in your ideas about the Program as a result of these negative reactions? Or were there any changes in your attitude about the Program?
   • (If she received negative reactions) Did you ever think about dropping out because of these negative reactions?

I would now like to talk about your thoughts about the Program.

25. If I attended the Program with you, what would I see you experience during the meetings?

26. You attend a literacy course to learn reading and writing or a sewing class to learn about sewing. What were your expectations when you decided to
participate in this Program? What did you expect to learn and experience?

27. How different was the Program from your expectations? How much of them did it meet?
   • (If she says her expectations were not met) You tell me that some of your wishes were not fulfilled, but despite that you continued to attend the Program. What was the reason for that?
   • (If she says her expectations were not met) What should have been added to this Program so that your expectations would have been met?

28. If you were able to change certain things in the Program to make it a better one, what would you change?

29. You talked and learned about many things in the Program such as how to talk to a child, discipline, nutrition, health, play, toilet training, women’s health. What was the topic/information from which you benefitted the most?

30. What was the topic/information from which you benefitted the least? What could have been omitted?

31. Have you implemented the information you received?
   • (If yes) With whom and how have you implemented it?
   • Which topics and information were easy to implement?
   • Have there been any topics or information that you could not implement? Why?

32. Have you applied this information to people other than your child?

33. What was the most effective aspect/part of the Program in your opinion?

34. What was the least effective aspect/part?

Now, I want you to think about the time while you were attending the Program.

35. Did you receive support (Looking after your child so that you could attend the Program, driving you to the meeting place or shopping for you when you were at the meeting, comments like, “You are learning very useful things”) from the people around you while implementing the Program?
   • Who supported you the most? How did they support you?

36. Did you share the information you received during the Program with your spouse? What were his reactions, positive or negative?

37. Did you receive any reactions or feedback, positive or negative, from your spouse when you tried to implement what you had learned at home? What did he say?

38. (If she has other children) When you think about your children who did not attend the Program (younger or elder), what did you experience with them while implementing or participating in the Program? How did they react to your doing CEPs every day with their sibling or you going to the meetings every week?
39. Was there a change in your family’s view point regarding the Program after it started? Are there cases where you can say, “They thought like this at first, but then they thought like that”? If yes, what might have caused the change?

You were with a group every week while implementing the Program. There were other mothers there. I believe a lot of things happened in the group. Now, I would like to talk about your experiences in the group.

40. MOCEP was carried out in a certain way: The group meeting, then implementing the CEPs with smaller groups, the daily work done at home with the child... Do you think these consecutive activities were appropriate? Why do you think so?

41. Did you feel comfortable in the group? Could you share your thoughts and feelings easily with the group?

42. What kind of a relationship did you have with other mothers during the Program? Did you feel accepted by and close to them?
   • Do you think that you were in a group with them?

43. You were in a group for 25 weeks. How do you feel about having belonged to that group?

44. Did attending a group implementing what you learned easier?

45. Do you believe that you benefitted from or were influenced by the other mothers in the group? (If yes) How?

46. Do you think that other mothers in the group benefitted from or were influenced by what you said and shared during the meetings? (If yes) How?

There was a teacher who led the group meetings. She was the most important person in the group every week. Now, I would like you to share your thoughts about her.

47. What was your relationship with her like? What did she mean to you?

48. What did you think about the teacher’s behavior or approach to you and the other mothers? Was there any thing that you did not like?

49. Do you think that the teacher knew about the topics she presented/discussed? (If she says “yes” or “no”) Why do you think so?

You did the CEP activities with your child at home every day. Let us talk about your experiences during that time.

50. You did the CEP forms with your child every week. Do you think that these affected your child’s development? For example: Increase in knowledge,
better communication, etc. (If yes) What sort of changes took place? What did s/he learn? What improved?

51. Do you think that studying with your child every day affected your relationship?

52. How did you feel about teaching and preparing your child for school through implementing the CEPs?

Now, I want to talk about the opinions of your spouse and your family about you and whether there were differences in their thoughts about you before and after the Program.

53. When you think about the time you started the Program and when the Program ended, do you think there were differences in your children’s opinion of you? (Are there any cases where you can say, “The children used to think that I was …., but now they believe that I am...?”)

54. How did your children react to the changes in you? Did they say anything? For example: “You used to do like this, but now you do like that.”

55. When you think about the time when you started the Program and when the Program ended, do you think that there were differences in your husband’s opinion about you? (Are there any cases where you can say, “My husband used to think I was….., but he later thought that I was…” (For example: “I was regarded to be more competent in housework, but now he considers me as someone who has opinions about other topics as well.”)

56. What was your husband’s reaction about the change you underwent? What did he tell you about it? For example, “You used to do this like that, but now you do this differently.”

57. Now, I want you to think about your relationships with people other than your family. Do you think that they had different opinions about you before and after the Program? (For example, “They used to think that I was …., but now they believe I am …” or their attitude was different before and after the Program.)

58. (If there was a difference) How did the people around you react to the changes you underwent? What did they tell you about it? For example, “You used to do it like that, now you do it differently.”

59. How did you feel when you heard about these reactions from your spouse, your children and from the people around you?
I now would like to get your opinion about the information you received in the Program.

60. Your family brought you up in a certain way. Was the information you received about child development and education in the Program the same as the way you were brought up?
   • What were the differences? What were the similarities?
   • (If there were similarities) Do you believe that these similarities influenced how you regarded the Program?
   • (If there were differences) Did it disturb you? How did you feel about raising your child differently from how you were brought up? (For example, Not beating the child, explaining the reasons for his/her behavior)
61. (If she says, “It was different, but I was not disturbed by that”) Why do you think you were not disturbed?
62. You were bringing up your child in your own way before you started the Program. Was the information you received about child development and education the same as your way of raising a child? (For example, giving the child the right to speak, accepting the child as an individual, the child’s behavior, and the language used.)
63. (If different) How did you cope with this difference in methods? Did you have difficulty implementing them?
64. (If she did not have any difficulties) Why do you think you did not have difficulties?
65. How did you feel when the content (how to talk to the child, how to feed the child) of the information your teacher presented was similar to your ideas?
66. How did you feel when she gave information that was contrary to your beliefs?
67. How did you feel when the teacher approved your ideas (how to behave and talk to the child or how you behaved and talked to the child) in the group?
   • On the contrary, how did you feel when she opposed your ideas?
68. Do you feel that the Program was worth the time and energy you spent? What makes you say that?

For the mothers living abroad

69. Do you think that what you learned in this Program has proved useful in your life abroad? (If yes) Can you give examples of how it has been useful?
70. Has your participation in the Program brought about changes in your life here? Are there any things in your life that you could not do, but which you now do?
71. Did the fact that the Program was developed in Turkey affect your participation? (If yes) Why?
72. What are your thoughts about implementing a Program that was developed in Turkey when you live in a foreign country?
73. How have you felt?